

The logo for the Scottish Journal of Performance (SJOP) is displayed on an orange rectangular background. The letters 'S', 'J', and 'P' are in a dark grey, bold, sans-serif font. The letter 'O' is in a lighter grey, also in a bold, sans-serif font, and is positioned between the 'J' and 'P'.

Scottish Journal of Performance

Volume 1, Issue 1
December 2013

ISSN: 2054-1953 (Print) / ISSN: 2054-1961 (Online)

www.scottishjournalofperformance.org

SJoP is supported by



About us

The *Scottish Journal of Performance* is an open access refereed journal which aims to promote and stimulate discussion, development and dissemination of original research, focusing both on performance in Scotland (contemporary and historical) and / or wider aspects of performance presented by scholars and reflective practitioners based at Scottish academic institutions.

Published bi-annually and run by doctoral students, the *Scottish Journal of Performance* welcomes submissions from both established and early career researchers and operates a peer review system ensuring presentation of quality research in performance.

Performance in this context encompasses a wide range of arts and entertainment and takes as central themes dance, drama, film, music and television. The *Scottish Journal of Performance* takes as a key focus the creation and execution of performance in various contexts, encouraging the adoption of a wide range of range of research methods and approaches.

Editorial Team

Co-editor: Bethany Whiteside
(b.whiteside@scottishjournalofperformance.org)

Co-editor: Ben Fletcher-Watson
(b.fletcher-watson@scottishjournalofperformance.org)

Journal Manager / Web Editor: Thomas Butler
(t.butler@scottishjournalofperformance.org)

Review Editors: Katya Ermolaev, Shona Mackay,
Louise Stephens Alexander, Ralph Strehle

Editorial Advisory Board

Professor Celia Duffy (Royal Conservatoire of Scotland)

Dr Stephen Broad (Royal Conservatoire of Scotland)

Dr Anna Birch (Royal Conservatoire of Scotland)

Wendy Timmons (University of Edinburgh)

Dr Sophia Lycouris (University of Edinburgh)

Copyright information



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

See <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/> for details.

Contents

5. Editorial
BETHANY WHITESIDE & BEN FLETCHER-WATSON
11. Representational tactics: approaching two Scottish performances of mental illness through the work of Michel de Certeau
CHRISTOPHER DINGWALL-JONES
31. World Wide Wandering: e-drifting in Paris and London
DAVID OVEREND
53. Re-reading Mary Wigman's *Hexentanz II* (1926): the influence of the non-Western 'Other' on movement practice in early modern 'German' dance
LITO TSITSOU & LUCY WEIR
75. Developing professional equality: an analysis of a social movement in the Scottish dance industry
HOLLY PATRICK & CAROLINE BOWDITCH
99. Symposium abstracts: *The making of performance: stories of performing physicalities*
ANDRIA CHRISTOFIDOU & LITO TSITSOU, ANNA BIRCH, SIMON MURRAY, BETHANY WHITESIDE, LITO TSITSOU & LUCY WEIR, RAMSAY BURT, ROMANY DEAR & DOMINIC PATERSON
109. Book review: *Our ancient national airs: Scottish song collecting from the Enlightenment to the Romantic era*, by Karen McAulay
ELAINE MOOHAN
113. Book review: *Hamish MacCunn (1868-1916): a musical life*, by Jennifer L. Oates
JOSHUA DICKSON
117. Book review: *Theatre and performance in small nations*, edited by Steve Blandford
ANNA BIRCH
123. Book review: *Practice as research in the arts: principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances*, by Robin Nelson
MARC SILBERSCHATZ

Call for papers

The *Scottish Journal of Performance* is a peer-reviewed open access journal which promotes and stimulates discussion, development and dissemination of original research, focusing both on performance in Scotland (contemporary and historical) and / or wider aspects of performance presented by scholars and reflective practitioners based in Scotland. We invite contributions from a wide and diverse community of researchers, providing opportunities for both established and early career scholars to submit work. We encourage a wide range of research methods and approaches, including practice-led research and practice as research. The first issue was published in December 2013.

We welcome submissions for our second issue. Possible submission formats include audio and video recordings with commentary, practitioner reports, reflective journals and scholarly articles.

Performance in this context encompasses a wide range of arts and entertainment and takes as central themes dance, drama, film, music and television. The research field of the *Scottish Journal of Performance* takes as a key focus the creation and execution of performance in various contexts. Examples include the role and value of performance, performance education, teaching and learning in performance, theory and practice, performance psychology, community performance, performance in society (class, economics, ethnicity, gender, religion), youth performance, performance aesthetics, research methods and methodologies. This list is not intended to be exhaustive.

Deadline for submission

5pm, 24th January 2014

Publication date

June 2014

Information for authors

See website for information and style guide PDFs.

Submission method

By email to: submissions@scottishjournalofperformance.org

For more information on the suitability of submissions, please contact the Editors: editors@scottishjournalofperformance.org

Editorial

BETHANY WHITESIDE & BEN FLETCHER-WATSON

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.01

Publication date: 13 December 2013

The genesis of the *Scottish Journal of Performance* sprang from a wish amongst doctoral students based at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland and the University of St Andrews to create an academic platform for Scotland's and Scottish performance research—a space dedicated to exploring, disseminating and showcasing issues and debate. In creating a new journal, scholars may respond to the appearance of new perspectives, or seek to carve out space for critical reflection within existing fields. The *Scottish Journal of Performance* has been founded with both aims at its core—we provide a platform for researchers to respond to the prodigious changes across Scottish arts and culture prior to and since devolution 15 years ago, while also rooting ourselves firmly within the traditions of some of the oldest academic institutions in the United Kingdom (a country, at the time of writing, which comprises several nations).

Our criteria for submission are deliberately diverse: authors may be Scotland-based and focusing on Scotland or Scotland-based and looking beyond our borders, or they may be reflecting from elsewhere on aspects of Scottish culture. We welcome scholars who can expand our definitions of what Scotland means, moving beyond parochialism to a more nuanced understanding. Outsiders looking in are as important as insiders looking out, and scrutiny of Scottish issues by those who live and work within them is complemented by wider perspectives. As editors we operate from the principle that Scotland is a performative cultural powerhouse, and this should be explored and

reflected upon on an academic platform. The traditional legacy of Scotland's culture is heavily rooted in its literary and musical traditions; however, during the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, Scotland has emerged as a leader in performance-based pioneering artistry and creativity, driven by numerous festivals, a diverse network of theatres and concert halls, a powerful grassroots movement and a range of higher and tertiary arts education establishments.

This first issue has emerged from an open call for papers, rather than an invitation to explore a common theme. Contributors from around the UK have submitted papers from a wide range of disciplinary backgrounds, using diverse perspectives and methodologies, and exploring a truly heterogeneous body of work. Yet an original and striking sense of 'Scottishness' resonates strongly throughout the finished journal, from a contemporary exploration of the *digital dérive* linking Glasgow to Paris and London via the World Wide Web to an examination of professional equality in the Scottish dance sector.

In *Representational tactics: approaching two Scottish performances of mental illness through the work of Michel de Certeau*, Christopher Dingwall-Jones addresses contemporary psychiatric discourse in Scotland through the prism of performance, both live and recorded. Productions by the National Theatre of Scotland (NTS) and Theatre NEMO are contrasted to highlight the contingencies, schemes and appropriations which accompany any public discussion of mental health issues. Dingwall-Jones grounds his argument in Michel de Certeau's theories of 'strategies' and 'tactics'. The works of NTS and Theatre NEMO are thus framed within an arena where psychiatrists, patients, scholars, performers and audiences enact multiple complex inter-relationships. These networks are used to problematise the simplification of rhetorics around mental illness, presenting it as always partial, always contingent.

David Overend, in *World Wide Wandering: e-drifting in Paris and London*, explores the 'e-drift' as a form of Situationism for the twenty-first century. Nicolas Bourriaud and, again, de Certeau provide a subversive jumping-off point for a new form of urban wandering, where iPhones, Google Maps and Rightmove are used to trouble the politics of contemporary urban living. Overend's playful and provocative paper questions old perceptions of the local versus the global, and finds a transgressive power in the harnessing of technology.

In *Re-reading Mary Wigman's Hexentanz II (1926): the influence of the non-Western 'Other' on movement practice in early modern German dance*, Lito Tsitsou and Lucy Weir argue that Wigman's dance work is a seminal example of the social and aesthetic conditions of the early twentieth century. Utilising Edward Said's notion of the Orientalist 'Other', the authors interrogate the link between the primitive and terrifying nature of Wigman's choreography and the construction of a new style and technique of early modern dance that ultimately became known as 'German'.

Holly Patrick and Caroline Bowditch have produced an exciting addition to recent discussion of equality within the arts in Scotland, in *Developing professional equality: an analysis of a social movement in the Scottish dance industry*. Via an autoethnographic approach, the authors argue that Scotland may be considered a 'hotspot' for disabled dancers due to the existence of advocacy both within and outwith the dance scene and the lack of a national disability arts organisation. In particular, this latter factor is highlighted as a key element in 'mainstreaming' the issue of disability in the arts, and raises valuable questions as to the future of professional and vocational disabled dancers in Scotland and further afield.

We are also pleased to include the complete abstracts from

the recent symposium, *The making of performance: stories of performing physicalities*, held at the University of Glasgow on 22nd June 2013: Anna Birch examines the role of the body as an archival artefact; Simon Murray reflects on the upsurge in physical theatres as cultural production; Bethany Whiteside takes a Bourdieusian perspective to interrogate 'Scottishness' in Highland Dancing practice; Lito Tsitsou and Lucy Weir provide an early version of their article that appears in this issue, a re-reading of Mary Wigman's 'Witch Dance' as simultaneously German and Orientalist; Ramsay Burt draws on Michel Foucault, Judith Butler and post-colonial studies to examine the effects of institutional power on Black British Dance; and Romany Dear and Dominic Paterson respond to a shared experience of a recent dance workshop by Yvonne Rainer. We hope to engage further with Scottish conferences in forthcoming issues.

Finally, the *Scottish Journal of Performance* provides an opportunity for scholars to respond to the latest publications on performance in all its forms. This issue contains reviews of recent texts from publishers including Ashgate, Palgrave Macmillan and Intellect: Elaine Moohan reviews *Our Ancient National Airs: Scottish Song Collecting from the Enlightenment to the Romantic Era* by Karen McAuley; Joshua Dickson reviews *Hamish MacCunn (1868–1916): A Musical Life* by Jennifer L. Oates; Anna Birch reviews *Theatre and Performance in Small Nations*, edited by Steve Blandford; and Marc Silberschatz reviews Robin Nelson's *Practice as Research in the Arts: Principles, Protocols, Pedagogies, Resistances*.

The papers within our inaugural edition offer a deep engagement with and challenge to current scholarship on performance. Emerging researchers rub shoulders with established academics to interrogate the accepted ideas of Scottish culture across many artforms, and perhaps begin to

provide valuable new perspectives.

We would like to thank the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, the University of St Andrews, the whole editorial team, peer reviewers, funders, advisory board and, most of all, our authors.

BETHANY WHITESIDE AND BEN FLETCHER-WATSON
Co-editors, *Scottish Journal of Performance*

Representational tactics: approaching two Scottish performances of mental illness through the work of Michel de Certeau

CHRISTOPHER DINGWALL-JONES

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.02

Publication date: 13 December 2013

This article uses the ideas of 'strategy' and 'tactics' drawn from Michel de Certeau's The Practice of Everyday Life in order to examine two specific Scottish performances and determine their conception of mental illness, their approach to performance, and how these performances relate to the structures surrounding them. The first, The Wonderful World of Dissocia, was written by Anthony Neilson, premiered at the Edinburgh International Festival in 2004, and was directly supported by the Scottish Executive's National Programme for Improving Mental Health and Well Being. The second, Does Anyone Know, is a short film resulting from work with prisoners with mental health problems in the High Dependency Unit at HMP Edinburgh by the charity Theatre NEMO, and includes performances by prisoners themselves. Taken together, these performances give some sense of the contingent position of performances of mental illness, the ways in which actors, writers, and service users act within the structures of theatres, prisons, and hospitals, to work around and within the 'strategies' which constitute psychiatric discourse.

Keywords: mental illness, Theatre NEMO, Anthony Neilson, Michel de Certeau, tactics

Introduction: concepts, productions

In the early twenty-first century, mental illness has attracted widespread news coverage in the United Kingdom, from its apparently increasing prevalence (O'Brien, 2012; Randerson, 2007), to the (in)effectiveness of medication (McRae, 2006). Over the same period, a number of performances in various modes have engaged with similar ideas. In Scotland specifically, this increasing interest and concern (including a number of articles in *The Scotsman* regarding mental health stigma and the 'Gulag like' conditions in Carstairs State Hospital (Anon., 2004)) has been combined with a thoroughgoing reappraisal of mental health policy in the wake of The Scotland Act 1998. This makes the Scottish context a key site for examining how approaches to mental illness in performance engage with issues of representation, politics, and power, as well as how institutional frameworks affect and shape these issues.

This article examines two Scottish performances to determine their conception of mental illness, their approach to performance, and the relation of these performances to the structures surrounding them. Michel de Certeau's idea of 'tactics', found in *The Practice of Everyday Life* (1988), provides a framework for thinking about the actions taken by individuals within institutional spaces. Such actions repurpose institutional materials and discourses, providing a way of 'making do' within the institution while retaining full awareness of its greater power. De Certeau's work remains influential, and indeed has become more so in the Anglophone world during the early years of the twenty-first century. His work has been the subject of a 2001 special issue of *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, and, along with that of Emmanuel Levinas, forms a key element in James Thompson's (2010) influential reconsideration of applied theatre work, *Performance Affects*.

In order to provide the broadest possible overview of

approaches while retaining a specificity of examples, I will examine two contrasting performances. The first, *The Wonderful World of Dissocia* (2007), was written by Anthony Neilson, premièred at the Edinburgh International Festival in 2004, and was directly supported by the Scottish Executive's National Programme for Improving Mental Health and Well Being. Featuring professional actors, and forming part of one of the most well-known theatre festivals in the world, *Dissocia* is situated at the heart of the theatrical establishment. The second, a workshop, performance, and short film facilitated by the charity Theatre NEMO (2008a) involving inmates of Edinburgh Prison with mental health problems, reflects the other end of the performance spectrum—localised, amateur, and focused as strongly on affecting individual participants as on broader discursive impact. Taken together, these examples give some sense of the contingent position of performances of mental illness, the ways in which actors, writers, and service users act within the structures of theatres, prisons, and hospitals to work around and within the 'strategies' which constitute psychiatric discourse.

Tactics: de Certeau and Foucault

Michel Foucault's analysis of the functioning of power within medical institutions begins with *Madness and Civilization* (2001). The general thrust of Foucault's (2006, p.345) approach can be summarised by the following statement from his lectures on psychiatric power: 'power relations constituted the *a priori* of psychiatric practice [...] what was essentially involved in these power relations was the absolute right of nonmadness over madness'. In essence, Foucault identifies privileged structures of power and knowledge, equivalent to those procedures which de Certeau refers to as 'strategies':

The calculus of force-relationships which becomes possible when a subject of will and power (a proprietor, an enterprise, a city, a scientific institution) can be isolated from an 'environment'. A strategy assumes a place that can be circumscribed as *proper* (*propre*) and thus serve as a basis for generating relationships with an exterior distinct from it (competitors, adversaries, 'clientèles', 'targets', or 'objects' of research (de Certeau, 1988, p.xix).

In the case of mental illness and psychiatric power, the institutions of government, clinic, asylum, and prison all act strategically, generating relationships with and between citizens, patients, and inmates which form a 'grid' of power. In *Discipline and Punish* (1977), as well as in *Psychiatric Power* (2006), Foucault (2006, p.4) traces how mechanisms based on constant visibility (panopticism being a case in point) break free from the institutions which generated them, and become broader principles of power which exist only 'because there is dispersion, relays, networks, reciprocal supports, differences of potential, discrepancies'¹.

For de Certeau, this approach is both productive and limited. While he accepts the existence of this 'grid' of power, de Certeau (1988, p.xiv) is concerned that Foucault's approach 'privileges the productive apparatus', and leaves open the question of 'how we should consider other, equally infinitesimal, procedures, which have not been "privileged" by history but are nevertheless active in innumerable ways in the openings of established technological networks' (de Certeau, 1988, p.49). In other words, given that such disciplinary technologies exist, 'it is all the more urgent to discover how an entire society resists being reduced to [them]' (de Certeau, 1988, p.xiv). In *The Practice of Everyday Life*, de Certeau (1988, p.xv) attempts this discovery through analyses of the quotidian actions of individuals which 'compose the network of an antidiscipline'.

Although this ‘antidiscipline’ could be conceptualised simply as the resistant actions whose existence enables Foucault’s later conception of a ‘strictly relational’ (Foucault, 1978, p.95) power to operate, de Certeau’s specific focus is on those individual, minuscule actions which, although they exist within disciplinary technologies, cannot be reduced to those technologies. De Certeau (1988, p.37) calls an autonomous action by an individual or small group a ‘tactic’: ‘a calculated action determined by the absence of a proper locus’. As an example, he cites ‘*la perruque*’, a ‘wig’, or (in Fredric Jameson’s translation) a ‘rip-off’, (de Certeau, Jameson and Lovitt, 1980, p.3) which is ‘the worker’s own work disguised as that of his employer’ (de Certeau, 1988, p.25)—making personal phone calls during company time, or using offcuts to make furniture for their family. It can also include the creation of purely non-functional objects, made solely for amusement. Michael Sheringham (2006, p.213) characterises this kind of activity as ‘productive consumption’: ‘If consumers are subject to manipulation [...] they also manipulate the material they receive’.

While de Certeau (1988, p.xx) identifies the practices of ‘reading, talking, dwelling, cooking’ as exemplary tactical actions, *performing*, in its ephemerality and contingent relationship to texts and space, tends to be as tactical as these exemplars. Indeed, within the strategies of others, many tactical actions which are not ‘performance’ (in the sense of a planned artistic event) still involve a dual movement; of overt performance of and within the strategic order (consumption), and of the ‘clever tricks’ (de Certeau, 1988, p.xix) which seize the opportune moment to produce something new and transient within that space. The performer tactically appropriates the material of the texts they perform, as the text’s author appropriated their source material, and as each audience member will appropriate the ‘text’ of the living performance. A different world (the performer’s) slips into the author’s place, but only as long as the performance takes place, after which the text returns,

anonymous, like a rented apartment before the next tenants move in (de Certeau, 1988, p.xxi).

If a tactical action must 'turn to [its] own ends forces alien to [it]' (de Certeau, 1988, p.xix), we must first get some sense of what these alien forces, this 'text' of mental illness, might be. For the purposes of this paper, the Scottish Executive's mental health policy, elaborated in a number of documents beginning with the *National Programme for Improving Mental Health and Well-Being: Action Plan* (Scottish Executive, 2003), provides a privileged location for such an examination, since, as Lydia Lewis (2005, p.86) argues, policy documents occupy an unstable position, since they 'both reflect and construct the practices with which they are concerned'. Since they exist as reference texts for 'official' discourse about mental illness in Scotland, these documents elaborate a strategy to be appropriated by tactical actions, turned to the purposes of any individual or group who may be, however briefly, inhabiting, or moving within, the conceptual spaces of mental illness.

Partly as a result of the institutional structures of the Scottish Executive itself, the National Programme situates a conceptual break within the discourse of mental health. A 2005 report, emerging from questions raised at the 'Equal Minds' conference which took place soon after the 2003 launch of the National Programme, appeals to the concept of 'mental well-being', partly in order to avoid a strictly bio-medical focus on 'illness'²: 'There is a general agreement that mental health is more than an absence of mental illness [...] The definition of mental health as a "positive sense of well-being" challenges the idea that mental health is the opposite of mental illness' (Myers, McCollam, and Woodhouse 2006, p.18). In this definition, 'mental illness' remains in the realm of bio-medical science, a hard stop where the continuum of 'well-being' ends and one becomes, in Susan Sontag's (1991, p.3) phrase, a 'citizen of that other

place’—the ‘kingdom of the sick’. Health is no longer defined simply as ‘a lack of illness’, but illness is defined, all the more rigorously, as a ‘lack of health’.

Repurposings: tactical appropriations in *Dissocia*

The conceptual break between health and illness is echoed in the ‘particularly unusual structure’ of *Dissocia* (Anon., 2007); the interval reflects the moment of diagnosis. This structure functions by fracturing the expected narrative; prior to the interval, the play is a conventional fantasy quest in which the protagonist, Lisa, is transported from a contemporary, realist, milieu into a fantastical realm. Overt references to well-known plays and novels increase the audience’s sense of familiarity; the song ‘Welcome to Dissocia’ owes a structural and lyrical debt to ‘The Merry Old Land of Oz’, and the ‘scapegoat’, in literalising and embodying a conventional concept, is a direct descendant of Lewis Carroll’s March Hare. Act II, however, reveals Lisa to be a psychiatric patient, her medication-induced drowsiness standing in stark contrast to her position as ‘Queen Sarah’ at the close of Act I.

Diagnosis is a key feature of the strategies which surround mental illness, marking the point at which both medical and (in certain cases) judicial power can be exercised over the individual within the law. However, in Neilson’s tactical appropriation of this key structural element of mental health discourse, its function is reversed. Although, in its most banal sense, the diagnosis still marks the point at which medical power is exercised, within *Dissocia* this moment, coming at the start of Act II, also reflects the point at which the colourful excitement of Lisa’s psychosis is replaced by the banality of ‘everyday life’. Neilson has stated that the play specifically addresses the question of ‘why people who are mentally ill find it difficult to take their

medication' (quoted in Cavendish, 2004), and as a result the moment of diagnosis is tactically reimagined, not as the beginning of a process of recovery but as the end of an enjoyable experience. However momentarily, Neilson wants his audience to experience the sense of loss he sees as a possible result of psychiatric medication.

This tactical use of psychiatric discourse is also present in Christine Entwistle's performance of Lisa's madness. In much the same way as the language used on stage is citational, bearing inevitable intertextual relationships to previous plays and works of literature, the physical gestures used by actors also conjure images of their previous uses. Entwistle's involvement with the project forms part of a long association with Neilson which began with a 1994 Edinburgh Festival Fringe one-woman show written by Entwistle entitled *The Woman in the Attic*. In an interview with *The Herald* newspaper Entwistle makes a direct connection between *Dissocia* and the earlier collaboration, saying that as a result of their work on *The Woman*, Neilson 'knows I can do mad, so that probably helps' (quoted in Cooper, 2007). This expectation of recognisable stage madness, the ability to 'do mad', draws attention to the traditions within which theatrical representations of madness exist, traditions which involve a sense of the body as uncontrollable. One seminal example of this, discussed by Judith Wechsler, is Harriet Smithson's performance of Ophelia in Paris in 1871: 'Miss Smithson has a wealth of mannerisms, a disjunction of movement, an irregularity, one might even say a disconnectedness of gesture and words. One believes that she'll finish with convulsions' (quoted in Wechsler, 2002, p.202).

Such conventional representations rest on the assumption that disordered minds are externally reflected in disordered bodies. This tendency is emphasised by Petra Kupperts (2003, p.130):

A general problem with working towards an aesthetic that tries to find spaces for the unknowable is that the 'other' too quickly becomes fixed into otherness [...] it is too easy to allow the spectators to see the performers as 'mad' and to see the traces of that 'madness' evidenced on their bodies.

However, it is this very recognisability which is tactically appropriated in Entwistle's performance. The published playtext, being a transcript of the original production (Neilson, 2007), provides a sense of the blocking as performed, and hence of the connection between Entwistle's performance and previous 'disordered' performances. In scene iv of Act II, we find her 'dancing manically around the room, on the bed, everywhere' (Neilson, 2007, p.78). Although this restates an image of madness in 'traces' on Lisa's body, the contrast between this dance, ending as it does with her '*crumpl[ing] to the floor, in tears*' (Neilson, 2007, p.79), and the dangerous excitement of *Dissocia* itself, provides the audience with a 'reason' for her dancing in her desire to recapture this state of excitement. The result is a momentary disruption of the sense of 'otherness' Koppers (2003) sees as a risk in such representations.

Such appropriations are, of course, transient. The institutional theatre spaces within which *Dissocia* was performed place the production itself in a complex relationship with the strategic discourses it appropriates. Theatres themselves can be seen, along with prisons and hospitals among other spaces, as what Foucault (Foucault and Miskowiec, 1986, p.24) calls 'heterotopias': 'a kind of effectively enacted utopia in which [...] all the other real sites that can be found within the culture, are simultaneously represented, contested, and inverted'. Particularly contested is the ownership of particular performances, and the meanings they are given. For de Certeau (1988, p.xix), a key feature of the tactic is its precise temporal nature: 'what [it]

wins, it does not keep'. This is particularly the case for performances within theatres—after the lights have gone down on a particular performance, the ephemera which remain become material for the tactics of others, or even for recuperation within the economic strategies of the theatre itself. Nevertheless, these minuscule, tactical, uses of foreign materials occurred, allowing actors and audiences alike to, briefly, find a way of dwelling within Lisa's (Neilson's) story, of constructing moments of resistance from the very body of psychiatric discourse.

Infiltrations: Theatre NEMO's tactics

When performance moves from the respectably theatrical institutional space of national theatres and international festivals into the more contingent world of the prison, its ability to inhabit space is decreased. It must be *more* tactical, *more* cunning. James Thompson (2001, p.2), co-founder of the Theatre in Prisons and Probation Centre, reports his own, idealistic, response to the first suggestion that he facilitate performance within prisons: 'once we enter that space we collude with the oppressive practices within it'. This fear is understandable, insofar as the prison sets itself up as an unassailable space of strategy and discipline. De Certeau's ideas provide some tools to explore how tactical actions characterise ways of being even in such apparently totalising spaces.

For Thompson (2001, p.3), the 'performance' in a prison setting begins from the moment facilitators meet prison staff to explain what they will do: 'It was all practice. Of course it adapted, shifted and was sensitive to different audiences but in the early years of my experience in this work we constantly performed'. Even gaining access to the prison space requires the tactical appropriation of the language of the institution, performing the role of being 'on

the side of' the prison staff, even though the work itself will be with and for prisoners.

Theatre NEMO's own ability to tactically perform this language can be seen in their statement of 'Aims' relating to a project in Barlinnie Prison in 2009:

While working with prisoners our aim is to have positive impact on the rehabilitation of prisoners in order to create happier and safer communities [...] we try to develop all the soft skill [*sic*] like communication, negotiation, confidence in learning and positive recreational activity (McCue, 2009, p.1).

The references to rehabilitation, community safety, and 'positive' activity here are precisely the language of the prison system, with its combination of punishment and reform. The reader of this extract would never realize Theatre NEMO was set up by Isabelle McCue after her son, John, committed suicide in Barlinnie after being convicted for an assault committed while experiencing mental illness, during which he mistook a father attempting to sit his struggling son in a car for an attempted abduction. McCue and Theatre NEMO do not hide the inspiration behind their work, but they recognize that, in order to improve the treatment of prisoners with mental illnesses, they must act tactically, move in spaces which are not theirs, appropriate the language of those who didn't 'seem very interested' (Carrell, 2006) in investigating the circumstances of John's death.

It should be clear from this that the tactical actions of Theatre NEMO are the precondition for any of the performances which result from their work in prisons. However, individual service users also shaped these representations, not only through their specific

contributions, but also through their own tactical actions. The facilitators noted that:

[N]umbers started to drop and we found out that there was a lot of bullying going on in the halls regarding the workshops [...] it was said that because we were working with people from the high dependency unit there was a stigma attached to the work we were doing (Theatre NEMO, 2008b, p.2).

In the face of bullying, the decision to attend, or not to attend, workshops is a particularly strong example of the kind of tactical choice related to the art of surviving in prison—is the opportunity afforded by the workshops worth the additional bullying that participation in these workshops leads to? If, as Thompson (2001) argues, theatre work in prisons demands constant performance from the facilitators, the tactical decisions to be involved, or not to be involved, also require performances on the part of inmates and service users.

With this in mind, we can approach the specific representational tactics which are in evidence in *Does Anyone Know*. The possible risks involved in service users putting themselves on stage, that the “other” too quickly becomes fixed into otherness’ (Kuppers, 2003, p.130), are minimised by the inclusion of a member of prison staff (who remains unidentified) in the group of performers. This destabilises the sense of ‘knowability’ which might result from a cast made-up entirely of service users—the audience, at least for the short film, cannot know who is ‘really’ mentally ill, and who is ‘just acting’. From this position, which is both displayed and disguised, the performers in *Does Anyone Know* engage directly with psychiatric power from the outset, communicating vividly the experience of existing in a subservient relationship to it. The design, reminiscent of an interrogation room with its single

overhead light bulb, reminds the viewer that the speakers are not just mental health service users, but also prisoners of the criminal justice system. While the subject is clearly visible, any figures outside the small, lit area are rendered invisible, producing a kind of inverse panopticon, where the actor is the focus of the gaze of any number of possible observers.

This is the position of the subject of psychiatric power—alone, and under constant, unsolicited observation. This is emphasised by the submissive positions of the actors, shoulders slouched, hands lowered. Even their voices are subdued as they address the audience from their compromised position. The submissiveness of the actors' postures can be seen as an expression of the 'inability to take space' noted by Kupperts (2003, p.125) in her own work with service users, a phenomenon which can be connected to de Certeau's (1988) observation that those who must act tactically are placed in that position because they lack a proper place from which to act. These postures draw attention to the 'lack of physical and mental privacy' (Kupperts, 2003, p.125) which characterises life in institutions such as prisons and hospitals in which the individual's right to personal autonomy is removed and replaced by the demands of the institution—the extent to which service users find 'no space for themselves, their bodies, their movements in their social and physical environments' (Kupperts, 2003, p.125) is the extent to which institutional power has acted on them.

However, in the depressed affect of the performers, this absence of a proper space is performed, making a tactical use of the contingent position of the participants within the panoptic structure. The ability to reshape their institutional context, to make a position of weakness into a position of (artistic) strength, is partly due to the creation of a temporary space within the prison: the chapel (a 'found', or

‘poached’, space). The very act of appropriating space draws attention to the ‘productive consumption’ involved in the production—the discourses of the prison which are tactically deployed in order for the film to be made in the first place are also those which are subjected to scrutiny in the film itself. Also important to the film’s effect is the temporary breaking down of the boundary between prisoner, service user, facilitator, and prison staff. This boundary breaking is itself possible due to the tactical efforts of Theatre NEMO to create within the prison a temporary space in which the rules of the institution are suspended, for a short period, with the blessing of the very institution whose materials are appropriated. Theatre NEMO thus ‘conform to [institutional structures] only in order to evade them’ (de Certeau, 1988, p.xiv), speaking the language of the prison in such a way as to facilitate a representation of confinement by service users themselves, which provides a critique of their own situation.

Conclusion: poaching

Despite these moments of tactical action which, in Kupperts’ (2003, p.6) words, ‘insert the sliver of difference into the safe spaces of “normality”’, it must also be recognised that the very ubiquity of tactical action ensures that appropriations and reappropriations will continue to follow on each others’ heels. If to read is to ‘poach’ (de Certeau, 1988), to be both manipulated and to manipulate, then the *perruques* which result from one tactical action can be ripped off in turn by other readers.

At Theatre NEMO’s tenth anniversary celebrations in 2010, Cabinet Secretary for Justice Kenny MacAskill MSP made a speech including the following statements:

[W]e need to challenge them to take responsibility, nobody makes you drink it, nobody forces you to inject it, at the end of the day the person who's got to stand up and take responsibility is that individual [...] we can motivate, mobilise those who currently are languishing in their home, depressed or whatever else, and we can make this a better country (MacAskill, 2010)

MacAskill's focus on personal responsibility, coupled with a rhetoric which posits mental illhealth as personal weakness, is at odds both with the multi-faceted analysis of criminality and mental illhealth presented in *Does Anyone Know* and the anti-stigma constructions employed by the Scottish Executive as a whole. This approach fits with a tendency towards 'responsibilisation' identified by social work researcher Sarah Banks (2011, p.15): 'the focus on the individual service-user or family can [...] make it easier to locate blame and responsibility for the causes of problems with individuals, rather than with structural inequalities'.

MacAskill's speech is an example of the tactical assembly of reactionary political argument from the liberal strategies set out in the National Programme and Theatre NEMO's own tactical appropriation of the discourses of the prison. The potential for such appropriations is increased by those products of performance which have a life beyond the moment of the tactic—the film, the playscript, the photographs, the policy documents and the newspaper articles. As space wins out over time, what is won by tactical action is given up, to be used tactically by others, or kept by the strategic systems within which it was appropriated as a *perruque*.

Nonetheless, if de Certeau's approach to activity within power structures can tell us anything, it is that the existence of such structures, the knowledge that any tactical action takes place only insofar as space, time, and materials can be

'ripped off' from the structures to which they belong, is not a reason for despair. The moments of disruption within *Dissocia*, and the briefly-colonised space within Edinburgh Prison, are testament to the ability of performers, whether professional actors or amateur performer-inmates, to create hybrid representations, combining in one body the weight of psychiatric power which circumscribes some of the activity of people diagnosed with mental illness, and the potential for tactical action within or against that role. In early twenty-first century Scotland, representations of mental illness have the potential to be at once iterations of the system of psychiatric power, proof of that system's limitations, and texts from which future performers, patients, writers and inmates can 'poach', and within which they can find 'spaces for games and tricks', (de Certeau, 1988, p.174) spaces in which, tactically, to briefly construct their own representations, their own ways of 'making do'.

Notes

1. This account focuses on Foucault's earlier work, since this sense of an all-pervasive system in which 'the humanistic ideas of the Enlightenment were transformed into a set of procedures dominated by the idea of keeping human bodies under control through a "biopouvoir" exerted by panoptic surveillance' (Sheringham, 2006, p.217) is what de Certeau was explicitly responding to. In *The History of Sexuality*, Foucault develops a more nuanced account of power which sees it as 'strictly relational' (1978, p.95), so that resistance becomes an intrinsic part of power *per se*. Although this is closer to de Certeau's account of quotidian actions as productive consumption, Foucault still privileges highly contested sites such as sexuality, whereas de Certeau searches for the tactical actions which emerge within the most banal of situations, including walking and reading.

2. After all, individual policy-makers and politicians also act tactically, and the model of mental well-being allows the Scottish Executive to claim that social policy can 'prevent' mental illness—something a stricter application of the bio-medical paradigm, in which medical practitioners have unique expertise in treating a biologically grounded 'brain disease', would preclude.

References

Anon., 2004. Carstairs 'like a gulag'. *The Scotsman*, [online] 12 June. Available at: <<http://www.scotsman.com/news/scotland/top-stories/carstairs-like-a-gulag-1-1394993>> [Accessed 16 October 2013].

Anon., 2007. *The Wonderful World of Dissocia: documentary*. [online video]. Available at: <<http://www.nationaltheatrescotland.com/content/default.asp?page=s256>> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Banks, S., 2011. Ethics in an age of austerity: social work and the evolving new public management. *Journal of Social Intervention: Theory and Practice*, 20(2), pp.5–23.

Carrell, S., 2006. Creativity is being crushed in people. *The Guardian*, [online] 14 December. Available at: <<http://www.guardian.co.uk/stage/2006/dec/14/theatre.christmasappeal2006>> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Cavendish, D., 2004. Edinburgh reports: 'I want to disturb people'. *The Telegraph*, [online] 16 August. Available at: <<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/culture/theatre/drama/3622348/Edinburgh-reports-I-want-todisturbpeople.html>> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

de Certeau, M., 1988. *The practice of everyday life*. Translated by S. Rendall. Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press..

de Certeau, M., Jameson, F. and Lovitt, C., 1980. On the oppositional practices of everyday life. *Social Text*, 3, pp.3–43.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/466341>.

Cooper, N., 2007. 'I can do mad. So that helps'. *The Herald*, [online] 27 February. Available at: <<http://www.heraldscotland.com/i-can-do-mad-so-that-helps-1.839582>> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Foucault, M., 1977. *Discipline and punish*. Translated from French by A. Sheridan. New York: Vintage.

Foucault, M., 1978. *The history of sexuality: vol. 1: an introduction*. Translated from French by R. Hurley. New York: Pantheon Books. pp.1–88.

Foucault, M., 2001. *Madness and civilization: a history of insanity in the age of reason*. Translated from French by R. Howard. London and New York: Routledge.

Foucault, M., 2006. *Psychiatric power: lectures at the College de France 1973–1974*. Translated from French by G. Burchell. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Foucault, M. and Miskowiec, J., 1986. Of other spaces. *Diacritics*, 16(1), pp.22–27. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/464648>.

Kuppers, P., 2003. *Disability and contemporary performance: bodies on edge*. New York and London: Routledge.

Lewis, L., 2005. User involvement within Scottish mental health policy: locating power and inequality. *Scottish Affairs*, 51, pp.79–107.

McCue, H., 2009. *Natural industry: HMP Barlinnie 2009*. Glasgow: Theatre NEMO.

McRae, F., 2006. Anti-depressants taken by thousands of Brits 'do NOT work', major new study reveals. *The Daily Mail*, [online] 26 February. Available at: <<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/health/article-518669/Anti-depressants-taken-thousands-Brits-NOT-work-major-new-study-reveals.html>> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Myers, F., McCollam, A. and Woodhouse, A., 2006. *Equal minds: addressing mental health inequalities in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.

Neilson, A., 2007. *The Wonderful World of Dissocia, and, Realism*. London: Methuen Drama.

O'Brien, N., 2012. The remarkable rise of mental illness in Britain. *Telegraph.co.uk blogs*, [blog] 30 October. Available at: <http://blogs.telegraph.co.uk/news/neilobrien1/100186974/the-remarkable-rise-of-mentalillnessin-britain/> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Randerson, J., 2007. Study shows increase in mental disorders among children. *The Guardian*, [online] 6 February. Available at: <http://www.guardian.co.uk/society/2007/feb/06/health.childrenservices> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Scottish Executive, 2003. *National programme for improving mental health and well-being: action plan*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive.

Sheringham, M., 2006. *Everyday life: theories and practices from surrealism to the present*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Sontag, S., 1991. *Illness as metaphor and AIDS and its metaphors*. London: Penguin.

Theatre NEMO, 2008a. *Does Anyone Know* [film]. Extracts available online at: <http://www.theatrenemo.org/Our-Work/Past-Events/2008--HMP-Edinburgh--Short-Film/> [Accessed 27 June 2013]. Full film available from Theatre NEMO.

Theatre NEMO, 2008b. *Project evaluation: does anybody know*. Glasgow: Theatre NEMO.

Theatre NEMO, 2010. *Kenny MacAskill on Theatre NEMO*. [online video]. Available at: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=69C3ILbRFA0> [Accessed 27 June 2013].

Thompson, J., 2001. Making a break for it: discourse and theatre in prisons. *Applied Theatre Research*, (2), pp.1–4.

Thompson, J., 2010. *Performance affects: applied theatre and the end of effect*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Wechsler, J., 2002. Performing Ophelia: the iconography of madness. *Theatre Survey*, 43(2), pp.201–221.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/s004055740200011x>.

About the author

CHRISTOPHER DINGWALL-JONES is currently in his final year of PhD study at the University of Kent, having previously studied English at the University of Oxford and European Theatre at the University of Edinburgh. His research focuses on the representation of psychic distress in recent British theatre, with special interest in questions of embodiment and space, as well as the ways in which representing psychic distress on stage can disrupt all three concepts: representation, madness, and theatre. He has given conference papers exploring Marat/Sade, feminism and mental illness, and the ways acting challenges a dualistic approach to psychic distress.

World Wide Wandering: e-drifting in Paris and London

DAVID OVEREND

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.03

Publication date: 13 December 2013

This article documents and reflects on a series of ‘e-drifts’ conducted in 2012 through the physical and virtual spaces of Paris and London. E-drifting is proposed as a new form of cultural pathfinding for a contemporary city that is increasingly global, networked and integrated with virtual spaces. The primary methodology—wandering—is understood as a resistant practice that can inform and shape the ways in which we use and inhabit both urban and cyber spaces. Increasingly, our relationship with our physical environment is also determined by our access to, and experience of, virtual and global realms. This article argues that the ‘political inquiry’ that wandering can bring about has to evolve in order to enter and challenge this new expanded space. These ideas are explored through a narrated account of a summer’s e-drifting. This is a practice-based inquiry into the ways in which, in these fluid, dynamic environments, wandering might be reimagined and refocussed in order to retain its potentially resistant qualities.

Keywords: e-drifting, wandering, city, urban, performance, virtual, Internet

Introduction

From mobile phones to wireless devices and GPS systems,

the way we negotiate the urban environment is changing at an unprecedented rate. As James Harkin (2010, p.284) walks through the streets of London with William J. Mitchell, they discuss how 'a whole ragbag of new gadgets and wireless technologies hold up the promise of navigating our way through cities in exciting new ways'. This experience of augmented wandering is characterised by multiple connection points that constantly bring physical and virtual spaces into a formative relationship with each other. As Nicolas Whybrow (2010, p.246) suggests, 'the Internet and electronic media generally have not just facilitated global communication networks but have, of course, become sites themselves'. Conversely, for Mitchell (2000, p.12), the contemporary city has become increasingly defined by its virtual topology through 'simultaneously unfolding, casually intertwined processes of technological innovation, capital mobilisation, social reorganisation, and cultural transformation'. These changes to our social space have taken place both physically and virtually, and the boundary between the two realms should be understood as porous, fluid and unstable.

This article documents and reflects on a series of exploratory journeys conducted in May and June 2012 through various physical and virtual spaces. These 'e-drifts' are condensed into a short narrative and commentary later in this article. I have coined this term to foreground the role of electronic technology in shifting the range and possibilities of cultural wandering. Two capital cities provide the physical dimension of these expeditions: Paris and London. They have been chosen as major cultural and financial centres with a rich history of resistant wandering (Solnit, 2001, p.212). Alongside, and during, several walks in these cities, virtual 'wandering' took place on a desktop computer in a flat in Glasgow, a laptop in various hotels and a flat in North London, and an iPhone that provided constant access to the Internet wherever any urban expeditions took place. The e-drifts used smartphone technology to blur the

spaces between the city and the Internet and attempted to navigate the city as World Wide Web, searching for productive ways to bring virtual and physical realms together.

In the account that follows, I have chosen to avoid a first person narrative in order to experiment with the use of 'e' as an ungendered pronoun. While this is not to deny that in this case the wanderer is male (Deirdre (Dee) Heddon and Cathy Turner (2010; 2012) point out that this is problematically true of most of the famous wanderers of the last century), this approach is intended to respond to the elusive nature of identity in these drifts, suggesting that a degree of anonymity may be possible in moving through urban and cyber spaces. The Internet has now facilitated a new level of anonymity and since the early nineties, the World Wide Web has become the realm of the 'cyberflâneur'; a technological extension of Charles Baudelaire's urban wanderer (Hartman, 2004, p.122). The self does not disappear completely in these drifts but it has the potential to fade into the background as an element of control is granted to the wanderer to choose how they are perceived and where they go. However, it is important to acknowledge that this anonymity, which Keith Tester (1994, p.4) refers to as a 'princely incognito', can be viewed as problematic. For Baudelaire (1972, p.399), the city streets are a backdrop for those wanderers and observers of modern life, whose passion and profession is 'to merge with the crowd'. Like Baudelaire's flâneur, there is a risk that the e-drifter assumes a privileged position that is afforded by the same systems and structures that much of this wandering is intended to challenge. In this sense, the e-drifter risks assuming the position of the 'information elite' (Hartman, 2004, p.123). E-drifting therefore acknowledges and avows a paradoxical relationship to the environments that it moves through. It is conceived as a process of inquiry, not offered as a political solution.

Identity on the Internet is a complex and contradictory phenomenon. On one hand, the defining condition of Web surfing is to reveal very little about oneself. The Internet can be understood as 'a safe space where we are free to perform identity' (Krotoski, 2010a), or a laboratory for experimentation on the self that is removed from our 'real-life selves' (Turkle, 1995, p.180). On the other hand, the Web has been conceived as an 'echo chamber' that ultimately functions to close down our possible selves as 'we consume information and make decisions about which services and products to trust by selecting the information that confirms our beliefs, that makes us more like us' (Krotoski, 2010a; see also Gilbert, Bergstrom and Karahalios, 2009). Furthermore, multinational data companies constantly build-up profiles about individual Web-users. As Eric Schmidt (2010), Google's CEO infamously stated, 'We don't need you to type at all. We know where you are. We know where you've been. We can more or less know what you're thinking about'. This Orwellian provocation exemplifies a pervasive culture of data gathering and storage that governs the everyday use of the Internet.

'World Wide Wandering' is a tentative, exploratory journey into this landscape. The e-drifts discussed were conceived as an attempt to subvert or move against the powerful and omnipresent systems of the city and the Internet. They aspire to the condition of resistant cultural practice in the tradition of Fredric Jameson (1991) and Hal Foster (1985), who understood art as a means of struggle and contestation that took place within the systems that they critique. For Jameson and Foster, resistance was a more credible approach than the transgression of postmodernity, which for Jameson was a profoundly economic condition; a 'cultural dominant' that is inextricably linked to late capitalist society, and through which all forms of contemporary political art must articulate their position (Jameson, 1991, p.4). E-drifting is therefore intended as a performative intervention into the systems and structures

of the Internet and the city. This is a 'relational' or 'situational' model of urban exploration that aspires towards 'a form of ongoing renegotiation or, indeed, troubling of its chosen sites' (Whybrow, 2011, p.30). The aim is to identify connections, to draw comparisons and to explore the potential of wandering as a resistant cultural act that can move within and between realms.

E-drifting uses wandering as a way of engaging with social spaces that is more active and 'hands on' than the 'disembodied' wandering practices developed by Baudelaire (Heddon, 2008, p.112). As such, this model is offered as a contribution to the emerging field of 'mobile methodologies':

Perhaps it is not enough to imagine that a nuanced understanding of an increasingly mobile world will be gained by simply passing through it and observing in the mode of the flâneur. Unlike the more localised world of Baudelaire's Paris, the types of mobilities connecting disparate populations and parts of the world—physically and virtually—are many and various and there is a growing feeling that we have not adequately attended to the range of techniques and their intersections that we could employ to better understand a world constituted in movement (Fincham, McGuinness and Murray, 2010, p.2).

Aiming to develop more active 'techniques' for understanding and engaging with this dynamic world, e-drifting is conceived as an active process of experimentation, interrogation and intervention. Although the flâneur has endured throughout the twentieth century and into the twenty-first, this is a mode of engagement with urban spaces that has been continually problematised. Although e-drifting adopts the role of the incognito artist 'on assignment in the realm of consumers' (Benjamin, 1999, p.427), the central argument of this article is that the use of

technology may offer a range of opportunities to expand and develop established forms of urban wandering.

Cultural pathfinding

The Internet can be understood as a defining feature of an increasingly 'chaotic' social environment (Bourriaud, 2001, p.14; McNair, 2006). Nicolas Bourriaud (2009, p.143) suggests that we are now caught beneath a 'continuous downpour' of cultural production, through which 'individuals move about within a veritable rain of forms, images, objects, and discourses'. Aiming to avoid getting caught in this rain, Bourriaud introduces the figure of the semionaut; a contemporary artist who is no longer content with inventing new forms, but rather seeks 'the invention of paths through culture' (2001, p.18; 2009, p.53). Applying this pathfinding objective to the systems and structures of the World Wide Web, a resistant Internet practice might be identified that forges a progressive political route through a saturated virtual landscape.

Journey metaphors already permeate this article: 'drifting', 'exploring', 'pathways', 'routes'. But these spatial and temporal movements are something more than merely metaphorical. For Bourriaud (2009, p.51), 'the immigrant, the exile, the tourist and the urban wanderer are the dominant figures of contemporary culture'. The latter of these characters, the urban wanderer, is described by Whybrow (2010, p.3) as an 'archetypal figure [who] continues to have currency in the twenty-first century as the embodiment of the city's transiency'. It follows that because the urban environment is constantly shifting, any intervention into this space must also take place 'on the move':

Thus, wandering represents a political inquiry into the city. It is writing on the move and a critique of the urban, understood as the matrix of the scenarios in which we move (Bourriaud, 2009, p.100).

These pedestrian practices therefore have a potentially 'resistant' quality—'to habit, to capitalism, to rules, to expectations' (Heddon, 2008, p.104). To wander is to constantly change, to move beyond boundaries, and to move in line with, or in opposition to, the various trajectories of modern life.

As a resistant cultural practice, wandering has a number of influential precedents, from the *flânerie* of Baudelaire (1972) and Walter Benjamin (1999), to the disruptive *dérives* of Guy Debord and the Situationists (Debord, 1958). Recent challenges to these established models of urban exploration have identified a field 'dominated by the better-known names of male artists', and a picture of the multiple practices of 'walking women' is now beginning to emerge (Heddon and Turner, 2010, p.14). The diversity of walking practices discussed by Heddon and Turner in their series of interviews with female artists illustrates the importance of avoiding generalisations in this field (2010, p.21; 2012, p.235). Likewise, Phil Smith (2010, p.112) observes 'a shaky matrix of explorers and walkers; too incoherent to be a community, too liquefacted to tolerate definitions for very long'. Nonetheless, Smith identifies a common concern in much of this work: 'the quotidian re-making of space' (Smith, 2010, p.112). Wandering, in this sense, can be understood as an everyday performative practice that can tangibly affect its immediate environment.

Debord and the Situationists circumvented the prescribed routes of the twentieth century European city by drifting along its 'psychogeographical contours' (Debord, 1958). Building on this ethos of consumer resistance, the e-drifts

discussed below aim to enact a virtual *dérive* along the byroads and boulevards of the information superhighway. As argued by Aleks Krotoski (2010b), 'our courses through the Web—that seem at first random—are actually determined by what we want to know and what we want to hear'. In attempting to resist the systems and structures of the Internet, it is important that this self-determining process is recognised, if not avoided. These journeys into cyberspace therefore attempt to venture into unknown territory. This is an active process of experiencing the physical through the virtual, and the virtual through the physical.

Resistant Internet practice

The utopianism that accompanied the advent of the Internet has long since been challenged. For example, Keith Piper (2010, p.279) explains how 'the "founding fathers" of Cyberspace very much replicated the social and economic interests of the enfranchised white status quo'; and the relational space of the Internet has been recognised as explicitly gendered, argued as both 'deeply embedded in masculine codes and values' and as 'close to the core qualities of femininity' (van Zoonen, 2002, p.6). There is a rich history of resistant Internet practice in which the dominant ideologies of cyberspace have been challenged, eroded and shifted. According to Piper (2010, p.280), 'transgressive behaviour has been a feature of Cyberspace since close after its inception'.

As with any site that is governed by hidden systems of power, the Internet is a fertile ground for resistant cultural practices. Mitchell (2003, pp.3–4) discusses a 'new architecture of the twenty-first century' in which 'electronic information flows, mobile bodies, and physical places intersect'. If the Internet is now the defining social force of

the twenty-first century—an omnipresence in our daily lives—the question of potential resistance inevitably arises. Just as Jameson (1991) and Foster (1985) were sceptical about the possibility of the cultural act taking place outside the systems of capitalism, today's realm of contestation is that of the virtual and its increasing impact on our physical environment. Mitchell (2000, p.12) explains that 'new technological systems are complex social constructions', and argues that as a result, 'we must understand our emerging options [and] choose our ends carefully'. Ultimately, we are not destined to accept the system as it currently manifests itself. Rather, we should be searching for ways of testing it and utilising it; 'our job is to design the future we want, not to predict its predetermined path' (Mitchell, 2000, p.12).

Such rhetoric recalls many of the anti-capitalist positions of twentieth century Europe. Michel de Certeau (1984) argues that despite the technologies and mechanisms of ruling ideologies, society has an ability to manipulate these constructs from within, a series of quotidian 'ways of operating' that 'constitute the innumerable practices by means of which users reappropriate the space organised by techniques of sociocultural production' (de Certeau, 1984, p.xiv). Through 'reappropriation' of the urban space, 'users' are endowed with the agency to transcend the discipline of ruling ideologies from within. For de Certeau, one of the key means by which the urban space could be 'reappropriated' is by walking:

Walking affirms, suspects, tries out, transgresses, respects, etc., the trajectories it 'speaks'. All the modalities sing a part in this chorus, changing from step to step, stepping in through proportions, sequences, and intensities which vary according to the time, the path taken and the walker. These enunciatory operations are of an unlimited diversity (de Certeau, 1984, p.99).

De Certeau proposes a 'rhetoric of walking' comprised of 'a series of turns (tours) and detours that can be compared to "turns of phrase" or "stylistic figures"' (1984, p.100). Equating the use of language to the composition of a path, de Certeau suggests that, like language, this is an art which can be understood through styles and uses (the symbolic and the actual). This art of spatial practice manipulates a constructed order that establishes a 'proper meaning' of the urban space (1984, p.100).

Applying this tactical subversion to the virtual spaces of the Internet, we might ask, what 'art of spatial practice' might allow us to manipulate the 'proper meaning' of the internet? E-drifting is an attempt to address this question, as tactics of wandering are extended into the virtual realm. Informed by the wandering practices of pre-internet eras, e-drifting aspires to a contemporary Situationism. The e-drift attempts to move through and between realms, searching for productive cultural exchanges and recognising these spaces as dynamic and interconnected. This is an attempt to answer Bourriaud's (2009, p.107) question, 'how can one become the explorer of a world now covered by satellites, a world whose every millimetre is now registered and surveyed?'

E-drifting is an exploration at the edges of established modes of resistance. Speculating on the future of the intersection between the virtual and the physical, Mitchell (2000, p.15) suggests that 'digital telecommunications networks will not create entirely new urban patterns from

the ground up; they will begin by morphing existing ones'. Adopting this position, e-drifts use existing models, such as flânerie and détournement, in order to morph them and to find ways of applying them to a radically different urban pattern that is now irrevocably networked. With this agenda in mind, the account that follows summarises a summer's e-drifting in Paris and London in May and June 2012. The narrative attempts to capture a tentative, exploratory and experimental 'pathfinding' that was conducted in the tradition of Bourriaud's 'semionauts' (2009, p.53; 2001, p.18).

World Wide Wandering

E found that early attempts at wandering through Paris and London were frequently thwarted by the irresistible pull of the iPhone Maps application. How could e follow the psychogeographical contours of the city when the multinational data gatherers had been there already, rendering the streets and boulevards hopelessly knowable and searchable? Leaving the technology at home seemed disingenuous, a desperate nostalgic hankering for a bygone age before mobile Internet. The city was no longer accessed through physical routes alone, and e had to find a way to embrace this pandemic augmentation of the urban landscape.

Attempting to find the epicentre of the predictable city, e types 'places to go in London' into Google and picks the first unfamiliar location—Little Venice, where the Grand Union and Regent's Canals meet to the north of Paddington. Alighting from the Underground at Warwick Avenue, e wanders along the leafy streets and, as the sun sets, the sound of a six-piece blues band heralds the final hours of the Canalway Cavalcade festival—a fortuitously celebratory opening to a week's e-drifting.

E drinks overpriced lager from a plastic glass and watches Chinese lanterns float away into the clear sky. Over a Tannoy, the wry compère announces a procession of illuminated narrowboats; an annual tradition that is cynically undercut by e's judgemental use of a Rightmove application to ascertain local property and boat prices. Now, with the knowledge that e's Glasgow flat is worth little more than the smallest of these vessels, the whole affair takes on a new light and a charming pageant becomes a grotesque parade of affluence.

Later, in a far less glamorous flat in Willesden Green, e trawls the Internet for other Little Venices and stumbles across the website for the Department of Architecture at University of California, Berkeley, where Professor Charles C. Benton blogs about his foray into kite aerial photography. E uses Benton's photographs of the 'Little Venice' of Parc de la Villette in Paris as a real-world hyperlink, and, two weeks later, finds the exact location of the spot where the kite camera captured a freight boat passing one of Bernard Tschumi's follies on the Canal de l'Ourcq.

Searching the Web for information about the follies, e mostly finds drawings and plans, strikingly detached from the landscape, alongside photographs of the bright red structures taken from below, framed by nothing but clear blue sky. On foot, sauntering along the canal on the warmest day of the year so far, the park feels very different. The follies are distinct from their environment, but they also have a clear relationship with it. E moves over bridges, across well-kept greens and up stairs—the whole site is a huge adventure playground. At the same time, e has never been in a place that feels so tangibly designed. People literally flow along the pathways, parallel and perpendicular to the waterway. This is the architecture of human behaviour as much as landscape, a clear reminder

that most of the wandering that is done in the city was planned in an architect's studio.

The same is true, of course, of the nineteenth century shopping arcades made famous to urban wanderers by Benjamin. E walks the length of one of these—Le Passage Choiseul—the following day and finds locked doors, boarded up windows and 'to let' signs. Perhaps this is a more direct example of the impact of the internet on the urban environment, as the explosion of e-commerce draws its strength from the closure of local independent businesses?

Leaving the manmade waterways of the Canal de l'Ourcq behind, e traces the route of the Canal St-Martin above ground towards the Seine. Surrounded by monumental architecture and urban order, the river offers a very different experience of wandering through the city. Here, the Gothic splendour of Notre-Dame and the vast architectural grandeur of the Louvre are juxtaposed with something more mysterious and untameable in the murky depths of a defiantly natural entity: the urban river that contains both 'the real and imagined threats which unruly natural features represent to the civilised contemporary city' (Donald, 2012, p.222).

Standing on a bridge over the Seine, e uses an augmented reality programme to display information overlaid on the physical city. Recognising the shapes of buildings and monuments, a series of labels are generated that indicate the location of various tourist attractions. E is looking for an indication of where to go next, but there are no clear signs. Underfoot, the river ripples in the sunlight. It is notably absent from the virtual data. This is the first point in e's journey that the physical seems to shut out the virtual. Perhaps that is why this whole e-drift has continually been drawn to water and guided by its routes. E

stays on the bridge for a long time, trying to get a sense of the life of the river. The need to walk diminishes as the water moves things and people past this vantage point.



View of the Seine from Pont Neuf, June 2012

Returning to London, e spends some time staying on a houseboat in a floating community near Tower Bridge. For better or worse, e has missed the spectacular flotilla organised for the Queen's Diamond Jubilee, but there is still plenty of evidence of celebration in the days following the event. In the mornings, e sits at a picnic table that was hauled out of the River Thames and given a new home on the bow of the boat. No online furniture store could have provided such an efficient delivery service.

Drifting along the South Bank, e stumbles across a world food market behind the Queen Elizabeth Hall. Eating a delicious Serbian kebab, e reflects on the global marketplace that has contained and defined this entire summer excursion: Google's multinational corporation, operating from data centres in America, Finland and Belgium; exchange of cultures, traditions and products—the Chinese lanterns; London's allusion to Italy's grand canals; the passage to France afforded by the Eurostar; the Jubilee celebrations of the Commonwealth. Clearly, the global spaces of London and Paris extend far beyond their

geographical boundaries.

Moving through virtual and physical spaces over the course of these e-drifts, another realm had moved into focus, located in the prevalent processes of cosmopolitanism and globalisation. Beyond the intersection between the Internet and the city, the rest of the world had asserted its constant presence. Journeys through this worldwide space could now take place both electronically (via kite aerial photography) and corporeally (via a delicious kebab). While these drifts raised far more questions than they ever could have hoped to answer, this seemed to validate this line of inquiry: to explore the connections between the physical and the virtual, to ask how we can work with and through them both to better understand the world in which we live. The next phase of the e-drift may have to reach further into this global realm.

Technological resistance

These e-drifts have only scratched the surface of what is available to supplement and enhance the experience of urban wandering, but by accepting and acknowledging the use of Internet search engines and mobile technology in pedestrian practices, it may be possible to develop a form of resistance that operates through and within the systems of the Internet, rather than attempting to transgress them. The e-drifts narrated above have attempted this in four key ways: subversion, supplementation, avoidance and expansion.

First, in the contemporary city, the 'psychogeographical contours' that Debord and his contemporaries were drawn by can be followed into virtual, as well as physical, realms. While many of these routes are predetermined, they can

also be subverted by creative uses of technology. For example, when e uses an augmented reality programme to find spaces in the city where tourist information and commercial systems are absent, this is to subvert the intended use of such technology. This is subversion in the tradition of Phil Smith's (2012) counter-tourism: non-threatening but non-conformist.

Second, there are times when the use of technology can significantly supplement the experience of urban wandering. Like the vast sign systems of the city traversed by de Certeau and his contemporaries, the Internet deals in vast quantities of information. Our ability to access this information has skyrocketed in the last decade. When e searches the Web for information about Tschumi's follies, this provides a collection of images, statistics and diagrams that supplement the experience of visiting the site. This information significantly changes the way that the Parc de la Villette is perceived and experienced.

Third, these e-drifts have continually been drawn to anomalies in this vast information cortex. In this way, they have consciously avoided the prescribed modes of using and inhabiting virtual and physical spaces. In the case of these particular e-drifts, this avoidance was frequently exemplified in a psychogeographical connection to water. Canals and rivers offer a different type of space that lies outside both urban and cyber space, and yet provides routes through these spaces. In the midst of a dynamic urban environment that perpetually stages itself for hordes of visitors, rivers offer an alternative experience that highlights the contemporary city's relationship with nature, 'rising and falling in response to weather conditions or tidal flow, prone to breaching the boundaries imposed by humans, and in constant flux' (Donald, 2012, p.213). Rivers resist technological systemisation and as such, they are an attractive feature of the e-drifter's route.

Fourth, e-drifting allows the expansion of previous wandering practice into a wider, global realm. With mobile technology, we are never only in one place, as the physical locations mentioned in this account of a summer's e-drifting attest (Paris, London, the Grand Union Canal, Regent's Canal, Paddington, Warwick Avenue, Glasgow, Willesden Green, UC Berkeley, Venice, China, Parc de la Villette, Le Passage Choiseul, Canal de l'Ourcq, Canal St-Martin, Notre-Dame, the Louvre, the Seine, Pont Neuf, Tower Bridge, the River Thames, the South Bank, the Queen Elizabeth Hall, America, Finland, Belgium, Italy, France). Ranging in scale and distance, some of these places were physically visited, while some were present through virtual connections and affordances. This expanded realm is often neutralised or ignored, but e-drifting aims to reconcile the global with the local, recognising its impact and influences.

Conclusion

This article has proposed a new form of cultural pathfinding that develops existing models of wandering for a new context. The contemporary city is now global, networked and increasingly integrated with virtual spaces. In this fluid, dynamic environment, wandering should be reimaged and refocussed in order to retain its potentially resistant qualities. Bourriaud (2009, p.100) understands the urban as 'the matrix of the scenarios in which we move'. In the contemporary city, these scenarios include the virtual and the global, and the 'political inquiry' that wandering can bring about has to be able to enter and challenge this new expanded space.

Of course, this is only a starting point. If the e-drift has a future it has to keep up with technological innovation, embracing the increasing augmentation of urban spaces. There are many forms of technology already available which

have not been used in these particular e-drifts. For example, elsewhere, GPS tracking has been used creatively to find new modes of 're-coding' the city (Bissell, 2013). In many ways, the e-drift has the potential to employ mobile technology more creatively and more effectively.

Furthermore, the e-drift has the potential to mobilise on a global level. As John Urry points out, the development of mobile communication technologies has facilitated a transformation in modern economic and social lives as 'people, machines, images, information, power, money, ideas and dangers are "on the move", making and remaking connections at often rapid speed around the world' (2007, pp.5-6). As the e-drift develops, it will inevitably enter further into this global realm of mobilities.

Urban and virtual spaces will continue to change and develop through a formative and integrated relationship. As a result, the environments that these e-drifts have moved through may change considerably over a relatively short space of time. To keep up with this dynamic environment, e-drifting will therefore constantly develop new methods. Continual change is the defining characteristic of the contemporary city and because wandering takes place on the move, it remains one of the most effective methods of political inquiry. The e-drift offers a new model of wandering for a global, networked society.

References

- Baudelaire, C., 1972. The painter of modern life. In: P.E. Charvet, ed. *Selected writings on art and artists*. Harmondsworth: Penguin. pp.390–436.
- Benjamin, W., 1999. *The arcades project*. R. Tiedmann, ed., London: Belknap Press.
- Benton, C., *Notes on kite aerial photography*, n.d. [online]. Available at: <http://www.arch.ced.berkeley.edu/kap/> [Accessed 4 October 2013].
- Bissell, L., 2013. Deviant practices: technological re-codings of the city through radical play. *Body Space Technology*, 11(2). [online]. Available at: <http://people.brunel.ac.uk/bst/vol1102/> [Accessed 27 May 2013].
- Bourriaud, N., 2001. *Postproduction: culture as screenplay: how art reprogrammes the world*. New York: Lukas & Sternberg.
- Bourriaud, N., 2009. *The radicanant*. New York: Lukas & Sternberg.
- Cathédrale Notre Dame de Paris*, n.d. [online]. Available at: <http://www.notredamedeparis.fr> [Accessed 4 October 2013].
- Certeau, de. M., 1984. *The practice of everyday life*. London: University of California Press.
- Debord, G., 1958. Theory of the dérive. *Bureau of public secrets*. [online]. Available at: <http://www.bopsecrets.org/SI/2.derive.htm> [Accessed 11 January 2012].
- Donald, M., 2012. The urban river and site-specific performance. *Contemporary Theatre Review*, 22(2), pp.213–223. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10486801.2012.669211>.
- Fincham, B., McGuinness, M. and Murray, L., 2010. *Mobile methodologies*. London: Palgrave Macmillan. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1057/9780230281172>.
- Foster, H. ed., 1985. For a concept of the political in contemporary art. In: H. Foster, ed., *Recodings: art, spectacle, cultural politics*. Port Townsend, WA: Bay Press. pp.139-155.

Gilbert, E., Bergstrom, T. and Karahalios, K., 2009. Blogs are echo chambers: blogs are echo chambers. In: *42nd Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, pp.1–10.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/hicss.2009.91>.

Harkin, J., 2010. Cyborg city. In: N. Whybrow, ed. *Performance and the contemporary city: an interdisciplinary reader*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan. pp.283–286.

Hartmann, M., 2004. *Technologies and utopias: the cyberflaneur and the experience of 'being online'*. Munich: Verlag Reinhard Fischer.

Heddon, D., 2008. *Autobiography and performance*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Heddon, D. and Turner, C., 2010. Walking women: interviews with artists on the move. *Performance Research: A Journal of the Performing Arts*, 15(4), pp.14–22.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13528165.2010.539873>.

Heddon, D. and Turner, C., 2012. Walking women: shifting the tales and scales of mobility. *Contemporary Theatre Review*, 22(2), pp.224–236.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10486801.2012.666741>.

Inland Waterways Association. *The Jubilee celebrations at Canalway Cavalcade*, n.d. [online]. Available at:
<http://www.waterways.org.uk/news_campaigns/campaign_news/queen_s_diamond_jubilee_celebrations_at_canalway_cavalcade> [Accessed 4 October 2013].

Jameson, F., 1991. *Postmodernism, or, the cultural logic of late capitalism*. London: Verso.

Krotoski, A., 2010a. *The cult of me: a primer for broadcasters*. [online]. Available at: <<http://www.alekskrotoski.com/post/npox10-the-cult-of-me-a-primer-for-broadcasters>> [Accessed 8 April 2012].

Krotoski, A., 2010b. *Supercharge your serendipity*. [online]. Available at: <<http://www.alekskrotoski.com/post/engage-supercharge-your-serendipity>> [Accessed 8 April 2012].

Louvre, the, n.d. [online]. Available at: <www.louvre.fr/en> [Accessed 4 October 2013].

McNair, B., 2006. *Cultural chaos: journalism and power in a globalised world*. Abingdon: Routledge.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4324/9780203448724>.

Mitchell, W.J., 2000. *E-topia: urban life, Jim—but not as we know it*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Mitchell, W.J., 2003. *Me++: the cyborg self and the networked city*. London: MIT Press.

Piper, K., 2010. A nigger in cyberspace. In: N. Whybrow, ed. *Performance and the contemporary city: an interdisciplinary reader*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan. pp.277–283.

Schmidt, E., 2010. (Interview) *Washington Ideas Forum*. [video online]. Available at:
<<http://www.theatlantic.com/technology/archive/2010/10/google-ceo-the-laws-are-written-bylobbyists/63908/#video>> [Accessed 8 April 2012].

Smith, P., 2010. *Mythogeography: a guide to walking sideways*. Axminster: Triarchy Press.

Smith, P., 2012. *Counter-tourism: a handbook*. Axminster: Triarchy Press.

Solnit, R., 2001. *Wanderlust: a history of walking*. New York: Penguin.

Southbank Centre. *World Street Food Festival*. [online]. Available at:
<<http://www.southbankcentre.co.uk/whats-on/world-street-food-festival-1000260>> [Accessed 4 October 2013].

Tester, K. ed., 1994. *The Flâneur*. London: Routledge.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4324/9780203420713>.

Turkle, S., 1995. *Life on the screen: identity in the age of the internet*. New York: Touchstone.

Urry, J., 2007. *Mobilities*. Cambridge: Polity.

Whybrow, N. ed., 2010. *Performance and the contemporary city: an interdisciplinary reader*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Whybrow, N., 2011. *Art and the city*. London: I.B.Tauris.

Zoonen, van. L., 2002. Gendering the internet: claims, controversies and cultures. *European Journal of Communication*, 17(1), pp.5–23.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0267323102017001605>.

About the author

Dr David Overend is a director and Lecturer in Performance at the University of the West of Scotland. He trained at RADA and was Associate Artist at the Arches (2007–2010) where he completed a practice-as-research PhD with the University of Glasgow. David's current research focuses on the relationship between performance and journeys; he has written several articles on this subject and leads the Making Routes network for researchers and practitioners working with mobilities in contemporary performance. Recent directing credits include *Bullet Catch* by Rob Drummond (the Arches, 2012) and *The Pirate* by Stuart Hepburn (Òran Mór, 2013).

Re-reading Mary Wigman's *Hexentanz II* (1926): the influence of the non-Western 'Other' on movement practice in early modern 'German' dance

LITO TSITSOU & LUCY WEIR

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.04
Publication date: 13 December 2013

This paper provides a re-reading of Mary Wigman's Hexentanz II ('Witch Dance', 1926), emphasising the social and aesthetic conditions in which she created dance works. A renewed interest in the idea of a return to nature characterised the artistic mood of this period, and scholars conceive of this return as an antidote to the capitalist modernisation of Germany and the effects of the First World War. This paper views Wigman's work as a prominent example of the reversion to 'primitive' forms as a means of devising a new, avant-garde creative practice. The witch's dance indicates a return to 'primitive ritualism', which is linked to the construction of the non-Western 'Other' as authentic and pure. Hexentanz II drew on various non-Western cultural elements, which became crystallised into a new technique and style of movement. However, as Edward Said (1978) would argue, such cultural elements are utilised for the benefit of the West and the construction of a modern dance more widely, a fraction of which would be gradually fabricated as 'German'.

Keywords: historical sociology of dance, Mary Wigman, Hexentanz II

Introduction

The development of early twentieth century modern dance was informed by a complex nexus of processes characterised both by anti-balletic tendencies as well as a return to basic cultural practices such as folk and quasi-religious ritual performance. Such practices were often mediated by representations of the Oriental 'Other', which were used to construct an art form that was viewed as distinctively national, and, in this case, 'German'. In this paper, we centre our argument on the case study of Mary Wigman's *Hexentanz II* (1926), positing that this seminal work was a prominent example of a social and aesthetic process by which the exotic becomes a vehicle for the construction of national and nationalist forms of modern dance.

Susan Manning (1991; 1993) is a leading authority on Wigman's work whose studies highlight the shifting social and aesthetic conditions in which Wigman operated, analysing works from her earliest choreographies to the post-war period. Manning (1993) placed great emphasis on the intersection of nationalism and feminism, which, as she argues, characterised Wigman's work in the period of the Third Reich (1933-1945). Her study takes into account dance works that Wigman produced throughout the Nazi ascendance to power, highlighting her trajectory and survival as an artist. Karina and Kant (2003) have examined Wigman's alliance with the Nazi regime, identifying elements in her work that they argue reflect state ideology. Howe (1996) discusses Wigman's oeuvre from a philosophical-artistic perspective, focusing on individuality, artistic expression and embodied transcendence. Shorter studies (Banes, 1998; Burt, 1998) discuss other aspects of Wigman's choreography including ritualistic, Oriental dances such as *Monotonie: Drehtanz* ('Monotony: Whirl Dance', 1928) and *Hexentanz II*, as well as the occultist elements of her work. Dee Reynolds (2007, p.52) also notes the 'strong Oriental influence' on Wigman's early works

such as *Opfer* ('Sacrifice': part of the Ecstatic Dances cycle, 1919).

Evidently, elements of Wigman's oeuvre have thus far been considered 'Oriental' and discussed in the context of nationalism. However, Wigman's choreographic trajectory poses questions about a change in her work from the Oriental to the nationalist. This paper rationalises such a shift by arguing that *Hexentanz II* marks the beginning of a wider symbolic and Orientalist process embedded in dance production of the period. This process refers to the ritualistic presence of the 'Other' in dance, but also to the way in which non-Western material becomes a vehicle for the production of a 'German' modern dance more widely.

Said (1978) argued that the appropriation of the 'Other' for the benefit of the West is at the core of Orientalist practice. However, the outcome of this process involves Wigman's participation in the production of dance in the Nazi period. As we shall show, the trajectory from the non-Western to the nationalist is homologous to a wider social process of state formation and social change in Germany. Thus, this paper provides a re-reading of the making of *Hexentanz II*, drawing on the social history of the period in question in order to present a new history of the dance that specifically examines the conditions of artistic production, with the aim of uncovering the relationship between wider social/historical processes and artistic endeavours.

Ritualism and Said's Orientalism

This paper is a product of interdisciplinary collaboration, linked to two separate studies on modern dance; the first was a sociological investigation of the conditions of possibility of Western theatrical dance, while the other

focused on aesthetics of cultural exchange in the works of Mary Wigman, Martha Graham and Pina Bausch, based on archival collections and primary sources¹. Consequently, this paper will apply socio-historical and anthropological perspectives to the discussion of *Hexentanz II* and 'German' dance more widely.

This paper employs a Saidian analysis of *Hexentanz II*. Said (1978, p.325) argued that inaccurate, romanticised versions of the Orient—what he terms 'latent Orientalism'—are, in fact, harmful rather than innocuous tropes, stating that: 'The Orient is not only adjacent to Europe; it is also [...] one of its deepest and most recurring images of the Other'. This 'Other' has both stereotypical positive and negative attributes; it is both the exoticised (and frequently sexualised) Orient of literature and the imagination (Said, 1993). Said (1989) explores the representation of colonised populations in literature as expressive of the oppressive relationship between the West and the East. As he explains, before the Second World War, the 'colonised' constituted those non-Western and non-European populations 'that have been controlled and often settled forcibly by Europeans' (Said, 1989, p.206). These populations are represented as the opposite of the West, namely primitive, inferior, mysterious, and potentially threatening, yet in certain respects maintaining a kind of primal purity (Said, 1978, p.115).

Thus, Orientalism constitutes a demonising process, one of creating distance from the inferior, but also a process of exoticising and valorising the non-Western 'Other' for the benefit of the West. In this paper, we explore this duality (which we call 'demonising' and 'valorising' respectively) in relation to Wigman's *Hexentanz II*, reflecting on the making of new dance in Germany more broadly in the early modern period. Broadly speaking, Orientalist representations of the 'Other' draw thematically on 'an essentialist conceptions of

countries, peoples and nations [...] expressed through a characterized ethnist typology' (Said, 1978, p.97). As such, Orientalism refers to a set of assumptions embedded in the representation of the 'Other', which, as anthropology has shown, is constructed rather than encountered (Fabian, 1990, p.755).

Orientalism and dance have been at the centre of academic debate, with scholars arguing for the strongly Orientalist and sexualised character of both ballet and modern dance (Desmond, 1997; Koritz, 1995; 1997; Martin, 1997), and others arguing against the Saidian idea (Burt, 1998; Copeland, 1996). Burt (1998, p.165) sees the Orientalist tendencies in dance as an empathetic process, one by which the self becomes the 'Other'. He argues that works such as those of Mary Wigman, Martha Graham and Katherine Dunham often did not reflect fixed divisions between the primitive and the modern, but rather such divisions were dynamic and fluid. Indeed, this was an idea adopted by a series of Modernist dance makers; Martin (1997, p.328) contends in response to this argumentation that Modernism as an aesthetic movement tended to psychologise the appropriation of the 'Other', replacing it with an aestheticised self-appropriation, thus concealing the power relations in dance representation. Our article aims to contribute to this latter interpretation, highlighting the Orientalist practices underlying Wigman's process in making *Hexentanz II*.

This paper also explores the influence of ritualism in dance production, which is particularly prominent in the case of *Hexentanz II*. Catherine Bell (1992, p.43) posits that:

rituals [...] communicate [...] and it is through this function that [they] indirectly affect social realities and perceptions of those realities. However, when performance theory attempts to explain such communication it must fall back on ritual activity as depicting, modelling, enacting or dramatising what are seen as prior conceptual ideas and values.

Bell (1992, p.16) argues that ritual is 'a type of critical juncture wherein some pair of opposing social or cultural forces comes together'. These definitions concur with Said's thematic Orientalism as a preconception, while the processes of distancing and admiring further reflect, as we shall see, Wigman's own conception of *Hexentanz II* as ecstatic ritual.

Hexentanz II links this ethnist ritualistic performance with demonic behaviours, thus ascribing a new meaning to the dance. As Schechner and Appel (1990, p.24) explain, this is in fact a wider function:

Ethnologically, rituals are certain behavioural displacements, exaggerations, repetitions, and transformations that communicate and/or symbolize meanings not ordinarily associated with the behaviour displayed.

These theoretical perspectives are useful for analysing *Hexentanz II* as a ritualistic work, one whose elements are drawn from the same kind of ethnist typology we have defined. As we shall show, *Hexentanz II* itself reflects this dual demonising/valorising process, and posits certain questions for understanding the making of this piece.

Context

By the turn of the twentieth century, the presence of the 'Other' in dance was hardly a new concept. Ritualistic themes appeared in Romantic ballet, characterised by mythological archetypes such as Sylphs and Willis (otherworldly beings with magical powers) that dominated works like *Giselle* (1841) and *La Sylphide* (1836) (Garafola, 1997; Mackrell, 1997). Ritualism became part of the balletic tradition that further informed the practices of the Modernist enterprise of Sergei Diaghilev's Ballet Russes, such as *L'Après midi d'un faune* (1912) and *Le Sacre du printemps* (1913). Similarly, Loie Fuller and Isadora Duncan incorporated ritualistic elements into their avant-garde dance works (Koritz, 1995; 1997).

However, this artistic turn to the 'Other' began with the appropriation of Continental folk dances (see Arkin and Smith, 1997), what in retrospect we label as national dances, and further with the appropriation of Eastern dances (Egyptian and Arabic) as ritualistic, primitive, and often sensual. Folk dances expressed what Johann Gottfried Herder (Adler and Koepke, 2009) referred to as *Volksgeist*; namely, they were seen to encapsulate the suppressed spirit of people living under imperial dominion (Banes, 1998; Garafola, 1998). At the same time, Eastern/Oriental dances were used to represent the spirit of the Orient as the West conceived it; Michel Fokine made use of both in his works with the Russian Imperial Ballet. Evidently, a return to folk tradition and ritual as a means to formulating a new movement vocabulary underpinned the aesthetic development of dance at this time.

More specifically, German *Ausdruckstanz* (expressive dance) and other avant-garde forms that preceded this movement were indicative of the fragmentation of ballet into different styles and forms, enforced by symbolic and aesthetic trends that were often internally antagonistic,

what Bourdieu (1996, p.225) calls symbolic oppositions². The birth of modern dance in Germany was a bid for autonomy from political power and struggle for the legitimacy of new styles of movement³. Modern dance developed in contradistinction to balletic production; namely, its evolution took place outside the institutions that validated the classical form, such as the state operas and municipal or royal theatres. The conditions of dance production were challenged in this new model and a significant shift took place towards what is now termed freelancing and private enterprise. Primary examples of this were Diaghilev's Ballets Russes and Rolf de Marè's Ballets Suédois (Garafola, 2005). This move indicated a new autonomy in dance making, as content and style were not prescribed or determined by power. Furthermore, modern dance was also anti-balletic in terms of its movement and narrative (or abstract) content.

Mary Wigman was a dance maker whose work was also heavily influenced by these structural changes, in a social, political and aesthetic environment characterised by modernisation and capitalist advancement. Born to an upper middle-class family in Hanover in 1886, she resolved to become a professional dancer relatively late in life, in her mid-twenties (Howe, 1996, p.96). She explored alternative methods of creating dance to the dominant form of ballet outwith theatrical structures. Her experimentations with improvisation and free movement reflected the widespread popularity of body culture movements in Germany at the turn of the century (Manning, 1993).

These phenomena were a response to the rapid industrialisation and urbanisation of Germany and the perceived repressive character of the city and reflected a need for healthier lifestyles through a return to nature, which intensified in the years following the First World War. Organised communities operating around non-hierarchical

structures and anti-capitalist ideologies aimed to cultivate a new form of habitus⁴; namely, new dispositions towards social and political life cultivated physical performance in nature. The emphasis on physical culture stood for a new understanding of human physicality, signifying the end of absolutist control over the body through etiquette. This was expressed through the abolition of corsets and brassieres, which liberated the female body in particular, and became a cultural ideal (Carter, 2011; Toepfer, 2003). As Fensham (2011, pp.3–4) explains, ideas about nature as a form of escape or consolation to the mechanised, chaotic, capitalist modern world were a Romantic construction. Discourses of naturalism and dance, which drew heavily on philosophical and scientific ideas of the period (see Darwinist theory), constructed nature as a recurring force ‘regarded as transcendently beautiful, but occasionally overwhelming’ (Fensham, 2011, p.4).

Wigman studied in these new conditions, as we shall see. Initially, she studied rhythmic gymnastics with Émile-Jaques Dalcroze in Hellerau. Dalcroze encouraged group exercise and placed emphasis on movement as a means to a healthy lifestyle (Manning, 1993, p.52). However, Dalcroze’s institute did not offer the kind of expressive potential Wigman was seeking. Thus, she went to Ascona, Switzerland following the advice of her friend Emil Nolde to find Rudolf Laban at the movement school he operated on Monte Verità. This alternative institution, centred on communal living and immersion in the creative arts, promised an alternative to bourgeois urban life. Ritual was an integral part of the colony’s practice, an indication of a return to traditional cultural elements. Laban orchestrated openair physical performances with a quasi-religious ritualistic character, such as the Sun Festival of 1917, an all-day performance of ritualistic dance works in which Wigman played a major role (Manning, 1993, p.78). Ritualism became a common element in dance making in these first decades of the twentieth century, evident even in the work of Isadora

Duncan and Ruth St. Denis, who coupled their teaching of free movement and improvisation with elements of theosophy and religion while emphasising the importance of nature (Tomko, 2004).

Wigman drew on these experiences in order to develop a dance technique of her own which was distinctly anti-balletic. She performed barefoot and experimented with dances performed to spoken word accompaniment, percussion, or even in silence. Wigman's choreography drew on various pre-constructed ideas about the non-Western 'Other' as primitive and/or demonic, manifested primarily through the archetype of the Witch in *Hexentanz II*. This expanded interest in non-Western sources could be interpreted as a search for purity in creative output. Jill Lloyd (in Hiller 1991, p.96) argued that 'a search for authenticity' inspired the desire to look beyond Western frameworks of reference in art. However, this aesthetic became a vehicle for national/nationalist conceptions of modern dance.

Hexentanz II: a case study

Of the many solo works she choreographed, Wigman is most readily associated with a 1926 revision of her 1914 piece, *Hexentanz*. She debuted as a dancer and choreographer on 11 February 1914 at the Museum des Porzia-Palais in Munich, presenting *Hexentanz I* ('Witch Dance') and an early version of *Lento* without musical accompaniment (Müller, 1986, p.36). *Hexentanz I* survives only in a handful of photographs. This very early solo was strikingly different to Wigman's reworked and more famous second version of 1926; the 1914 piece was an adaptation of Dalcroze's *Orpheus and Eurydice* (Manning, 1993, p.77). Wigman's costume was a simple piece of plain material, her legs and feet were left bare, and, unlike the 1926 revision, she wore

no mask. Ernst Scheyer (1970, p.20) observed that the original piece was 'rather angular-Gothic, reminding one of the grotesque "Mooriska Dances" (1480) of Erasmus Grasser'. Dee Reynolds (2007, p.52) claims that at its Munich première, the solo received 'thunderous applause'.

In contrast to the minimal documentation of *Hexentanz I*, *Hexentanz II* is recorded by a large volume of staged photographs, as well as a short film of Wigman performing the piece⁵. Throughout this excerpt (which shows only the first two minutes of the solo), Wigman is seated on the floor. However, as the percussion pace builds, she rocks violently from side to side. It is a truly startling piece, one that generates a particularly unsettling effect paired with the jerky soundtrack of alternating cymbal-crashes and pregnant silence. Contemporary critics were fascinated; in 1933, Rudolf Bach (1933, p.27) wrote that *Hexentanz II* was: 'perhaps Mary Wigman's most distinguished work, perhaps one of the peaks of her art'. Wolfgang Schumann (1931, p.45) stated:

Wigman's dance 'Witch' recalls the Middle Ages and her dance 'Sorceress' recreates a primitive civilization; yet each is above and beyond its theme a comparison in time and space [...] In spite of her modernity Mary Wigman suggests, particularly in her masked dances, at once the fierce intensity of the savage, and the superhumanity of the Greek tragic dancer.

The break from ballet technique in this work was also startling; there was a sense of weightiness in *Hexentanz II* completely oppositional to the ethereal quality of classical dance. At points, Wigman seemed almost stuck to the floor, dragging herself across the stage with a deliberate lack of grace. Dianne Howe (1985, p.152) even called the filmed excerpt of *Hexentanz II* 'one long scream'.

Charlotte Rudolf's photographs of *Hexentanz II* are strongly reminiscent of Noh drama, and Sally Banes (1998, pp.132–134) has analysed the piece in relation to the mie poses of Kabuki theatre. The mask and brocade costume in *Hexentanz II* were an approximation of Japanese traditions, like Kabuki and Noh, devised and performed in a Western dance context. Wigman's geographical proximity to the Dresden ethnological museum might explain her familiarity with the costumes of Japanese theatre, if not necessarily its artistic conventions (Scheyer, 1970, p.20).

Introduced to the use of primitivist masks by the Zurich Dada group (Manning, 1993, p.71), Wigman developed a personal interest in Noh theatre masks, and in particular the deliberate separation between masked 'character' and performer. Wigman's mask in particular lent the 1926 performance a sense of dread that was inextricably tied to the threatening potential of the 'Other'. Wigman (1966, p.42) noted that she was compelled to perform this Oriental ritual dance, clothed in a mask that seemed to have a life of its own:

The *Witch Dance* mask possessed its own personal life. Every movement of the body evoked a changed expression of the face; depending on the position of the head, the eyes seemed to close or to open. As a matter of fact, even around the mouth—intimated with a few strokes of the brush—there seemed to play a smile which, in its unfathomableness, was reminiscent of the Sphinx.

Howe (1996, p.124/128) explains that the mask 'completed the stylization for a harsh [...] mood' and that it represented the 'horror of witchness'. A clear link is established between the possessing, demonic character of the mask and the non-Western elements from which it was constructed. Wigman's use of Noh theatre masks represented the direct influence of non-Western sources on European avant-garde

performance; Olga Taxidou (2007, p.118) argues that Far Eastern theatre traditions have shaped the development of Modernist performance in the West, and that these cross-cultural dialogues are 'central to the whole process of redefinition and retheatricalisation of the theatre'.

Issues of nationalism and the non-Western 'Other'

Andrew Hewitt (2005, pp.44–49) situates the making of new dance throughout this period into a system of practices and discourses—including philosophical and political thought—which negotiated materialism as the plague of social progress, what he terms 'a Romantic anti-capitalism'. The turn to primitive ritualism mediated by images of the 'Other' serves exactly this purpose, encapsulating the pure and the authentic, something that is not corrupted by interest, politics or war. The popularity of ritualistic elements in dance performance exemplified Jung's idea that ritual can invoke memories of a collective common past and of a common human condition, based on which there can be a sense of universal renewal. Indeed, this reversion to the primordial element signified a new start, which was in some sense almost a historical necessity after the horrors of the First World War; in that respect, the 'turn' we speak of is simultaneously a re-turn.

However, this 'turn' represents a double-edged sword for analysis of dance production in this period. As Said (1978) also argues, the construction of the 'Other' as the opposite of the West is simultaneously a valorising and demonising process. On one hand, the turn to the 'Other' exemplifies the need for a return to authentic, traditionalist practices as a means for renewal; ritualism, 'Othering' and primitivism in early Modernist dance reflected this desire for new forms of being and, as such, it becomes a valorising process. However, this kind of 'turn' is performed through pre-

constructed ideas about the 'Other' as underdeveloped, primitive, and often demonic. The 'Other', while posited as authentic in character, becomes the basis for the development of a Western form (modern dance), which would once again be imposed as culturally superior to other forms of dance. This exemplifies what in Said's words might be the core of Orientalist practice: 'The Orientalist makes it [their] work to be always converting the Orient from something into something else: [they] do so for the sake of [their] own culture [...]' (Said, 1978, p.67).

As modern dance embodied the ideal of a new way of life, it would be manipulated as such within a game of political interest. As Norbert Elias (1996) argues⁶, social struggles in Germany gave power to specific strata that competed with an already economically and culturally established European aristocracy. The latter manipulated the idea of a new culture or way of life in order to promote their own interests into a collective fantasy, that of a German culture which unifies the fragmented social experience of the people in this geographical space. Dance became entangled in the process of Germanisation via the concept of culture (specifically, the lifestyle of the capitalist aristocracy) and represented a vehicle for the construction of a metaphysical entity, the German nation. Accordingly, there emerged discourses on a dance that is specifically German, and hence distinctive of a collective value or aesthetic.

As Banes (1998) argues, ideas of nationhood run in parallel with the development of modern dance. The formation of a national German culture was linked to social and political developments in Europe; that is, the progressive dissolution of the empires and the emergence of nation states with defined borders and populations. Germany is a prime example of this model, never managing to achieve the complexity of cultural and economic power of the French and British empires, while also appearing fragmented at the

beginning of the nineteenth century. As a result, the emergence of a nation state-like Germany entailed the fabrication of a unified nation based on common interest and cultural practices. However, as Elias (2000) contends, the idea of a national common culture significant of the German way of life (what he terms *Kultur*, 'culture') was an ideological mechanism for the unification of internally opposing social powers versus the developed elites of France and the rest of Europe. In fact, this served as a means of social consensus for the capitalist plans of the advancing German middle-class. The intellectual progress and achievements of these new social strata were promoted to a form of culture that unified Germany. These practices were given a spiritual, quasi-metaphysical character that became distinctive of 'German' culture in the wider sense. This reflected on dance production and the concept of a specifically 'German' model of dance, exemplified by the work of Wigman.

'German' dance emerged through a process of refinement, passing from an experimental state (the ritualistic performances in Ascona) to one with specific technique, themes and style, promoted as a national product. Meduri (cited in Reed, 1998, p.508) presents a similar argument in her study of the Indian devadasi dance: she describes the transformation of the form from a pre-colonial practice as a temple-ritual dance into a temple 'prostitute' or 'girl' dance during the nineteenth century, and then into an 'emblem of the nation' in the twentieth. We can trace this process of transformation in the work of Mary Wigman, whose experimental and ritualistic dance works of the 1920s gradually gave way to a more subdued aesthetic in keeping with state guidelines throughout the era of National Socialism (Karina and Kant, 2003).

Concluding Remarks

In order to accurately chart the development of modern dance in the first decades of the twentieth century, we must acknowledge the presence and influence of the Orientalised 'Other' in the making of dance, and in turn recognise the complicated relationship that exists between Western ideals and the threatening yet enticing allure of the non-geographically-specific 'Other'. The trajectory from the 'Other' as a theme and aesthetic to the national and the nationalistic signifies a deeply rooted correlation between history and bodily movement. Wigman's *Hexentanz II* serves as an indicator of the significance of the non-Western 'Other' at a crucial point in the evolution of the modern dance tradition; it is a conflation of cultural influences as suggested by a Saidian analysis that has marked the process by which Western modern dance would develop and a fraction of which will be viewed as 'German'; one that was created by an artist with a profound curiosity for the non-Western 'Other', while entangled in the political and social developments of the period.

Notes

1. Descriptions of Wigman's work are derived from research conducted in 2011 by Dr Lucy Weir at the Mary Wigman-Archiv, Akademie der Künste, Berlin. This included photographs, personal essays and letters, and Wigman's extensive choreographic notes.

2. Symbolic oppositions are, in other words, tensions between artistic movements and ideas about the definition and making of dance, its techniques and content.

3. However, this was to change significantly during the Nazi period (Manning, 1993).

4. Habitus: 'a set of historical relations "deposited" within individual bodies in the form of mental and corporeal schemata of perception, appreciation and action' (Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992, p.16).

5. See: [online video](#)

6. Elias's argument is here used as a thick description of the process of behavioural modification and development of a particular way of being as a result of state formation. However, Elias has received a number of criticisms about his endeavour to discuss a process of cultural development in the West (Van Krieken, 1989; Duerr, 1993 [cited in Van Krieken, 2005]). Duerr (1993, as cited in Van Krieken, 2005) argues that Elias adopts a rather imperialist stance taking the civilising process as a process of achieving superiority. However, our use of Elias here does not assume such a stance, but rather is used to contextualise a process that conceals power relations between the West and the Orient.

Van Krieken (1989) also argues that Elias's analysis is limited in that it closely links state formation, social change and self-restraint without taking into account individualisation, namely individual potential for a sense of self and a type of action that is not as bound by what Elias sees as increased social interdependency especially within the urban setting. Indeed, Elias views structural macro-processes as all too powerful and individuals within these as lacking the potential for resistance. Although this discussion falls outwith the scope of this text, we do not wish to see Wigman's work as a mere reflection of this process but rather see the making of *Hexentanz II* as informed by these wider phenomena.

Van Krieken (1989) also argues that bureaucracy, which he sees as distinct from state formation, has not been adequately taken into account in Elias's work. He argues that behavioural modification has been further enforced by bureaucratic organisation, which is linked to the centralisation of authority and the development of rules around tasks and obligations. However, in *Court Society* (1983), Elias does describe processes of rationalisation and compartmentalisation of tasks and duties, which can be seen as primary references to bureaucratisation. Also, in his discussion of German culture in *The civilizing process* (2000), Elias indicates that values around rational organisation of production and efficiency are very much signs of bureaucratic organisation, as Weber also describes it (See Gerth and Mills, 1991), and were indicative of the construction of a distinctive, yet class specific, habitus of the German capitalist aristocracy. For the purposes of this article, what we draw on mostly is Elias's idea of a social process of class formation and interest as a part of a state formation which reflects to some extent on the making of dance in this period, especially on the level of ideology and, in the end, nationalist ideology and institutional production.

References

Adler, H. and Koepke, W. eds., 2009. *A companion to the works of Johann Gottfried Herder*. Rochester, NY: Camden House.

Arkin, C.L. and Smith, M., 1997. National dance in the romantic ballet. In: L. Garafola, ed. *Rethinking the sylph: new perspectives on the romantic ballet*. Hanover: Wesleyan University Press. pp.11–68.

Bach, R., 1933. *Das Mary Wigman-Werk*. Dresden: C. Reissner.

Banes, S., 1998. *Dancing women: female bodies on stage*. London: Routledge.

Bell, C., 1992. *Ritual theory, ritual practice*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Bourdieu, P., 1996. *The rules of art*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P. and Wacquant L, J., 1992. *An invitation to reflexive sociology*. London: University of Chicago Press.

Burt, R., 1998. *Alien bodies: representations of modernity, race and nation in early modern dance*. London: Routledge.

Carter, A., 2011. Constructing and contesting the natural in British theatre dance. In: A. Carter, ed. *Dancing naturally: nature, neo-classicism and modernity in early twentieth century dance*. London: Palgrave Macmillan. pp.16–30.

Copeland, R., 1996. The search for origins. *Dance Theatre Journal*, 13(1), pp.8–14.

Desmond, J. ed., 1997. *Meaning in motion: new cultural studies of dance*. Durham, NC & London: Duke University Press.

Elias, N., 1983. *The court society*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Elias, N., 1996. *The Germans*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Elias, N., 2000. *The civilizing process: sociogenetic and psychogenetic investigations*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Fabian, J., 1990. Presence and representation: the other and anthropological writing. *Critical Inquiry*, 16(4), pp.753–772.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/448558>.

Fensham, R., 2011. Nature, force and variation. In: A. Carter and R. Fensham, eds. *Dancing naturally: nature, neo-classicism and modernity in early twentieth century dance*. London: Palgrave Macmillan. pp.1–15.

Garafola, L., 1997. Introduction. In: L. Garafola, ed. *Rethinking the sylph: new perspectives on romantic ballet*. Hanover: Wesleyan University Press. pp.1–11.

Garafola, L., 1998. *Diaghilev's Ballet Russes*. New York: Da Capo Press.

Garafola, L., 2005. *Legacies of the twentieth century dance*. Hanover and London: Wesleyan University Press.

Gerth, H.H. and Wright Mills, C., 1991. *From Max Weber: essays in sociology*. London: Routledge.

Hewitt, A., 2005. *Social choreography: ideology as performance in dance and everyday movement*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Hiller, S. ed., 1991. *The myth of primitivism: perspectives on art*. London: Routledge.

Howe, D. S., 1985. *Manifestations of the German expressionist aesthetic as presented in drama and art in the dance and writings of Mary Wigman*. Ph.D. University of Wisconsin-Madison.

Howe, D. S., 1996. *Individuality and expression: the aesthetics of the new German dance 1908–1936*. New York: Peter Lang.

Karina, L. and Kant, M., 2003. *Hitler's dancers: German modern dance and the Third Reich*. New York: Berghahn Books.

Koritz, A., 1995. The symbolist dancer: the performance aesthetics of Isadora Duncan, Arthur Symons, and Edward Gordon Craig. In A. Koritz, ed. *Gendering bodies/performing art: dance and literature in twentieth century British culture*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press. pp.59–74.

Koritz, A., 1997. The dancer and woman's place: Maud Allan's the vision of Salome. In: J. Desmond, ed. *Meaning in motion: new cultural studies of dance*. Durham, NC & London: Duke University Press. pp.133–152.

Mackrell, J., 1997. *Reading dance*. London: Michael Joseph.

Manning, S., 1991. The mythologization of the female: Mary Wigman and Martha Graham—a comparison, *Ballett International*, 14(9), pp.10–15.

Manning, S., 1993. *Ecstasy and the demon: feminism and nationalism in the dances of Mary Wigman*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Martin, R., 1997. Dance ethnography and the limits of representation. In: J. Desmond, ed. *Meaning in motion: new cultural studies of dance*. Durham, NC & London: Duke University Press. pp.321–344.

Müller, H., 1986. *Mary Wigman: leben und werk der großen tänzerin*. Weinheim: Quadriga Verlag.

Reed, S., 1998. The politics and poetics of dance. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 27, pp.503–532.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1146/annurev.anthro.27.1.503>.

Reynolds, D., 2007. *Rhythmic subjects: uses of energy in the dances of Mary Wigman, Martha Graham and Merce Cunningham*. Alton: Dance Books.

Said, E., 1978. *Orientalism*. London: Penguin.

Said, E., 1989. Representing the colonized: anthropology interlocutors. *Critical Inquiry*, 15(2), pp.205–225. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/448481>.

Said, E., 1993. *Culture and Imperialism*. London: Vintage.

Schechner, R. and Appel, W. eds., 1990. *By means of performance: intercultural studies of theatre and ritual*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Scheyer, E., 1970. *The shapes of space: the art of Mary Wigman and Oskar Schlemmer*. New York: Dance Perspectives.

Schumann, W., 1931. *As Mary Wigman Dances*. Theatre Guild Magazine.

Taxidou, O., 2007. *Modernism and performance: Jarry to Brecht*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Toepfer, K., 1997. *Empire of ecstasy: nudity and movement in German body culture 1910–1935*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Tomko, J. L., 2004. Considering causation and conditions of possibility: practitioners and patrons of new dance in progressive-era America. In: A. Carter, ed. *Rethinking dance history: a reader*. London: Routledge. pp.80–93.

Van Krieken, R., 1989. Violence, self-discipline and modernity: beyond the civilising process. *Sociological Review*, 37, pp.193–218. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-954x.1989.tb00027.x>.

Van Krieken, R., 2005. Occidental self understanding and the Elias Duerr dispute: ‘thick’ versus ‘thin’ conceptions of human subjectivity and civilization. *Modern Greek Studies*, 13, pp.273–281.

Wigman, M., 1966. *The language of dance*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.

About the authors

DR LITO TSITSOU is a former dancer and currently a Researcher and a Teaching Assistant at the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow. She obtained her PhD from the University of Glasgow during which she examined the social and aesthetic conditions of possibility of Ballet and Contemporary Dance Production drawing on historical material from the West and on an empirical comparative investigation of dance in Greece and the UK. Lito focused on the class origins of dance practitioners, phenomena of institutional power and aesthetic tensions as interwoven in the politics of dance in different social contexts. Her current interests revolve around the making of the dancing body, disability and dance, and the Social Theory of Pierre Bourdieu.

DR LUCY WEIR obtained her PhD in History of Art and Theatre Studies from the University of Glasgow. Specialising in modern dance and performance studies, her research interests include experimental theatre practices, Viennese Actionism, and Japanese postwar performance. Lucy regularly gives public talks on the history of art and dance, and lectures on a variety of subject areas within art history and dance studies at the University of Glasgow and the Glasgow School of Art.

Developing professional equality: an analysis of a social movement in the Scottish dance industry

HOLLY PATRICK & CAROLINE BOWDITCH

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.05

Publication date: 13 December 2013

This article analyses the growth of professional equality in the Scottish dance industry. It defines the growth of professional equality as a social movement driven by a group of core and peripheral individuals and organisations bound together by a shared cause. Through defining professional equality as a social movement, the article analyses the challenges, strategies and contextual factors that enabled the emergence of Scotland as a 'hotspot' for disabled dancers. The data used in this article is an autoethnographic account of professional equality co-produced by the first author (as interrogator) and the second author (as autoethnographer). Using the autoethnographic method allows us to address the development of professional equality 'from within' the movement and to highlight three key factors that drive the movement forward: the genesis of the professional equality movement within the dance industry (rather than outside it); informal networks, which secure information sharing and collective advocacy across the sector; and the institutional characteristics of the industry, in particular the lack of a national disability arts organisation.

Keywords: dance industry, professional equality, social movements, autoethnography

Introduction

In July 2013 the British Council conducted a 'study visit' to Scotland to learn more about how and why Scotland is leading the way in the development of equality in the performing arts. The visit was part of the British Council's Unlimited Access programme that looks at how countries throughout Europe can be working with, and presenting more work created by, disabled and deaf artists. Twenty-five representatives from twelve countries were present in Edinburgh to engage in dialogue with representatives from funding bodies, training institutions, arts organisations and venues, as well as independent artists, based in Scotland. These representatives had one thing in common: they were in some way involved in the promotion of a 'professional equality' agenda across the dance profession. Their agenda has been boosted in the past five years as different groups and individuals from across the industry have united to lobby for equal educational and employment opportunities for dancers with disabilities. The British Council visit represents the most recent milestone of a series of connected efforts by a group of protagonists to achieve commitments to professional equality from organisations across the sector. A change of focus to an equalities agenda by Scotland's main arts funding body (Creative Scotland), several determined leaders within well-respected arts organisations, and a few driven individuals has led to a change in Scotland's artistic landscape in relation to the work of, by, and with disabled artists. The British Council visit may be seen to consecrate the status of the Scottish professional dance sector as a pioneer in ensuring equality for dancers of all (dis)abilities.

Well-developed bodies of literature exist in the areas of dance performance and disability, and dance education and disability. These literatures focus on issues which are central to the need for, and growth of, professional equality. As Albright (1997, p.56) argues, 'as an expressive discourse comprised of physical movement, dance has traditionally

privileged the able bodied'. Studies in these areas have dealt with issues such as how disability is performed (Kuppers, 2001; 2003), how viewers and screen media construct disability in dance (Whatley, 2007; 2010), how perceptions related to disability and dance emerge at early stages of dance education (Zitomer and Reid, 2011), and how change might be achieved (Elin and Boswell, 2004; Schwyzer, 2005). In contrast, our article adopts an organisational perspective on the issue of professional equality by considering it to be a social movement. In so doing we seek to advance understanding of which organisational characteristics of the professional equality movement have contributed to its success.

This article charts and analyses the professional equality movement, which seeks to achieve equality between disabled and able-bodied dancers in Scotland, through analysing an 'insider's' account of the movement. We firstly introduce the context of professional equality in the Scottish dance industry, before outlining our research methods and presenting our autoethnographic account of the growth of the movement, which forms the basis of our discussion concerning the key factors driving professional equality as a social movement. We expect this paper may be of interest to scholars concerned with social movements in the performing arts, as a reflective piece for those involved in the movement, and as an example to those looking to drive forward equality in other performing arts or geographical areas.

Context: equality and the dance industry

The Scottish dance industry is relatively small compared to dance industries in other European nations. Scotland has two full-time, permanently publicly funded, dance performance companies: Scottish Ballet and Scottish Dance

Theatre, which produce work in the ballet and contemporary genres respectively. Scottish Ballet is based in Glasgow and is funded directly by the Scottish Government; Scottish Dance Theatre is based in Dundee and receives long-term funding from the national arts funding body, Creative Scotland. Aside from these permanent companies, there is a vibrant scene of independent companies and choreographers, particularly in Glasgow and, to a lesser extent, Edinburgh. These independent companies and choreographers are supported by a network of publicly funded dance centres (such as Dance Base, Citymoves and Dance House) which provide an education, production, rehearsal and performance infrastructure. There is also a wide range of organisations which use dance as both a performance medium and as a source of social engagement, recreation and education, such as Indepen-Dance. However, the growth of dance as an art form in Scotland is constrained because of the lack of dance in the secondary education curriculum (Creative Scotland Corporate Report, 2011). In response to this, YDance (the dance development agency for young people in Scotland) was given greater support to further develop youth dance education, participation and talent development. The opportunities for the education of professional dancers beyond school-level are limited by the existence of only one vocational performing arts institution in Scotland—the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, which offers courses in Modern Ballet and Musical Theatre—although several further education colleges across the country offer Higher National Diploma (HND), Higher National Certificate (HNC) and BA courses in dance.

There are no exclusively ‘disabled dance’ professional performance companies in Scotland. However some companies, such as plan B, engage with disabled performers across theatre and dance, and other professional companies, such as Scottish Dance Theatre, feature disabled dancers in their repertoires. As part of a

review of disability dance in 2007, Jo Verrent (2007, p.3) wrote that '[w]ithin Scotland, disability dance clearly has significance'. In this report, Verrent highlights the diversity of participatory opportunities for disabled dancers, but also the lack of 'stepping stones' to enable these dancers to progress into vocational (professional) dance. Her report contains twelve recommendations for the development of disabled dance in Scotland, centring on the sharing of information and best practice, creating opportunities for critical debate, strategic use of funding to support opportunities for disabled dancers, and increased audience and performance research. Finally, the report recommends that the national arts funding body should take an active role in advocating for the involvement of disabled dancers in dance training. Many of these recommendations have been put into practice by those in the industry, as is illustrated in the autoethnographic data presented below.

Professional equality is, on the one hand, an ideological notion based on the belief that all dancers should have access to equal professional opportunities regardless of any disabilities. On the other hand, professional equality is a response to the practical consequences of professional *inequality*. While there are many practical consequences of inequality in the dance profession, two main issues can be identified. First, the inequality of access to professional opportunities faced by disabled dancers reinforces the tendency of those in the industry to consider 'disabled' and 'mainstream' dance as mutually exclusive genres. Second, such inequalities reinforce cultural notions of corporeal exclusivity in the audiences of dance productions.

Professional equality challenges the notions of 'functional separateness' which label 'disabled dance' a separate genre from the mainstream (Brueggemann, 2005). 'Functional separateness' refers to the ideas that disabled dance and mainstream dance are performances of different types,

produced for different types of audiences. The tendency to segregate 'disabled dance' places the disability of the performer, rather than the artistic quality of the piece, as the central feature of any performance in disabled dance. This feature of professional inequality is endemic to many areas of the performing arts, as the quote below from Smith (2005, p.76) argues:

The history of the dominant Western theater [*sic*] dance tradition has reflected a particularly pervasive social coding of the body that enforces a corporeal hierarchy serving to invalidate differentiated, heterogenous, and physically impaired bodies.

Professional equality is important in addressing unacknowledged assumptions of appropriateness held by dance audiences. Smith argues that notions of 'corporeal exclusivity', the idea that there is a single correct form of the body and of movement, are common across Western performance art traditions. This is a powerful discourse, which defines notions of appropriateness across performance art, and excludes performers who do not conform to the prescribed form. Sandahl and Auslander (2005, p.69) argue that excluding non-normative bodies from the stage may reinforce the ideological commitments of artists and audiences related to 'what a body should be, what kinds of bodies are appropriate to display in performance, what constitutes performance skill and "good" theatre and dance, and so on'.

Addressing these notions of corporeal exclusivity is important because these presuppositions do not emerge only in the performance environment but are carried into other areas of the social world. Shakespeare (2004) argues that portrayals of disability in cultural products (particularly, in his case, literature) inform and shape people's perceptions of disabilities and disabled people in

everyday life. He draws particular attention to not only the tendency to the 'other' in historical literature (defining the character by their disability, rather than by their attributes) but also the tendency for villains to possess some form of impairment; even the Bible extensively uses disability as a symbolic identifier. This position is supported by authors such as Barnes (1992), who argues that stereotypes of disability across popular culture contribute to broader discrimination. He argues that these stereotypes 'form the bedrock on which the attitudes towards, assumptions about and expectations of disabled people are based' (Barnes, 1992, p.39).

The importance of professional equality is therefore grounded in the basic ideology of equality, in the erosion of the distinction between 'disabled' and 'mainstream' dance, and also in the necessity of presenting positive (and representative) cultural representations of the public at large in dance. However, despite these factors, the protagonists of the movement struggle to have professional equality recognised as an institutional value. As Stephen Philip's (2001) comment piece from *The Guardian* indicates, there was a historical perception that many arts institutions were reticent to adopt a substantive approach to dealing with issues of disability and equal opportunities:

[M]any arts institutions seem to place more resources into presenting a shiny smiley package of equal opportunity proposals and monitoring forms than they do in actually implementing radical new practices.

The struggle for professional equality is partly resource-based (as some venues cannot afford the upgrades necessary to make their performance spaces accessible), but it is also largely a fight to change normative assumptions. The ability of arts organisations to make a proactive approach to professional equality can be

complicated by the role of critics, who exert considerable normative authority in the arts. Smith (2005) provides an account of critics' reviews of performances by Candoco, one of the first dance organisations in the United Kingdom to actively push disabled performers into mainstream repertoires. These 'conservative pronouncements from within the outmoded citadels of "high" art' (Smith, 2005, p.75) embody, for Smith, the urge of the establishment to reinforce the segregation between 'disabled' and 'mainstream' dance. Even more concerning, reviews of these performances, as shown by the 1999 review of a performance by Candoco by Michael Scott of *The Vancouver Sun*, reproduced below (from Smith, 2005, p.80), can embrace and project an image of the non-normative body which is exceedingly counter to the aims of the movement.

There is a horrific, Satyricon quality to CandoCo that heaves up in the chest—nausea at the moral rudderlessness of a world where we would pay money to watch a man whose body terminates at his ribcage, moving about on the stage on his hands.

Methodology

This research has been produced using the guidelines of 'emancipatory' research (Bowles and Klein, 1983) which aims to overcome patterns of bias in social science to generate 'awareness of the contradictions hidden or distorted by everyday understandings' and, in so doing, to direct 'attention to the possibilities for social transformation inherent in the present configuration of social processes' (Lather, 1989, p.259, quoted in Baker *et al.*, 2004, p.179). This methodological choice relates both to our reasons for undertaking this research, and to the specific choices we have made in data gathering and analysis. Recognising that no piece of social-scientific research can be considered

'value-free', we embrace a political purpose in writing this article. By discussing the evolution of the equality agenda in the Scottish dance sector, we aim to both strengthen this movement and to provide guidance to those attempting to incite a similar movement in a different industrial or geographic context. Similarly, in our research design, we have sought to emancipate our research from any 'othering' of disability or 'disabled people'. We utilise the terminology adopted by practitioners, 'professional equality', to stress not the differences between groups of people based on their physical abilities, but rather the basic equality of access to professional opportunities to which all are entitled. This is not to suggest that the material instances of discrimination which are faced by professional dancers are unimportant to this piece of research, but simply relates to the terminology we use to discuss the social movement.

The central source of data for this research is an autoethnographic account; produced by the second author of this article, a dance professional involved in the professional equality movement, and interrogated by the first author, an academic operating outside the movement. Autoethnography refers to a method which blends autobiography as a research technique with the practice of writing culture referred to as ethnography. In producing an autoethnography, a researcher already embedded in a particular culture adopts an ethnographic approach to interrogating their own experiences 'in the field'. Autoethnography is considered to be a highly fruitful research method because it enables linkages between the 'everyday, mundane aspects of organizational life with that of broader political and strategic organizational agendas and practice' (Boyle and Parry, 2007, p.186). By basing our paper on an autoethnographic account of the professional equality movement, we seek to expose the features of this movement which would be less clearly understood by studying the movement from an external perspective.

The autoethnographic account formed the basis of a series of discussions between the two authors concerning the growth of professional equality in the dance industry. As these discussions developed to consider professional equality as a 'social movement' the data pool was expanded to consider industry reports (such as Verrent, 2007 and Creative Scotland's Corporate Plan, 2011), and we began to critique our data in the light of the literature on social movements. As such, the data presented below is an autoethnographic account of the time during which professional equality was identified as a social movement (to the present day), rather than a complete account of our data.

Together, the emancipatory methodology and autoethnographic method mobilised in this study allow us to understand the development of the professional equality movement from 'within', rather than outside, the process (Shotter, 1996). The autoethnographic account produced in this article was refined during iterative periods of reflection and 'writing culture' (on the part of the second author) and interrogation based on emergent theory (by the first author). As such, the account presented below is not a raw presentation of 'field notes' but an account of the professional equality movement in Scotland co-produced through discussion (Kempster and Stewart, 2010).

What is so special about Scotland?

This section presents the autoethnographic account produced by the practitioner co-author, Caroline Bowditch, in which she voices her reflections on the development of the professional equality movement.

█ In 2004, Janet Smith, then Artistic Director of Scottish

Dance Theatre (SDT), attended a seminar for arts organisations, led by Jo Verrent, that highlighted the introduction of Public Duty Legislation—legislation that requires services provided by public bodies to be accessible. Whilst many organisations saw this legislation as a huge inconvenience, Janet saw it as a major opportunity; she saw it as a chance to ask herself questions, go on new artistic adventures, and challenge the aesthetic that had been most familiar to her. In 2005 she invited Adam Benjamin, co-founder of Candoco Dance Company, and four disabled dancers to participate in a week-long research and development programme with SDT in Edinburgh. After putting out a call for disabled dancers, it soon became evident that there were none in Scotland with the level of performance experience or training that Janet was seeking, requiring her to cast her net wider. She then attracted Dan Daw from Australia, Cornelia Kip Lee from the USA, Michael King from Yorkshire, UK, and me, Caroline Bowditch, originally from Australia but then based in Newcastle, UK.

Following possibly the most challenging creative week I'd ever had, Janet asked me: 'If we were able to secure the funding would you come and dance and tour with us for a season?' This was something I'd only dreamt of. I started to question myself; 'would I?', or more like, 'could I?'. I was thirty-two—wasn't I a bit late to be starting my dance career? Most dancers are retiring by now aren't they? Could my body—which has had only the sporadic dance opportunities available to most disabled dancers, and the absence of a technique that works for me—actually do this? Professional class everyday, up to six shows a week, touring... could I do it? Of course I said 'yes' and have never regretted it for a moment, but it did prompt lots of internal questions.

Late in 2006 I got the call from SDT inviting me to join the

company for Spring 2007 when we worked with Adam Benjamin to make *Angels of Incidence* which toured throughout the UK and Ireland. As the tour was progressing, I began to realise the significance of what Janet had done. SDT were a mainstream dance company that, for a season, just happened to include disabled dancers. Audiences, who may not necessarily have come to a performance labelled as 'inclusive' dance, came to see the work. Janet was completely challenging the usual SDT aesthetic by including us in the mix and this felt significant.

The tour concluded and I returned to Newcastle unsure of what to do next. This had been a life-altering experience for me and I didn't feel I could go back to just sporadic opportunities—I wanted more. I started to approach other mainstream companies that were auditioning only to discover they weren't ready for either me or this conversation. I also felt SDT somehow needed to document its learning from this time: What happened? What did we learn? What would we do different next time? Somehow I wanted to gather up all the strands from this adventure in a way that they could be passed to other dance companies which might be brave enough to dip their toe in the water.

In Autumn 2007, I met with Janet and Amanda Chinn, SDT's General Manager, to discuss the possibility of doing some sort of evaluation of the *Angels* project. They both acknowledged that there was something more significant that SDT could do, and the industry more broadly; the idea of the Dance Agent for Change role was born.

From 2008 to 2010, the Scottish Arts Council (SAC)—which has since been superseded as Scotland's national arts funding body by Creative Scotland—employed an Equalities Officer, Robert Softley Gale, who had a focus on arts and disability. His role allowed equality, particularly in relation to arts and disability, to become central to the

organisation and the planning, development and delivery of programmes and funding streams at the Scottish Arts Council.

Between 2008 and 2010 several projects significant to the embedding of professional equality took place across the industry. Firstly, Claire Cunningham, a disabled performance artist and choreographer, was offered a significant bursary from SAC's Equalities budget to carry out professional development over several years. Claire was able to explore dance techniques that worked for her body and developed significant professional work that has toured extensively throughout the UK, Europe, Brazil and the Middle East, mostly as part of mainstream dance festivals. Secondly, Scottish Dance Theatre created, and appointed me to, the post of Dance Agent for Change (DAFC) which had five main aims:

1. To increase the number of disabled people involved in dance in Scotland.
2. To increase confidence of people delivering dance in Scotland to everyone, making dance more accessible.
3. To explore the possibility of breaking new artistic ground in dance with integration at the forefront.
4. To offer an integrated creative learning programme which educates, inspires, informs and expands horizons.
5. To map out a path for the future of integrated dance in Scotland.

Throughout the four years as the DAFC, I had contact with over 25,000 people including audiences, workshop participants and those present at presentations or training sessions. Many of these interactions were with people who had never had any contact with integrated or inclusive

dance before. The role also instigated the establishing of the Creative Thinking Network (CTN). The purpose of the CTN was, and still is, to bring together arts practitioners and organisations from all over Scotland four times a year to network, exchange information and potentially develop new collaborations. The CTN continues to be successful in this role, with over 60 members, and is the one element of my DAFC role that Creative Scotland continues to fund.

When Creative Scotland was launched in 2010 it made the following commitment:

We will adopt a mainstreaming approach by embedding equality throughout all our programmes, considering the potential impacts on equality of our policies and our relations with cultural organisations (Creative Scotland Corporate Report, 2011).

Commitment to equality in such a blanket way at such a high level is unique to Scotland. Scotland is also one of the few countries that doesn't have a disability arts organisation and therefore equality is centralised rather than being palmed off to a 'specialised' organisation. So, equality is valued, central and seen as important. There is a long-term and on-going investment in, and commitment to, developing and retaining disabled artists in Scotland. There is also an expectation from funders like Creative Scotland that equality is on the agendas of arts organisations where it would usually be absent.

I believe this commitment has generally increased the awareness of work by disabled artists and organisations working with disabled people in Scotland. Work with disabled artists is now seen as a new development opportunity; professional disabled artists are now sought-after in Scotland as collaborators, makers and performers.

Innovative creative projects have been generated and new artistic ground has been explored as a result. What remains an ongoing challenge is finding the next generation of disabled artists and locating disabled people with whom to engage in projects and develop their talent. Disabled people have been absent from the stage for so long that convincing them that they belong on a stage or in a dance studio is still difficult. The cultural change still needed is significant but progress has been made in the last few years. The embedding of equality throughout the Scottish arts scene makes it unique and attractive, and gives Scotland the reputation of being a 'hotspot' for disabled artists.

Discussion: *professional equality as a social movement*

A social movement can be defined as a 'sustained series of challenges by groups of people against those who have power over them, using a wide range of conventional and unconventional actions and of formal and informal organisations' (Baker *et al.*, 2004, p.193). In analysing professional equality as a social movement, we might then ask the following questions: Who are those with and without power? What are the series of challenges that characterise the movement? And finally, what are the formal and informal organisations involved?

In the case of professional equality, those without power are not only the professional disabled dancers who have personally experienced discrimination, the core protagonists, but also a wider group of protagonists we term 'passionate advocates'. These passionate advocates might be connected to the core protagonists through professional association (for instance, as colleagues) or through a connection to the broader cause of equality (such as the

members of the Creative Thinking Network). The issue of which individuals or organisations possess power over the core protagonists is more complex. It is clear from the autoethnographic data above that inequality in the provision of education and employment opportunities is secured at both the organisational and institutional levels. At the organisational level, individual dance theatres may not provide opportunities to disabled dancers, whether consciously or not. Similarly, individual venues might discriminate against disabled dancers through not providing appropriate facilities.

However, the provision of opportunities by these individual organisations may be considered to be, to some extent, determined by the national arts funding body; that is, at the institutional level. As Meyer and Rowan (1977) argue, organisations are likely to conform to the structures, beliefs and approaches favoured by powerful organisations in their institutional environments. This process is termed 'mimetic isomorphism' and has been widely empirically identified by scholars of organisational studies (Boxenbaum and Jonsson, 2008) and specifically in creative industries such as dance (Alvarez *et al.*, 2005). Not only is the ability of individual organisations to support professional equality determined by the funding made available (or not) to them by the national arts funding body, but processes of mimetic isomorphism are also likely to influence their activities. This is reflected in the autoethnographic account when Caroline reflects on the effects of Creative Scotland's commitment to equality. If a national arts organisation, such as Creative Scotland, espouses professional equality as an organisational priority, then so will those organisations which rely upon its approval. Although Creative Scotland has less direct involvement with the core protagonists, they are arguably the most important organisation in realising the goal of professional equality.

The second key issue in describing professional equality as a social movement is: what are the series of challenges which characterise the movement? For the purposes of simplicity, we regard all pro-equality interventions by our core protagonists as 'challenges' and all pro-equality interventions by those 'in power' (such as the national arts funding body) as 'achievements'. Because the actions of the national arts funding body are likely to have much more direct effect upon the practices of the sector than the actions of an individual protagonist (due to the effects of mimetic isomorphism), it would be confusing to label these as 'challenges'.

The 'achievements' of the social movement tell us something about the efficacy of different types of 'challenges' to the embedding of professional equality in dance. Robert Softley Gale's appointment as Equalities Officer at the Scottish Arts Council was an important achievement for the movement. However, a long string of grassroots activity, which was featured in Verrent's (2007) *Dance and Disability* report, also facilitated this appointment. The growth in artistic activities using disabled dancers, for example the activities of SDT highlighted in the autoethnographic account, is key to understanding how the need for equality arose from practical interventions within the sector, rather than as an externally-imposed ideological imperative (that is, because equality is right). The success of Claire Cunningham's interventions arises from her position as an established professional dancer, not primarily from her being funded by the Scottish Arts Council to expand her repertoire, and the success of Caroline's advocacy in the sector is partly secured through her being a practising member of the professional dance community. These activities represent the challenges which promote professional equality in the sector and, importantly, from the sector. Although the intervention of the national arts funding body (through appointing Softley Gale) might be seen to be strategically-led, the strategic imperative of

equality (which was later embraced by Creative Scotland) originates from within, not outwith, the dance sector.

The success of these challenges is also due to their being couched in artistic practice. The appointment of Caroline as the Dance Agent for Change shows how a challenge based on artistic practice (rather than on other activities, such as advocacy) is the genesis for a large achievement (having the DAFC post funded by the national arts funding body). According to Verrent's report, in 2007 the senior management at Scottish Dance Theatre reported that their engagement with disabled dancers in producing *Angels of Incidence* (choreographed by Candoco's Adam Benjamin) made them 'wish to develop further work utilising disabled dancers in the future' (Verrent, 2007, p.9). This artistic collaboration spawned a series of conversations which resulted in the company and Caroline collaboratively writing a funding application to the Scottish Arts Council, and creating the DAFC post. Furthermore, throughout her time as DAFC, Caroline engaged in a multiplicity of advocacy practices (from workshops to lectures to networking) but continued to develop her artistic practice and opportunities which enabled her to spread further fruitful artistic partnerships (such as that with SDT) whilst also growing her legitimacy as a performing artist. Through this artistic legitimacy, Caroline had the symbolic position to act as a more effective leader in the dance field. This highlights a further characteristic of the professional equality movement; the importance of informal networks in articulating the practical implications of professional inequality and co-ordinating challenges. The Creative Thinking Network, which initially served as a steering group for the DAFC role, developed into a productive forum for information sharing and collective advocacy. Many of the professionals involved in the professional equality movement are, or have been, members of the CTN.

This brings us to the final question regarding professional equality as a social movement; what are the formal and informal organisations involved? The CTN can be considered one of the most significant informal organisations in the professional equality movement in Scotland. In terms of formal organisations, Scottish Dance Theatre has clearly played a large role in advocating for professional equality through artistic channels. Being one of the only two professional full-time companies in Scotland, SDT's artistic endeavours with professional disabled dancers, and their DAFC role, can both be considered significant in setting an example and in providing material opportunities for disabled dancers. Finally, the role of the national arts funding body (Scottish Arts Council pre-2010, Creative Scotland post-2010) and the lack of a national disability arts organisation is highlighted as an important factor in driving forward professional equality. The lack of a disability arts organisation is highlighted as a key factor in 'mainstreaming' the issue of disability in the arts, and ensuring that it isn't 'palmed off' to an organisation without significant influence not only on professional dance companies, but on the Scottish arts sector as a whole. The importance of mimetic isomorphism, as previously identified, is key to the ability of Creative Scotland (and previously the Scottish Arts Council) to 'lead by example' in not only espousing professional equality as an institutional value, but actively supporting the development of disabled artists (such as by funding Claire Cunningham).

Conclusion

Baker *et al.* (2004) argue that the key organisational task for any social movement must be to strengthen the network of groups and organizations with broadly egalitarian aims. We have considered in this article how a social movement emerged in the Scottish dance industry, and we have explored the reasons for the success of this movement in

establishing professional equality as an institutional value. Our analysis, drawn from an autoethnographic account authored by a key figure in the movement, highlights three key success factors: first, the genesis of the professional equality movement within the dance industry (rather than outside it) and leadership through artistic practice emerged as a key success factor for the movement. Professional performances including disabled artists enable professionals across the industry to comprehend that professional equality has tangible artistic benefits. Furthermore, when disabled performers are given the role of professional artist (rather than advocate), the inclusion of disabled dancers becomes an artistic choice rather than an ideological one. Second, informal networks, in particular the Creative Thinking Network, have proved an enduring mechanism for securing information sharing and collective advocacy in a sector which is both geographically and artistically diverse. Third, the particular institutional characteristics of the industry are a key factor: the lack of a national disability arts organisation means that the issue of professional equality is embraced by the central arts funding agency. This agency holds significant symbolic power in determining the values of cultural organisations across Scotland. Therefore, having professional equality consecrated as a core value of Creative Scotland was an important achievement for the Scottish dance movement, and may prove to be important for the greater Scottish arts sector.

This research was funded as part of the ESRC Capacity Building Cluster, 'Capitalising on Creativity', grant #RES 187-24-0014.

References

Albright, A. C., 1997. *Choreographing difference: the body and identity in contemporary dance*. Hanover: Wesleyan University Press.

Alvarez, J. L., Mazza, C., Pedersen, J. S. and Svejenova, S., 2005. Shielding idiosyncrasy from isomorphic pressures: towards optimal distinctiveness in European filmmaking. *Organization*, 12(6), pp.863–888. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1350508405057474>.

Baker, J., Lynch, K., Cantillon, S. and Walsh, J. eds., 2004. *Equality: from theory to action*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Barnes, C. 1992. *Disabling imagery and the media: an exploration of the principles for media representations of disabled people*. London: BCODP.

Bowles, G. and Klein, R. D., 1983. *Theories of women's studies*. Abingdon: Routledge & Kegan Paul.

Boxenbaum, E. and Jonsson, S., 2008. Isomorphism, diffusion and decoupling. In: R. Greenwood, C. Oliver, K. Sahlin-Andersson and R. Suddaby, eds. *The Sage Handbook of Organizational Institutionalism*, London: Sage. pp.78–98.

Boyle, M. and Parry, K., 2007. Telling the whole story: the case for organizational autoethnography. *Culture and Organization*, 13(3), pp.185–190. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14759550701486480>.

Brueggemann, B. J., 2005. Delivering disability, willing speech. In: C. Sandahl and P. Auslander, eds. *Bodies in commotion: disability and performance*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press. pp.17–29.

Creative Scotland, 2011. Investing in Scotland's creative future: corporate plan 2011-2014. [online]. Available at: <http://www.creativescotland.com/resources/our-publications/corporate-plan> [Accessed 15 November 2013].

Elin, J. and Boswell, B., 2004. *Re-envisioning dance: perceiving the aesthetics of disability*. Dubuque, IA: Kendall Hunt Publishing.

Kempster, S. and Stewart, J., 2010. Becoming a leader: a co-produced autoethnographic exploration of situated learning of leadership practice. *Management Learning*, 41(2), pp.205–219. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1350507609355496>.

Kuppers, P., 2001. Deconstructing images: performing disability. *Contemporary Theatre Review*, 11(3/4), pp.25–40. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10486800108568636>.

Kuppers, P., 2003. *Disability and contemporary performance: bodies on the edge*. London: Routledge.

Meyer, J. W. and Rowan, B., 1977. Institutionalized organizations: formal structure as myth and ceremony. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 83(2), pp.340–363. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/226550>.

Philip, S., 2001. Thinking of equality. The Guardian, [online] 8 December. Available at: <http://www.theguardian.com/culture/2001/dec/08/artsforall.artanddesign1> [Accessed 15 October 2013].

Sandahl, C. and Auslander, P., 2009. *Bodies in commotion: disability and performance*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.

Shakespeare, T., 1994. Cultural representation of disabled people: dustbins for disavowal? *Disability and Society*, 9(3), pp.283–299. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09687599466780341>.

Schwyzler, E., 2005. Laying the foundations for change. *Dance Theatre Journal*, 21(1), pp.6–8.

Smith, O., 2005. Shifting Apollo's frame: challenging the body aesthetic in theater dance. In: C. Sandahl and P. Auslander, eds. *Bodies in commotion: disability and performance*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press. pp.73–85.

Verrent, J., 2007. *Dance and disability in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Arts Council.

Whatley, S., 2007. Dance and disability: the dancer, the viewer and the presumption of difference. *Research in Dance Education*, 8(1), pp.5–25. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14647890701272639>.

Whatley, S., 2010. The spectacle of difference: dance and disability on screen. *The International Journal of Screendance*, 1(1), pp. 41–53.

Zitomer, M. and Reid, G., 2011. To be or not to be—able to dance: integrated dance and children's perceptions of dance ability and disability. *Research in Dance Education*, 12(2), pp.137–156.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14647893.2011.575224>.

About the authors

HOLLY PATRICK recently graduated with a PhD in Management from the University of St Andrews. Her thesis was an ethnography of organisational legitimacy in a Scottish theatre. She is currently an Honorary Associate at the University of Technology, Sydney. Her current research interests lie in the intersection between organisation theory and the study of creative and cultural industries.

Australian-born but now Glasgow-based performance artist and choreographer CAROLINE BOWDITCH describes herself as a performer, maker, teacher, speaker and mosquito buzzing in the ears of the arts industry in the UK and further afield. She is currently Associate Artist at Dance 4 (Nottingham), where she is working on a new project called *Falling in love with Frida*, and Artist in Association with Paragon Music (Glasgow), where she choreographed *Torque*. From February to June 2013, Caroline was Visiting Artist at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland where she worked with the 2nd Year Contemporary Performance Practice students. She was commissioned by East London Dance (ELD) to create a new work for dancers from Candoco Dance Company as part of ELD's 25th anniversary celebration. She has just returned from working as a consultant with Skånes Dansteater (Sweden), increasing their thinking and capacity in relation to accessibility and inclusivity.

The making of performance: stories of performing physicalities

SYMPOSIUM ABSTRACTS:

ANDRIA CHRISTOFIDOU & LITO TSITSOU,
ANNA BIRCH, SIMON MURRAY, BETHANY WHITESIDE,
LITO TSITSOU & LUCY WEIR, RAMSAY BURT,
ROMANY DEAR & DOMINIC PATERSON

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.06

Publication date: 13 December 2013

The making of performance: stories of performing physicalities

Saturday 22nd June 2013

Gilbert Scott Conference Suite Room, Main Building,
University of Glasgow

Funded by The RLI Fund from the College of Social Sciences,
University of Glasgow

The making of performance: stories of performing physicalities *was a symposium organised by Andria Christofidou (PhD Candidate, Sociology, University of Glasgow) and Dr Lito Tsitsou (Teaching Assistant in Sociology and Research Methods and Research Assistant in the Strathclyde Centre for Disability, School of Social and Political Sciences, University of Glasgow) in an effort to establish a network of academics and practitioners with sociological interest in theatrical and/or physical performance in Scotland. As such, the event brought together people from different (academic) backgrounds and disciplines and engaged them in an interdisciplinary dialogue about social and sociological aspects of physical performance and experience, drawing on historical, theoretical and empirical material. The event, which took place on 22nd June 2013 at the University of Glasgow, comprised two parts: a series of presentations and discussions that looked at physical performance from both*

historical and empirical perspectives and a panel discussion on methodology in physical performance research.

The organisers invited eight speakers to discuss their work: Dr Anna Birch discussed the relationship between gender and archiving performance; Professor Ramsay Burt looked at black dance production in twentieth century Britain; Dr Simon Murray discussed the usefulness of Raymond William's concept 'structure of feeling' for Theatre Studies; Romany Dear and Dr Dominic Paterson presented a paper based on their shared experience of participating in Yvonne Rainer's workshop; Dr Lito Tsitsou and Dr Lucy Weir looked at Mary Wigman's work Hexentanz (I and II) as an Oriental piece that marked the making of modern dance more widely, and a modern dance that would later be considered 'German'; and finally, Bethany Whiteside discussed findings from her study on 'Scottishness' and Highland Dancing.

The second part of the symposium included a discussion of methodological issues emerging from the study of physical performance. Speakers and audience discussed issues such as ethical research practice, the validity of historical sources and dealing with source contradictions, the politics of performance, spectatorship and embodiment.

ANDRIA CHRISTOFIDOU & DR LITO TSITSOU

ANNA BIRCH

Not the final word...

Drawing on current debates around what constitutes an archive and how performance can be understood as a feature of the archive itself, this short presentation will examine the role of the body as an archival artefact. Central issues of inclusion and exclusion in the archive and how

selected archives can be re-activated and made accessible to a new audience will be discussed. Building on the work of Fragments & Monuments—(founded in 1998 by myself and scenographer Madelon Schwartz)—some strategies will be shared arising from my practice as research. Film and performance are employed as an iterative methodology to investigate physicality and gender in particular performance case studies and through a multimodal (Hodge and Kress 1988; van Leeuwen and Jewitt 2001; 2002) architecture spanning live performance, film, projection, broadcast, gallery installation and publication. A range of strategies for engaging with the performance archive have emerged; for example the projection of the live performance onto the site where the original performance took place one year later and uploading ‘strips’ of this video footage for performance research analysis (Birch 2004; 2006; 2007). This research will form the basis of a contribution that discusses in part how embodied vocabularies may be shown to develop a dialogue with texts that are generally ascribed more value.

DR ANNA BIRCH is Artistic Director and founder member of Fragments & Monuments performance and film company and currently Lecturer, Research at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland in Glasgow where she supervises a number of PhD students. As a practice-led researcher, publications include co-editing ‘Site-specificity and mobility’, *Contemporary Theatre Review*, Vol. 22, Issue 2 (Routledge) and a collection entitled *Performing Site-specific Theatre: Politics, Place, Practice* which includes her latest essay ‘Repetition and performativity: site-specific performance and film as living monument’ (Palgrave, 2012) both with Professor Joanne Tompkins (University of Queensland, Australia).

SIMON MURRAY

Physical theatres as cultural production: structures of feeling and other lenses

One of the most notable features of contemporary Western theatre over the last three decades has been the ubiquity with which terms like ‘physical’, ‘corporeal’, ‘visual’ and ‘embodied’ have been claimed by, or ascribed to

performance companies, individual artists and the work they make. Physical theatre, although hugely imprecise and unclear about what it seeks to describe, has become a badge to indicate distance from the typical naturalistic conventions of the 'well-made play' on the one hand, and to suggest a risky, visceral and sometimes virtuosic display of performing bodies on the other. This paper will offer some reflections on the rise and rise of so-called physical theatres as cultural production, and consider how we might productively try to position these various forms of theatre within a wider social and cultural context. Suggestion will be made that Raymond Williams' term 'structures of feeling' offers a generative lens—a way of seeing—for critically reflecting upon this upsurge in physical and dance theatres.

DR SIMON MURRAY currently teaches Theatre Studies at the University of Glasgow. Previously he was Director of Theatre at Dartington College of Arts in Devon up to the moment of its closure and subsequent merger with University College Falmouth in 2008, and before that a professional performer and theatre maker working largely in the fields of devised visual and physical theatre. He is a sociologist 'by trade' and spent much of the '70s and early '80s working in adult and trade union education. He has published on Jacques Lecoq, on physical theatres, on lightness and, most recently, on the writings of WG Sebald and their relationship to contemporary performance. With Jonathan Pitches he is co-founder and co-editor of the Routledge journal *Theatre, Dance and Performance Training*.

BETHANY WHITESIDE

Dance then wherever you may be: perceptions of 'Scottishness' in Highland Dancing in Glasgow, Scotland

Highland Dancing is viewed as a form of dance and sport, as a link to the romantic past of Highland history, and as part of a rigid competitive structure regulated by official boards and associations. Despite or perhaps because of these conflicting states, Highland Dancing may first and foremost be defined by its 'Scottishness', a conceptual myriad of cultural, social and political identities located nationally, regionally and locally (Bairner 2001). A key performance

arena for Highland dancers is Highland Games, widely recognised as both a tourism and sporting event, and through its location within these arenas, Highland Dancing has become identified with a particular brand of nostalgic ‘Scottishness’—that of the ‘old country’—in Scotland and abroad. Relevant studies have tended to focus on Highland Games as a whole and on events taking place abroad (e.g. Chhabra *et al.*, 2003; Ray, 2001). In this paper, I draw on interviews and observations of Highland dancers at a private dance studio in Glasgow. Using the ‘thinking tools’ of Pierre Bourdieu, I explore why these dancers want to do Highland Dancing; how notions of ‘Scottishness’ inform their individual and collective dispositions; and how participation in Highland Dancing builds different but related kinds of cultural, social and physical capital.

My analysis suggests that, while Highland Dancing may be a vehicle for sustaining Scottish culture across the diaspora, within Scotland itself, dancers are more concerned with the social and physical aspects of the dance.

Following completion of her BA Hons in History in 2005, BETHANY WHITESIDE worked for a number of arts organisations in an education, marketing and project management capacity. In 2009 she joined the MSc Dance Science and Education programme at the University of Edinburgh, and in 2011 embarked on an ESRC CASE Studentship, supported by Capacity Building Cluster ‘Capitalising on Creativity’ grant N^oRES 187-24-0014, focusing on the sociology of participatory dance.

Since embarking on her PhD, Bethany has presented and published at national and international conferences and given guest lectures at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland and the University of Edinburgh. She is also co-editor of the *Scottish Journal of Performance*.

LITO TSITSOU & LUCY WEIR

***Hexentanz*: ritualism and the making of early modern ‘German’ dance**

This paper will discuss Mary Wigman’s *Hexentanz* (including the original 1914 choreography as well as the

better-known 1926 version), as a prominent example of a key social and aesthetic process manifested in dance in the first decades of the twentieth century; namely, the reversion to primitive forms as a means of devising a new, avant-garde creative practice. Freikörperkultur, the notion of naturist-inspired free body culture, was widely practised throughout Germany and the former Austro-Hungarian Empire, and in this paper we will focus on the example of the liberal colony at Ascona, Switzerland as part of a generalised phenomenon of ritualistic body culture. The concept of returning to nature and simplified healthy living was seen as an antidote to rapid capitalist modernisation of the West, and Germany in particular.

Wigman developed her conception of dance within this context, and *Hexentanz* therefore represents the first materialisation of a return to archaic cultural practices in her choreographic oeuvre. As we shall demonstrate, *Hexentanz II* drew on various elements of non-Western cultures and rituals, which both demonise and valorise the Orientalist 'Other'. However, as these influences became systematised into dance practice and technique, they paved the way for new conceptions of dance and movement; in the end, it is elements of this Orientalist 'Other' that formulate the basis of early twentieth century modern dance and modern dance produced in Germany developed as distinctively German. The ritual practices of the 'Other' are seen as primordial and acquire moral and aesthetic significance. However, as Edward Said would argue, they are utilised for the benefit of the West and German modern dance in particular. *Hexentanz II* (1926), as a work of dance devised in the post-war period, was produced under conditions of social discontent and experiences of alienation very much nurtured since the pre-war period. The witch's dance, as the name suggests, indicates a return to the 'primitive' ritual, which as we shall see is also linked both with the non-Western 'Other' and non-Western ritualism. This paper will provide a re-reading of Wigman's cultural

and ritualistic influences in devising a distinctly German, though Orientalist-inspired dance aesthetic.

DR LITO TSITSOU is a former dancer and currently a Researcher and a Teaching Assistant at the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow. She obtained her PhD from the University of Glasgow during which she examined the social and aesthetic conditions of possibility of Ballet and Contemporary Dance Production drawing on historical material from the West and on an empirical comparative investigation of dance in Greece and the UK. Lito focused on the class origins of dance practitioners, phenomena of institutional power and aesthetic tensions as interwoven in the politics of dance in different social contexts. Her current interests revolve around the making of the dancing body, disability and dance and the Social Theory of Pierre Bourdieu.

DR LUCY WEIR obtained her PhD in History of Art and Theatre Studies from the University of Glasgow. Specialising in modern dance and performance studies, her research interests include experimental theatre practices, Viennese Actionism, and Japanese postwar performance. Lucy regularly gives public talks on the History of Art and Dance, and lectures on a variety of subject areas within Art History and Dance Studies at the University of Glasgow and the Glasgow School of Art.

RAMSAY BURT

Dance Britannia! Black British dancers and the African Diaspora

The music and dance of African Diasporan artists has impacted upon current dance practice in Britain and their legacies are testament to the global circulation of artistic ideas. The migration of African Caribbean people to Britain in the 1940s and 1950s laid the foundation for a rich cultural tapestry which continues to influence British Dance today, yet is largely unrecognised. This paper discusses the British Dance and the African Diaspora research project which seeks to write Black British dance artists and their legacies back into history. It investigates the nexus of aesthetic, institutional and conceptual problems that have rendered these dancers invisible. A key factor, we believe, is the inadequacy of existing frameworks to provide a suitable basis for analysis. Drawing on concepts from Michel Foucault and Judith Butler and from post-colonial studies,

the aim of this paper is to investigate the ways in which institutional power is invested within this sector. It does so by focusing on the links between critical discourse and the effects of administrative decisions made by funding bodies.

PROFESSOR RAMSAY BURT is Professor of Dance History at De Montfort University, UK. His publications include *The Male Dancer* (1995, revised 2007), *Alien Bodies* (1997), *Judson Dance Theater* (2006), and, with Valerie Briginshaw, *Writing Dancing Together* (2009). In 1999 he was Visiting Professor at the Department of Performance Studies, New York University, and he is a visiting teacher at PARTS in Brussels. With Susan Foster, Ramsay Burt is founder editor of *Discourses in Dance*. With Christy Adair, he has run the AHRC-funded research project into British Dance and the African Diaspora.

ROMANY DEAR & DOMINIC PATERSON

Rehearsing war and performing memory: a collaborative response to Yvonne Rainer's dance workshop

Romany Dear and Dominic Paterson will present a collaborative response to their shared experience of participating in a dance workshop led by Yvonne Rainer in Glasgow in 2010. The workshop centred on the rehearsal of her 1970 work *WAR*, and this piece, along with the various iterations of Rainer's best-known dance work *Trio A*, is central to this presentation. Using Rainer's own performative lecture *Where's the Passion?* (2009) as a model for their reflections, Dear and Paterson explore the importance of repetitions, re-performances, de-framings and interruptions to the radical reworking of dance and its relationship to subjective expression.

ROMANY DEAR is an artist who graduated from the Environmental Art course at Glasgow School of Art in 2011 and continues to work and live in Glasgow. She has recently exhibited in *Dance is a Language That We Speak*, Intermedia Gallery, CCA, Glasgow, 2013; *Studio 58: Women Artists Since World War 2*, Mackintosh Gallery, Glasgow, 2012; and as part of *They Had Four Years*, Generator Gallery, Dundee, 2012. Romany also co-founded the organisation Glasgow Open Dance School with Julia Scott in 2012.

DR DOMINIC PATERSON is a writer and Lecturer in History of Art at the University of Glasgow. He has written widely on contemporary art, including recent texts on Christine Borland, Martin Soto Climent, Kate Davis, Lucy Gunning, Alex Impey, Scott Myles, Jimmy Robert, and Stina Wirfelt (amongst others). In 2012 he participated in the group exhibitions *Adaptation* at Collective, Edinburgh; *What We Have Done, What We Are About To Do*, CCA, Glasgow, and *Prawn's Pee*, The Old Hairdresser's, Glasgow.

Book review: *Our ancient national airs: Scottish song collecting from the Enlightenment to the Romantic era*, by Karen McAulay

ELAINE MOOHAN

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.07
Publication date: 13 December 2013

Our ancient national airs: Scottish song collecting from the Enlightenment to the Romantic era (Music in 19th-Century Britain) by Karen McAulay. Farnham: Ashgate, 2013; ISBN 9781409450191 (£60.00)

This book is based on McAulay's PhD thesis, although she takes advantage of a new medium to include some additional material. From the outset we are informed that this volume 'specifically focuses on song collections *with music*, rather than collections of words'. For historians of music this emphasis on musical collections is to be welcomed. McAulay takes a careful chronological approach to setting out her arguments, thus presenting the reader with a manageable amount of information in each chapter. Overall, the period under discussion is given as 1760–1888, defined by the activities of Patrick MacDonald and James Macpherson in the early years up to the death of William Chappell in 1888.

At the outset, we are introduced to three song collectors from the mid-seventeenth century, the MacDonald brothers, Joseph and Patrick, and James Macpherson, who are positioned clearly within the context and collectors' ethics of the day. The discussion focuses mainly on the actions of Macpherson in producing his collection of *Ossian* poetry, and includes a detailed investigation of the methods leading

to its creation, the fall-out of subsequent critical analysis, and the official inquiry by the Highland Society of Scotland.

Chapter 2 brings us to the collections of c.1780-1800, produced amid concerns that 'the songs were rapidly disappearing' and therefore required to be committed to print. There is a helpful tabular listing of the works to be considered in this chapter; a similar listing of inter-relations would have helped with Chapter 1. There is a detailed discussion of Robert Burns's contribution to the *Museum*, but there is a lack of examples illustrating the extent of his revisions and 'further sanitized' texts to help the reader appreciate his actions and their consequences. Having said this, students using this as a course book will find value in the survey of the different approaches towards the texts by, for example, James Johnson, whom we are told wished to preserve their Scottish flavour, and George Thomson, who opted for Anglicising the poetry. McAulay compares these with Joseph Ritson's apparent eagerness to record the song repertory from live performances around the country whilst distrusting the authenticity of the versions he was hearing and being content instead to use the printed versions of the texts. Again, a few more musical examples would be helpful, particularly in allowing readers to compare different attitudes towards providing accompaniments and the dilemma of Scottish versus Anglicised texts. Any undergraduate using this book will need access to a suitably resourced library.

Chapter 3 is an introduction to the growth in tourism as a means of cultural engagement and furthering one's cultural knowledge and professional contacts. The main subject of this chapter is Alexander Campbell and his endeavours through contacts in all social classes to assemble his collection. There is an intriguing description of a volume of Gaelic songs collected by Lauchlan Maclaine of Mull which appears to be in need of further research. Related to this

chapter, Appendix 1 provides a table of manuscripts and other documents originating from the Maclean-Clephane sisters, keen players of the harp and collectors of song tunes, that will serve well as the starting point for other lines of research.

Although McAulay admits that Chapter 4 may 'not offer many new insights into [James] Hogg's activities' it is still of value to a novice in this field, particularly in the contemporary use of the 'found' manuscript as a basis for fakery. The latter is explored with respect to R.A. Smith's *The Scottish Minstrel* [sic] and there is clearly scope for further research on this topic. The subject of this chapter continues into the next, where the main song collections are given some context, including an interesting diversion into the symbolism of the bard with his harp and the wild flowers that are the traditional songs of the country, or its hidden treasure.

Chapter 6 focuses on William Stenhouse's *Illustrations* within a detailed discussion of the contextual notes included in such volumes. There is a useful guide to his working method of compiling notes and the efforts of those who followed- David Laing and John Glen- to retain, update, and correct these as research methods improved throughout the nineteenth century. Chapter 7 moves into the period 1830-50, the age of the song collections for the drawing rooms and teaching rooms of the middle classes, and the work of Finlay Dun, John Thomson, and George Farquhar Graham. Most welcome in this chapter is the inclusion of comparative musical examples across generations of song collectors. Although the layout of the book means that these are not always ideally positioned to make comparison easy, it is exactly what the musical reader requires.

Andrew Wighton, his collection and professional contacts, is the subject of the final chapter, and includes a useful

biography of the Aberdeen music printer James Davie. Here McAulay argues for the inclusion of Chappell's work on English song, and his attempts to claim English origins for some Scots traditional songs, as essential to understanding the strength of nationalism embodied in song collecting. The latter constitutes a significant part of the chapter while noting the further research to be carried out. Appendix 2, related to this chapter, will be a useful starting point for scholars interested in taking this topic further.

On the whole, this is a very readable and informative volume. It will serve specialist researchers well as a source for further lines of enquiry, and graduate students with an interest in song collecting in general or the history of Scottish traditional songs in particular. For myself, I think that there are too few musical examples for this volume to serve as a standalone undergraduate set text, although it will work well where the necessary background reference works are available.

About the review author

DR ELAINE MOOHAN is Lecturer in Music and Associate Dean in the Arts Faculty of the Open University. Her current research examines the musical life of Glasgow from the pre-Reformation Cathedral to the end of the long eighteenth century. She has published OU teaching materials for music students at first-year and specialist honours level, as well as for taught postgraduates.

**Book review: *Hamish MacCunn (1868-1916): a musical life*,
by Jennifer L. Oates**

JOSHUA DICKSON

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.08
Publication date: 13 December 2013

Hamish MacCunn (1868-1916): a musical life (Music in 19th-Century Britain) by Jennifer L. Oates. Farnham: Ashgate, 2013; ISBN 9780754661832 (£60.00)

The closing years of the nineteenth century were witness to great changes in British and indeed Scottish musical life. A maturing of editorial approaches to fieldwork and folksong collecting led to greater care in preserving the voices and intentions of those from whom collectors drew their material, and orchestral and symphonic evocations of place and identity occasioned the emergence of a romanticised musical nationalism. However, in time this romanticism began to wane in deference to audiences with increasingly sophisticated tastes and expectations. Jennifer Oates's new work, published by Ashgate as part of its *Music in 19th-Century Britain* series, personifies this period in the career of young, tempestuous composer Hamish MacCunn.

It was an extremely creative time in Scotland's musical life as art music composers sought to establish and rationalise their place in a London-centred hegemony. Greenock-born Hamish MacCunn did so by grounding himself firstly, firmly and publicly in the elicitation of Scottish homeland and heritage through his early works, such as *The Land of the Mountain and the Flood* and *The Dowie Dens o' Yarrow*. Both were inspired textually by the works of Sir Walter Scott, but they fall heir artistically to the works of Mendelssohn, Grieg, Dvořák and Wagner in the evocation of native traditions,

mythologies and folk imagery. In so doing, MacCunn had tapped into the 'Caledonian twilight' of the Victorian era, resulting in wide popular acclaim. This was a savvy move for a young composer finding his niche, but, as Oates demonstrates, it spelt MacCunn's eventual professional decline owing to the fact that he was never able to escape the initial public persona he had so carefully crafted. Although MacCunn's work can be said to have foreshadowed the idioms of Bartók and Vaughan Williams, he was soon outdone by them.

Oates offers a vivid portrait of MacCunn's life, education and career in the context of his time and demonstrates his contribution to the making of British musical modernity. Organised chronologically, she begins with a detailed account of MacCunn's upbringing and precocious compositional output in Greenock prior to his years at the Royal College of Music in the 1880s. This is followed by an analysis of MacCunn's efforts thereafter to find his niche as a composer in the London social scene, including the success of his overtures and choral-orchestral works at the Crystal Palace and the mixed reactions of a fickle audience. Then follows a description of his efforts to extend these early successes, including a busy period of conducting, teaching and publishing (for example, his 1891 *Songs and Ballads of Scotland*), which in the end may be said to have merely consolidated his reputation as a 'Caledonian' composer. Oates goes on to present an exhaustive dissection of MacCunn's operatic output in the 1890s, supported by contemporary evidence of his maturing compositional style and his increasingly broad yet subtle use of idiom, including traditional Scottish dance rhythms, in the face of entrenched public expectations. Oates concludes with an account of MacCunn's later works, including musical comedy and novelty pieces, and his last attempts at conducting and teaching prior to his untimely death due to throat cancer. Throughout, Oates underpins detailed musical and historical analysis with a recognition of the personal failings

and inconsistencies which beset MacCunn's life and, ultimately, doomed his career.

This is an insightful and detailed exploration of musical nationalism and the birth of 'British' music in the closing years of the nineteenth century. Oates presents this exploration methodically and with due regard to a wide range of contemporary records and seldom-seen manuscript and correspondence evidence. This is complemented by evocative contemporary photographic illustrations and frequent musical examples depicting the thematic, motivic and other details of MacCunn's works. This is particularly useful when, for instance, Oates compares Mendelssohn's *Hebrides* and MacCunn's *Land of the Mountain and the Flood* in terms of exposition, development and recapitulation. By demonstrating how the latter was influenced by the former, we see the formation of a sense of place and identity in Scottish art music in progress.

Hamish MacCunn (1868-1916): A Musical Life will be of value to historical musicologists, cultural historians of British and Scottish art music and to today's composers seeking insights into the evocation of landscape and other hallmarks of identity and heritage in the modern world. Composers may also find it to be a highly instructive examination of the complex relationship between artistic integrity and public perception.

About the review author

JOSHUA DICKSON MA, PhD is Head of Scottish Music at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland. He is the author of *When Piping was Strong: Tradition, Change and the Bagpipe in South Uist* (John Donald, 2006) and editor of *The Highland Bagpipe: Music, History, Tradition* (Ashgate, 2009).

Book review: *Theatre and performance in small nations*, edited by Steve Blandford

ANNA BIRCH

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.09

Publication date: 13 December 2013

Theatre and performance in small nations, edited by Steve Blandford. Bristol: Intellect, 2013; ISBN 9781841506463 (£25.00)

This edited collection is timely and shares an interesting and diverse range of voices. Issues around independence, nationality and nation-building are discussed through the lenses of current theatre and performance practices. Editor Steve Blandford has assembled chapters written by authors in a variety of registers, including personal testimony and social, cultural and historical perspectives representing an international set of activities and projects. The style and delivery of each chapter is different and a range of views contribute to this emerging area of international theatre scholarship. Some contributions opt for a single case study; others are more discursive and polemical to interrogate the making and re-making of small nations across the globe.

The starting point for this volume, according to Blandford, rests 'at least partly, on the idea that it is within small nations and first nations that some of the most interesting work is taking place inside of the broad arena of using theatre and performance as a sophisticated means of scrutinising questions of nationhood, nationalism and national identity in the age of globalisation' (p.8). By offering wider definitions of what a national theatre in Scotland, Wales and New Zealand might be, this volume takes us

beyond nation and national theatres, entering a complex series of political and geographical contexts. For example, differences of scale are apparent when the landmass of Australia and its small population is contrasted with the large population but small landmass of Malaysia. A broad survey, both generous and expansive, is achieved here in a book whose origin is the Centre for the Study of Media and Culture in Small Nations based at the University of South Wales.

By using the phrase 'small nations' in the title, it is clear that this collection is about nationhood and what that might mean in different contexts. Blandford states early on that his aim is to interrogate and challenge this contested term. It is suggested that the scale of 'small nations' may be a reason why these nations offer a site for contesting national identities in a way that monolithic, large-scale nations do not. The process of national identity seems to get more fixed and rigid as the nation increases in size. This suggests that although 'small nations' may feel under-confident due to their size, this characteristic can offer new potentials and futures. Helen Gilbert helps to frame the project and explain the role of theatre and performance in this process:

Always a site of circulating representational forms, theatre becomes, at formative moments in the on-going narrative of nationhood, a means by which communities register, reiterate and / or contest modes and models of national belonging (quoted on p.3).

The collection begins by discussing Irish theatre between the early 1990s and 2008, a period of intense development where Cathy Leeney suggests that an alienation from the national and state-promoted values is apparent. This may produce 'a growing sense of disjuncture' (p.22) to such an extent that the author suggests the survival of this particular 'small nation' is under threat.

To some extent, Blandford positions this collection around his description of the early development of National Theatre Wales (NTW), founded in 2010, as an example of national identity read through theatre and performance: 'and where dialogue feels at least possible, that a strong theatre and performance culture, a potential source of democratic engagement and questioning, can survive.' (p.69). The National Theatre of Scotland, founded in 2006 as a response to the London-centric National Theatre, was of course a model for NTW, and in both cases these new 'National' theatres demonstrate the variety of ways that nationhood can be developed, communicated and shared and might 'reflect the kind of democratic engagement that is in the spirit of their newly devolved nations' (p.12). Ian Brown surveys the process of Scottish devolution through Scottish theatre itself and importantly emphasises in his detailed chapter that 'the devolutionary settlement is part of a process, not the product of an event' (p.41). In recognising that devolution can be considered as the 'Reconfiguration of the Possible', Brown is optimistic about the trajectory of Scottish theatre as a barometer of cultural change. As he says: 'Scotland conceives of itself as 'Scotlands', multilingual, varied and intercultural both historically and contemporaneously' (p.43).

At its core, the volume celebrates the lack of fixity surrounding definitions of identity and nation. The construction of national identity is considered here as a process, a main platform of Blandford's argument. Live performance is particularly appropriate in helping the discussion of national identity, as the act of live performance itself draws attention to the idea that identities are performed 'and that different versions of identity can compete for our attention or allegiance' (p.3). Another key thread is how the external projection of national identity fits or in some cases does not fit with the internal understandings of a particular 'small nation'.

Helena Buffery suggests that for the Catalan theatre community, marketability and reaching out into a globalised world is a challenge because of the political requirement to communicate in the Catalan language. Goran Stefanovski charts a personal story of migration set in train in 1991 by the Yugoslav Civil War in which he attempts to recover some understanding of this disrupted history. Sharon Mazer discusses how in New Zealand, this post-colonial small nation tries to recover and find a way to produce and communicate diverse histories in dialogue with the Maori people and develop a form of national theatre.

Rea Dennis shows the difficulty of finding a 'unifying national identity narrative' in Australia post-9/11 due to competing debates around both human rights and national security. Teresa Marrero discusses the Hispanic and Latin debates of the different language communities who are becoming more evident in North Texas, USA. Issues of race in the English-speaking theatre of Malaysia and the struggle between racial and national identities are made explicit in Susan Philip's chapter. Finally, in her chapter on Indian dance, Aparna Sharma profiles the struggle between traditional country-dance and urban values and calendars in the context of an expanding Brazil, Russia, India and China (BRIC) economy.

This collection helpfully expands the debate on theatre and performance in small nations by providing a selection of points of view and experiences inviting further study in this important area.

About the review author

Dr Anna Birch is Artistic Director and founder member of Fragments & Monuments performance and film company and currently Lecturer, Research at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland in Glasgow where she supervises a number of PhD students. As a practice-led researcher, publications include co-editing 'Site-specificity and mobility', *Contemporary Theatre Review*, Vol. 22, Issue 2 (Routledge) and a collection entitled *Performing Site-specific Theatre: Politics, Place, Practice* which includes her latest essay 'Repetition and performativity: site-specific performance and film as living monument' (Palgrave, 2012) both with Professor Joanne Tompkins (University of Queensland, Australia).

Book review: *Practice as research in the arts: principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances*, by Robin Nelson

MARC SILBERSCHATZ

DOI: 10.14439/sjop.2013.0101.10

Publication date: 13 December 2013

Practice as research in the arts: principles, protocols, pedagogies, resistances by Robin Nelson. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013; ISBN 9781137282903 (£18.99)

The methodological openness of practice as research (PaR) is arguably one of its most stimulating features. Simultaneously, it can be a significant source of frustration: a labyrinth of possibilities, and myriad ‘-ologies’, can be encountered in any research process. This was certainly my experience as I conducted my own PaR PhD on and through rehearsal and performance practices in theatre. While concepts such as the ‘rightness’ or ‘wrongness’ of methodology are inappropriate in discussions about practice as research on the conceptual level, I found uncertainty about methodology to be a pervasive force. It is this area, the concrete methodology of PaR, that Robin Nelson addresses in his book *Practice as Research in the Arts: Principles, Protocols, Pedagogies, Resistances*.

The book is organized in two parts. Part One consists of five chapters by Nelson articulating in full his conception of the PaR process. Whilst Part One emerges from Nelson’s perspective, and is grounded in his own experience working in theatre in the UK, Part Two features chapters written by six different authors, each examining PaR from the

perspective of various countries and cultures including New Zealand, Australia, Continental Europe, the Nordic countries, South Africa and the United States.

Nelson's book is pragmatic in a number of ways. Much of Part One is presented as a 'how-to' approach to PaR (particularly in Chapters 2, 4 and 5). Through this focus, Nelson provides thoughtful guidance on many aspects of PaR projects: from planning to supervision, from documentation to exegesis. At the core is Nelson's presentation of 'a model in which a diverse range of enquiries conducted by means of arts performance practices might be framed' (p.6).

This model demonstrates a second level of pragmatism: it is underpinned with the aim 'to extend the acceptance of PaR within "the academy"' (p.6) and, for this reason, it attempts to find resonance with more traditional and established research paradigms (qualitative and even quantitative). In this model, 'know how' (which might include tacit or embodied knowledge) is balanced with 'know what' (knowledge gained through critical reflection) and 'know that' ('the equivalent of "academic knowledge"', p.45). While recognizing the special importance of 'know how' in PaR, Nelson advocates a methodology that addresses all three types of knowledge, and in doing so brings PaR closer to more traditional academic disciplines. This is not, however, merely a strategy to gain acceptance within the academy, but rather a fundamental way of thinking about PaR that recognizes the value in learning from other established research methodologies in support of rigorous investigation.

Where the approach to PaR presented is unique and compelling, perhaps the most distinguishing feature of the book is manner in which PaR is discussed. Like other texts on the subject (such as Elizabeth Barret and Barbara Bolt's

Practice as Research: Approaches to Creative Arts Enquiry (2010)), philosophical discourse is embraced. Here, Nelson opts to extend the discussion further by using this discourse as a springboard to articulating and supporting the mechanics of PaR as he sees them. By design, and unlike Josh Freeman's *Blood, Sweat & Theory: Research through Practice in Performance* (2009), case studies are not a focus—a decision that prevents the text from making generalizations about PaR or undertaking analysis of specific PaR projects. Instead, readers are able to engage with Nelson's ideas as they might apply to their own work. In essence, Nelson invites the reader to meet and interact with his ideas, making the book extraordinarily thought-provoking.

Nelson is the first to admit that his proposed approach may not work for every PaR project. He rightly draws attention to the limitations of his experience and acknowledges that there are some PaR projects where the contribution to knowledge may be contained and explicated fully by the practice outcomes. Nelson's pragmatism, therefore, does not extend to being prescriptive. He does not insist that his is the only viable way to approach PaR, but instead adds to the conversation about what it is and how it might be undertaken. For this reason, Part Two is a worthy companion to Part One as it draws together different voices from around the world who present their own views of PaR. In this way, Nelson not only contributes to a very necessary conversation, but facilitates it.

My one criticism of the book is quite minor: Nelson's use of endnotes makes the reading experience somewhat cumbersome. Replacing these with footnotes within each chapter would have improved the reading experience.

In spite of this quibble, Nelson's book should be considered a major contribution to the field of practice as research. He

has geared the text particularly to those studying at the doctoral level. This is most evident in Chapter 5, which specifically addresses PhD students. Even so, the material presented will be of use to anyone engaged in or considering PaR. Nelson's model is clear, effective and persuasively argued. While one may disagree with his proposed approach, the conceptual dialogue undertaken as a result of the disagreement will be highly beneficial.

References

Barrett, E. and Bolt, B. eds., 2010. *Practice as research: approaches to creative arts enquiry*. London: I.B. Tauris.

Freeman, J. ed., 2009. *Blood, sweat & theory: research through practice in performance*. Faringdon: Libri Publishing.

About the review author

MARC SILBERSCHATZ is a PhD candidate at the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland and the University of St Andrews engaged in practice as research. The focus of his research is on developing contributions to rehearsal and performance practice that eliminate pre-agreed-upon performance structures and minimize divided consciousness in actors. He is also a professional theatre director who has staged over twenty productions in both the United States and the United Kingdom.