



Museums
Galleries
Scotland

Scoping and Mapping Intangible Cultural Heritage in Scotland Final Report

Alison McCleery
Alistair McCleery
Linda Gunn
David Hill

Napier University
Centre for Cultural and Creative Industries

School of Health and Social Sciences
School of Creative Industries

July 2008



Contents

	Page
Executive summary	4
1 Intangible cultural heritage: a context	
1.1 Introduction	6
1.2 Terms of reference	6
1.3 Definitions	
1.3.1 The UNESCO definition	7
1.3.2 'Safeguarding'	8
• International interpretations of the UNESCO definition	8
1.3.4 The D'Art question	9
• Summary of responses to the D'Art question	9
1.3.5 Drawing ICH boundaries	9
2 ICH in Scotland	
2.1 Scope	11
2.2 Inclusivity and diversity	11
2.2.1 Inclusivity	11
2.2.2 Linguistic diversity	12
2.3 UNESCO domain definitions	13
2.3.1 Case studies	14
• Urban festivals	14
• Up-Helly-Aa festivals, Shetland	17
• Beltane festivals	19
3 Data collection	
3.1 Introduction	21
3.2 Sources	22
3.2.1 Gathering data by questionnaire survey	22
3.2.2 Existing data: extent, format and location	22
• Subject-based searches	22
• Local newspapers (see also 3.3.1)	22
• National or umbrella bodies	22
• Existing archives	23
3.3 'Routes of access'	23
3.3.1 Ethnic minority community organisations	23
3.3.2 Local Authorities	24
3.4 Data gaps and compatibility	27
3.4.1 Supplementary data sources	27
• Case study: Glasgow	27

4	Content management	
4.1	Nature of the database	29
	4.1.1 The database options	29
	4.1.2 Rejected options	29
4.2	Creation of the inventory Wiki	30
	4.2.1 Delaying decision making	30
	4.2.2 Access rights	30
	4.2.3 Entry format	31
4.3	Establishment and management of the database	32
	4.3.1 Installation	32
	4.3.2 Management	32
5	Safeguarding	
5.1	The nature of safeguarding	33
	5.1.1 Risks of safeguarding	33
	5.1.2 Safeguarding as supporting	33
	5.1.3 Safeguarding as self-conscious practice	33
	• Case Study: Lios Mor/Lismore	34
5.2	Education as a mechanism for ICH knowledge transfer	35
5.3	Safeguarding: Initial best practice	36
6	Recommendations: the way forward	
6.1	ICH <i>in</i> Scotland: scope, diversity and inclusivity	37
6.2	Data collection	38
	6.2.1 Rejected methods and supplementary sources	38
	6.2.2 Routes of access	38
	• Local Authorities	39
	• Ethnic minority organisations	39
6.3	Content management	39
	6.3.1 Database, data entry and sustaining	39
6.4	Training needs analysis	40
	6.4.1 Data collection	40
6.5	Cost	41
	6.5.1 Technical and related costs	41
	6.5.2 Employment, training (and related) costs	41
7	Conclusion	42
	Appendices	
A	The 'D'Art' question	43
B	Summary IFACCA member responses to 'D'Art' question	44
C	Local Authority enquiry on existing data	49
D	Sample of Local Authority responses	50
E	Case Study: Ba' Games	52
F	Sample Wiki Screen	54

Executive summary

The intangible cultural heritage (ICH) of Scotland requires to be accorded a status which is equal to that of the material culture of Scotland. If this is not currently the case, this in part reflects difficulties inherent in identifying the existence of, far less capturing the essence of, something which is not a material artefact. The creation of an accurate inventory of ICH in Scotland will constitute an important step towards safeguarding its future.

The nature of ICH in Scotland, while unique thematically and specific geographically, nevertheless exhibits a range broadly consistent with the generic UNESCO typology, and may be categorised under the headings of oral traditions and expressions; performing arts; social practices, rituals and festive events; and traditional craftsmanship. Within this categorisation, an inclusive approach to what constitutes ICH in Scotland (as distinct from Scottish ICH) is advocated which embraces the customs and practices of well-established immigrant communities. It is suggested that the touchstone for inclusion is the point where self-conscious reference to the site of origin has been replaced by self-confident expression consistent with the ICH becoming embedded in its wider destination context.

The obverse of this situation also occurs and must be resolved in the context of recording and safeguarding ICH in Scotland. This relates to the point at which ICH in and for the community is transformed into something outward facing and intended primarily for the 'tourist gaze'.¹ A case in point is festivals which may demonstrate aspects of both. With decisions made on criteria for eligibility for inclusion in the inventory, the next choice relates to finding the most efficient and effective means of identifying ICH on the ground. A distinction requires to be made between routes to and sources of ICH and the preferred method is to employ a snowballing technique with Local Authority staff coordinating and directing the efforts of teams of knowledgeable practitioners.

Finally, a fit-for-purpose inventory must combine flexibility from the user's perspective with ease of data entry from the compiler's perspective. It must also be database based so that a single change of detail effects change across the whole record. After due consideration, the preferred option is identified as a restricted-access Wiki with content being uploaded by authorised individuals only. This offers flexibility in terms of data categorisation, using a traffic light system for indicating fragility, combined with user friendliness both for those creating the inventory and for those wishing to access information.

Both in respect of the snowballing method for data gathering and for the technical aspects of data entry, basic group training sessions would require to

¹ Urry, J. *The Tourist Gaze* (London: Sage, 1990).

be offered to participating professional coordinators – possibly Local Authority-based. This training would be specifically designed to be capable of being cascaded to community-based volunteer staff, drawn from ICH practitioners on the ground, who could be responsible for gathering the data and sorting it in readiness for data entry. The maintenance of any inventory will be as critical to the matter of adhering to best practice in the recording of ICH as its initial creation. It is recommended that *ad hoc* updating is paralleled with a more methodical stocktaking of ICH in Scotland every few years.

The establishment of an inventory of ICH in line with UNESCO best practice is not, however, a sufficient condition to ensure adequate safeguarding, although it does ensure that those examples of ICH most in need of support can be identified. However, a specific effort must also be undertaken actively to safeguard ICH for the future, and it is recommended that such endeavours are best carried out either as community-level projects or embedded as part and parcel of the delivery of the curriculum in schools. If young people are progressively involved with the customs and practices of their own cultures, through both the curriculum and community-based projects, this is undoubtedly the most effective way of promoting a safeguarded ICH in Scotland for the future.

Note: From 31st March 2008 the Scottish Museums Council became Museums Galleries Scotland. For the sake of this report, regardless of time, we will refer to the organisation as Museums Galleries Scotland. References to publications produced prior to our name change will remain as Scottish Museums Council.

1 Intangible cultural heritage: a context

1.1 Introduction

From an early age, school pupils in Europe and elsewhere are today familiar with the concept – if not the vocabulary – of cultural heritage, which they recognise as the material manifestation of life in the ‘olden times’, as seen in museum artefacts for example, and which they may associate with their grandparents’ childhoods. Yet cultural heritage is not limited to material manifestations, such as artefacts, monuments and other objects which have been preserved over time. It also encompasses living expressions and the traditions that countless groups and communities worldwide have inherited from their ancestors and transmit to their descendants, in most cases orally.

Many years of research undertaken on behalf of UNESCO on the functions and values of cultural expressions and practices have opened the door to new approaches to the understanding and protection of, and respect for, the cultural heritage of humanity. This living heritage, known as ‘Intangible Cultural Heritage’, provides each bearer of such expressions with a sense of identity and continuity, insofar as he or she takes ownership of them and constantly recreates them. As a driving force of cultural diversity, living heritage is very fragile. In recent years, it has received international recognition and its safeguarding has become one of the priorities of international cooperation. This owes much to UNESCO's adoption and subsequent promotion of its Convention for the Safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage.

The UK is not as yet a signatory to the Convention, although neither is it hostile to the intention of the Convention. Although it is not mandatory for constituent administrations to meet its requirements at national level, nevertheless, especially in Scotland and Wales, there is a willingness to adhere to best practice in the matter of the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage (ICH). To this end, Museums Galleries Scotland, in partnership with the Scottish Arts Council, has commissioned this report, which represents one output from an exercise to scope and map ICH in Scotland.

1.2 Terms of reference

The terms of reference of this study were:

- to scope intangible cultural heritage activities in Scotland using a reporting framework that relates to the domain definitions set out in Article 2.2 of the 2003 UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage;

- to map the support mechanisms that are in place to safeguard ICH (Article 2.3) including both formal and informal mechanisms; and
- to review, evaluate and make recommendations on best practice in enhancing the participation of communities, groups and, where appropriate, individuals in the management of ICH and on the roles of key stakeholders, including public, private and third sector bodies.

1.3 Definitions

1.3.1 The UNESCO definition

The study has been shaped by the definition of ICH contained within the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of ICH.

The 'intangible cultural heritage' means the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artifacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage. This intangible cultural heritage, transmitted from generation to generation, is constantly recreated by communities and groups in response to their environment, their interaction with nature and their history, and provides them with a sense of identity and continuity, thus promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity. For the purposes of this Convention, consideration will be given solely to such intangible cultural heritage as is compatible with existing international human rights instruments, and complies with the requirements of mutual respect among communities, groups and individuals, and of sustainable development.

The 'domain definitions' of Article 2.2 of the Convention, referred to above, are:

- oral traditions and expressions, including language as a vehicle of the intangible cultural heritage
- performing arts
- social practices, rituals and festive events
- knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe
- traditional craftsmanship

The Convention views ICH as 'living heritage' that is manifested *inter alia* through these domain definitions. However, UNESCO – which has consulted extensively with member states and ICH experts around the world in arriving at definitional workability – does not regard these definitions as either

comprehensive or prescriptive and insists that forms of ICH are defined by the communities themselves that participate in them.

1.3.2 'Safeguarding'

A further key definition within this study is that of 'safeguarding'. This also is outlined in Article 2.3 of the Convention. *'Safeguarding' means measures aimed at ensuring the viability of the intangible cultural heritage, including the identification, documentation, research, preservation, protection, promotion, enhancement, transmission, particularly through formal and non-formal education, as well as the revitalization of the various aspects of such heritage.* This study constitutes a step towards the safeguarding of ICH within Scotland.

1.3.3 International interpretations of the UNESCO definition

Much work is being carried out on ICH and its safeguarding in other countries as part of the encouragement within the Convention:

... to create a consultative body or a coordination mechanism to facilitate the participation of communities, groups and, where applicable, individuals, as well as experts, centres of expertise and research institutes, in particular in:

- *the identification and definition of the different elements of intangible cultural heritage present on their territories;*
- *the preparation of inventories;*
- *the process of elaboration and implementation of programmes, projects and activities.*

This study has taken into account, where appropriate, the work being undertaken in other countries, both to learn from best practice and to ensure some degree of international compatibility and comparability. For example, the position of Scotland within the UK is reflected in that of Navarra and Galicia within Spain or Flemish Volkscultuur within Belgium. The inclusive definition of ICH within the USA, in recognition of the key role of many different migrant communities, supports the stance of this study in seeking methods of recording all ICH currently in Scotland, no matter its origins: for example, Irish dance and Hindu dance as well as Scottish country dance. The approach of the USA to sacred and secret aspects of ICH should also inform the treatment, for example, of Masonic rites as part of ICH in Scotland. Venezuela now has an online database available of 110,000 ICH entries that represents another model that the study has taken into account.

1.3.4 The D'Art question (see Appendix A)

The consultants, through IFACCA, the International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies, were fortunate to be able to pose a 'D'Art' question on the interpretation of the ICH definition and the way in which it is currently being applied and operationalised across the globe. A D'Art question is the mechanism by which IFACCA members can pose a question on the themes of artists, good practice, policy or statistics relating to culture, in order to see how other members approach a particular issue. Various members of IFACCA responded to this D'Art question circulated by Christopher Madden (Australia). A sample of these responses is reproduced in Appendix B to demonstrate the range of interest in ICH inventories and the stages that various countries have reached to date.

Summary of responses to the D'Art question

One member succinctly defined ICH as 'any creation or expression of art which cannot be kept in a museum' (Cyprus). Some countries are in the process of establishing their ICH inventory (Estonia). A number have yet to ratify the Convention and have therefore made little or no progress, for example, Austria. Nevertheless, Austria has a 'National Agency' for ICH actively monitoring international developments, including those in Scotland. Canada has not ratified the UNESCO Convention because 'as a federal state some of the issues that the Convention addresses fall within the purview of the provinces', and to ratify it 'would require the approval of, and possible negotiation with, the 10 provinces and three territories in Canada'. However, Canada supports the principles of the Convention, and several organisations and individuals within the country are 'keeping the prospect of signing this Convention very much alive in Canada'.

A question asking for views relating to the inclusion of examples of ICH practised by migrant communities in languages originating outside of the country of reception and 'of traditions that may already be safeguarded by mechanisms elsewhere' provoked varying responses (see Appendix B and also discussion in Section 2.2.1). The general consensus was that ICH in non-indigenous languages should not be excluded from any inventory, as this would 'contradict the spirit of the Convention and ... miss an important opportunity for intercultural dialogue' (Switzerland). Estonia interprets UNESCO's definition of cultural heritage 'present' in a State's 'territory' in a slightly more prescriptive fashion as covering only 'the ICH of migrant communities living in a given region at least for two generations'.

1.3.5 Drawing ICH boundaries

Apart from individual variations in the interpretation of the UNESCO definition of ICH, there are a number of issues which require to be addressed

in determining which aspects of ICH to safeguard and how to do so. For example:

- Where does inward sustaining ICH meet outward-facing heritage for tourists, i.e. at what point does commodification set in?
- What effect does commodification have on ICH and what should be done in respect of this tendency, especially in respect of e.g. income-generating festivals such as Up-Helly-Aa?
- If ICH locally is receiving 'official' sponsorship to promote/preserve it, where does ownership reside and at what point does bureaucracy begin to distort it?
- What does active 'preservation' do to ICH and does it kill the 'living' element and reduce it to little more than a footnote in history?
- If ICH on the ground is no longer 'evolving', is it still ICH or has it become frozen into another interesting historical footnote?

The report will therefore address the boundaries issue in the context of the UNESCO definitions, and how they can most appropriately be applied to the diverse range of ICH practices in Scotland.

2 ICH in Scotland

2.1 Scope

It is recommended that ICH in Scotland should be seen as having as broad a basis in the cultural life of Scotland as is compatible with the UNESCO definition. An inventory of ICH would not, therefore, discriminate between the different levels of participation in or influence of different examples of ICH: for example, those that have had little or no impact on the wider community, and have remained fairly insular, would also be included. Equally, there should be no discrimination in terms of 'safeguarding' (see UNESCO definition Section 1.3 and also see Section 5 Safeguarding) – although it needs to be recognised that, in terms of identified 'fragility', ICH practices which have remained 'fairly insular' are likely to be those most in need of safeguarding.

At the other end of the 'participation' scale, the possible repercussions on ICH practices 'safeguarded' to the point of distortion through commodification is something which should be considered. 'Edinburgh's Hogmanay' (see also 2.3.1 Case studies) is a commercially driven 'festival' or collection of events taking place over the New Year period. Initiated through collaboration between the private sector and the Local Authority, this event now attracts thousands of visitors and their spending to the city. However, other than 'seeing in the bells' at midnight on 31 December, the Edinburgh mass entertainment bears no relation to traditional Scottish New Year customs such as 'first-footing', that is, being the first person to cross the host's threshold bearing traditional food, drink and fuel (black bun, whisky and a lump of coal). 'Edinburgh's Hogmanay' may have become an example of ICH itself, but it is legitimate to consider whether local traditions have been overtaken by the event, or whether 'ownership' of this representation of 'Hogmanay' has been removed from 'local' practitioners.

2.2 Inclusivity and diversity

2.2.1 Inclusivity

The Scottish Government is 'committed to promoting race equality' and, as a public body, sees its remit as being 'to serve all the people of Scotland, regardless of a person's race, religion, culture, ethnicity, or other background'.² With reference to the 2003 UNESCO Convention, and the remit of this project, the scope of intangible cultural heritage in Scotland is a very broad one: one that emphasises 'inclusivity', of ICH in Scotland rather than Scottish ICH. Such a definition allows for the incorporation of as diverse as

² <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/People/Equality/18934>

possible a range of practices and knowledge that exist within Scotland, and also, simultaneously, avoids the problematic question of whether or not certain practices are specifically Scottish. Thus, in terms of an inventory, this should incorporate items of cultural significance within Scotland from as diverse a range of ICH sources as possible that reflect the UNESCO definitions, broadly interpreted. If for logistical or budgetary reasons a line has to be drawn, it is suggested that the touchstone for inclusion is the point where self-conscious reference to the site of origin has been replaced by self-confident expression consistent with the ICH becoming embedded in its wider destination context. As far as language-based ICH is concerned, while in principle there should be no formal barriers, in practice the existence of informal barriers of a purely practical nature cannot be ruled out.

Central to the idea of ICH in Scotland is the idea that an inventory should be a reflection of 'living' practices and knowledges rather than a record of the history of intangible culture. This approach fits in with the need to engage the interests of communities of practice and for ICH to be currently available and accessible. In other words, *purely historical* culture of an intangible nature cannot be considered central to knowledge of ICH in Scotland, but this does not, of course, mean that such knowledge is not informed by an awareness of its historical groundedness.

As noted earlier (in the responses to the D'Art question posed to International Arts Councils and Culture Agencies) UNESCO guidelines on the safeguarding of ethnic minority languages and practices have been interpreted in a number of ways by different countries. ICH of non-indigenous peoples practised in their countries of origin evolves through a process of 'intercultural dialogue' in Scotland,³ but practices which remain unchanged and continue to be practiced or are safeguarded 'elsewhere' also fall into the category of ICH *in* Scotland on the grounds that they are examples of cultural heritage 'present' in Scotland's 'territory' (see Section 1.3.4: The D'Art question). Equally, the results of intercultural dialogue on Scottish practices, such as the adoption of elements from Indian sub-continent cuisine as an accepted part of life in Scotland, should be recorded, for example Haggis pakora. Examples of both might be traced through a migrant population which sixteen years ago could still be referred to as 'New Scots' (Asians in Scotland)⁴ but which actually comprises second and third generations, identifying themselves variously in 2008 as 'Asian', 'Asian-Scots', or 'Scots'.

2.2.2 Linguistic diversity

The principle of 'inclusivity' can be further underlined in the area of language. As demonstrated below in Section 2.3, 'oral traditions and

³ Swiss response to d'Art question. See Appendix B.

⁴ Maan, Bashir. *The New Scots: The Story of Asians in Scotland* (Edinburgh: John Donald 1992).

expressions' recorded and safeguarded through the Scottish Inventory should not be confined to the indigenous languages of Scotland. ICH practices that exist only in languages spoken by migrant communities would be equally considered to be within the scope of ICH in Scotland (examples of indigenous and non-indigenous languages *in* Scotland are listed in Section 2.3.1). As noted above, however, the intention may not invariably be matched with absolute success – which should not prevent an effort being made to overcome practical barriers contingent upon language issues.

2.3 UNESCO domain definitions

ICH *in* Scotland then (see Section 2.2.1 'Inclusivity'), with reference to the UNESCO Convention domains, and for the purposes of this report, can be considered to cover practices that reflect a broad range of Scotland's cultural sphere as indicated below. It should be noted that examples are not exhaustive. Indeed, there is a fifth domain, **'knowledges and practices concerning nature and the universe'**. However, the contents of this sub-category may often be subsumed under other headings. It is in areas of such overlap that the importance of training of data collectors and inputters, and of flexibility of the database, is critical.

'Oral traditions and expressions' In terms of 'oral traditions and expressions', the linguistic diversity of Scottish culture, including practices in Gaelic, the Scots language and various dialects, and in languages spoken by ethnic minorities, can be considered as of central importance to an inventory.

Examples: *Shetland, Urdu, Travellers' Cant, Polish, Doric, Italian, and practices such as Precentor-led psalm singing, the Mod, story-telling, traveller ballads or muckle sangs.*

'Performing arts' In terms of the 'performing arts' Scotland has, among many others, the *Celtic Connections* festival and the *Mela*.

Examples: *Robert McLellan Festival, Arran; ceilidhs and ceilidh culture; Scottish country dancing; Shetland fiddling tradition; Step dancing; Burnsang; former colliery or 'Pit' Pipe and Silver bands; Gaelic mouth music; waulking songs.*

'Social practices, rituals and festive events' Regarding 'Social practices, rituals and festive events', events as diverse as the Beltane Festival, Up-Helly-Aa and the Jedburgh ba' game fall within this category.

Examples: *the Mod; Gretna weddings; Hen and Stag nights; 'Highland' Games; Clan Gatherings; Jedburgh Callants and other 'Common Ridings' or Ridings of the Marches; local Galas and 'Box' Days; St Andrews University 'Gaudie' torch-lit procession; the Marymass Festival and Irvine Carters*

Society; Dumfries Guid Nychburris; Pittenweem Arts Festival; Burns' Suppers; New Year 'first-footing'; Miners Welfare and other social club; Orange Walks/Apprentice Boys March; Handsell, 1st Monday in Jan; May Day events and traditions, e.g. washing the face in the morning dew on top of Edinburgh's Arthur's Seat; decorating and rolling Easter eggs; Trades' fortnight holidays in Edinburgh and Glasgow; spitting on the 'Heart of Midlothian' in Edinburgh; the Burry Man, South Queensferry; local weekly markets; brown sauce or vinegar on chips in, respectively, east or west coast fish and chip shops.

'Traditional craftsmanship' In terms of 'traditional craftsmanship' practices, Caithness glass-making and Harris Tweed manufacture are two of many Scottish traditions.

Examples: Fair Isle knitting patterns, peat-cutting, dry-stane dyking, thatched roofing, Arbroath smokies, Shetland Yoal/Orkney Yole and other boat-building practices, Black house renovation.

2.3.1 Case studies

One of the challenges for the safeguarding of ICH is to document current and evolving practice. It would therefore be a mistake to focus exclusively, as much previous research has done, on ICH from a rural context. The latter has its own set of problems – cultural practices may be frozen in time and dying out due to an aging population on the one hand and rural out-migration on the other. Urban-based ICH is also subject to pressure: the concept of the 'urban village' is in decline; the pressures of youth cultures and globalisation have increased dramatically; and rates of change in cultures and lifestyles are rapid, influenced by transient populations. Therefore the first of three case studies below focuses on urban festivals in Scotland (Edinburgh and Glasgow Mela, Celtic Connections and 'The' Edinburgh Festivals).

Urban festivals

Mela

Background Mela is a sanskrit word meaning 'gathering' and is used to describe festivals in the Indian sub-continent. The Scottish Mela festivals are multicultural arts festivals that, while having their roots in South Asian culture, can now best be seen as celebrating wide diversity of cultural life in Scotland, featuring dance, music, crafts, food and fashion, not just from South Asia, but from all over the world. There are two annual Mela festivals in Scotland: one in Glasgow and one in Edinburgh.

1. Edinburgh Mela

Edinburgh Mela is a major annual multicultural arts festival. It currently takes place in Pilrig Park over two days, in early September. It was founded in 1995 by members of the city's Pakistani, Indian and

Bangladeshi communities. One of its key objectives from the outset was to 'reflect and celebrate Scotland's cultural diversity, while retaining its roots in the South Asian communities'.⁵

Participation In 2006 the Edinburgh Mela attracted 40,000 people, and in 2007 over 30,000 on a single day.⁶

Economic impact In 2004, the Mela's economic output was assessed as £800,000, with income of £200,000.⁷

2. Glasgow Mela

Glasgow Mela is the highest-profile annual multicultural music and dance festival in the west of Scotland. It is now organised by the Scottish Academy of Asian Arts and takes place in Kelvingrove Park in early summer. The Mela was set up in 1990 when Glasgow was European City of Culture and has grown from being an indoor event at Tramway to an outdoor extravaganza.⁸

Participation In 2007, the attendance at the one-day festival was estimated at over 50,000.⁹

Economic impact No study has yet been undertaken of the impact of the Glasgow Mela.

Celtic Connections

Background Celtic Connections is a music festival, showcasing a broadly 'Celtic' style. The types of music include modern Celtic rock, dance, big bands, choral performances, international folk superstars, and theatre, as well as traditional pipe bands and ceilidhs. The festival started in 1994 in Glasgow and is now held there every January.

Participation The first festival was launched in just one venue, the Glasgow Royal Concert Hall, attracting around 35,000 people.¹⁰ In 2008, approximately 120,000 people filled nine venues across the city, attracting hundreds of artists brought to Glasgow from all over the world.¹¹ In addition, the Festival's Education Programme sees thousands of children attend free morning concerts, experiencing the range of Celtic styles. Celtic Connections also continues to play a vital role in nurturing new talent through its Young Tradition and Master & Apprentice series of concerts.

5 <http://www.edinburgh-mela.co.uk/mela2005/pages/press.htm>

6 <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/low/scotland/4210794.stm>

7 http://efaextra.efa-aeu.eu/efadoc/11%5Cfestivals_exec_summary_final_%20edinburgh%2004-05.pdf

8 <http://www.glasgowmela.org.uk/pages/history.html>

9 Ibid

10 <http://www.celticconnections.com/festivalretrospective/retroyear/94>

11 http://worldmusiccentral.org/article.php/celtic_connections_2008_successful

Economic impact An economic impact assessment of the 2007 Celtic Connections Festival was carried out by Glasgow Grows Audiences, facilitated by a £15,000 grant from EventScotland. This study showed that visitors generated £5.8 million of new output to the Glasgow City Council area (in comparison with £3 million in 2001). It was established that there was a total of £6.9 million new output to Scotland – for every £1 of funding, the festival was calculated to have generated £31 in return. Furthermore, the study revealed that 91% of festival-goers visiting from outwith Greater Glasgow said that Celtic Connections was their sole or main reason for visiting the city.¹²

‘The’ Edinburgh Festival

Background The Edinburgh Festival is a collective term for various simultaneous arts and cultural festivals which take place during August and early September each year in Edinburgh. These festivals are arranged by a number of formally unrelated organisations, meaning that there is no single event officially termed the Edinburgh Festival. The oldest festivals are the Edinburgh International Festival, and the Edinburgh Fringe, both of which started in 1947. Other more recent additions include the Military Tattoo (1950), Edinburgh Jazz and Blues Festival (1978), the Edinburgh Book Festival (1983), and many others.

Participation and economic impact In 2004 the Edinburgh summer festivals alone recorded attendances of just over 2.5 million (compared with 1.25 million in 1997). The Fringe generated just over half of these attendances. These figures come from a major research study of the Edinburgh Festivals commissioned by City of Edinburgh Council, Scottish Enterprise Edinburgh and Lothian, VisitScotland and EventScotland.¹³ The summer festival programme was assessed as providing a significant £184 million boost to Scotland’s economy, supporting 3,900 full-time jobs in Scotland (3,200 in Edinburgh). Together, the seventeen festivals taking place in Edinburgh during 2004-5 generated over 3.1 million attendances and an estimated 1.4 million trips to the city.¹⁴ The study calculated that for 2004 the Fringe generated £69.9 million, the Military Tattoo £23.3 million and the Edinburgh International Festival £19.3 million.¹⁵

¹² <http://www.celticconnections.com/files//dmfile/Newsreleaselogostemplate32.pdf>

¹³ http://efa-aef.eu/newpublic/upload/efadoc/11/festivals_exec_summary_final_%20edinburgh%2004-05.pdf?session=s:42F948E71181c0C358OwN38F6008

¹⁴ *ibid*

¹⁵ *ibid*

Fragility of urban festivals

Scotland's major urban festivals are strongly supported events. Furthermore, while the events themselves (particularly the Mela festivals and Celtic Connections) are of relatively recent genesis, they are a robust mechanism for supporting and transmitting knowledge of the diverse range of 'ICH in Scotland' practices that they showcase.

Up-Helly-Aa festivals, Shetland

The next case study is taken from Scotland's most northerly archipelago, the Shetland Isles. The festival in question is Up-Helly-Aa. There is no doubt that this festival is firmly rooted in its island context, yet it has become and is marketed as an outward-facing tourist event as much as a local one for local people.

The enduring influence of the Vikings, who arrived in Shetland just over 1,000 years ago, is celebrated on the last Tuesday of January every year by fire festivals across Shetland. The events are annual and now take place in mid-winter, having in some cases evolved from end-of-year festivities. The centrepiece of these events is a torch-lit procession, culminating in the torching of a replica Viking longship.

Lerwick Up-Helly-Aa This is the largest fire festival in Europe.

However, this is not the only such event in Shetland; there are other Up-Helly-Aa events in Yell, Norwick, Northmavine and elsewhere. The term Up-Helly-Aa itself dates from the late nineteenth century and the event evolved from earlier Yuletide and New Year festivities in the town, one notable aspect of which was burning tar barrels, overseen by rival groups of masked revellers. Progressively the Lerwick festival was moved back to the end of January, with the tar-barrelling element replaced by the burning of a Shetland 'yoal' (traditional boat) decorated with a dragon's head. Later still, a far more elaborate element of disguise – 'guizing' – was introduced into the new festival, and then a torch-lit procession was inaugurated.

At around the same time, the festival 'organisers' were entertaining the idea of introducing Viking themes to their new festival. The first signs of this new development appeared in 1877, but it was not until the late 1880s that a Viking longship – the 'galley' – appeared, and as late as 1906 that a 'Guizer Jarl', the chief guizer, arrived on the scene. It was not until after the First World War that there was a squad of Vikings, the 'Guizer Jarl's Squad', in the procession every year.¹⁶ Until the Second World War, the festivities were predominantly working class

¹⁶ <http://www.uphellyaa.org/3.html>

and male in character.¹⁷ Subsequently, the festival has changed dramatically in certain respects, while in others it has remained true to earlier traditions. The festival is nowadays larger and clearly more professionally organised, yet remains not-for-profit. At the same time, there are many connections between today's festivities and those of 150 years ago.¹⁸

Other Up-Helly-Aa events Similar events take place across Shetland: for example, Yell, the second-most northerly of the main Shetland Islands, hosts its own traditional Viking fire festival at the village of Cullivoe on the north-east coast, overlooking the island of Unst. Northmavine, in the northern part of Shetland's mainland, also hosts its own Up-Helly-Aa at Hillswick. The form of these events is now very similar to the Lerwick one, although there is some historical evidence that people in rural Shetland, unlike in Lerwick, did celebrate the 24th day after Christmas as 'Antonsmas' or 'Up Helly Night'.¹⁹ These smaller Up-Helly-Aa events, unsurprisingly, have a much lower profile, in terms of having their own online presence or in terms of their presence on general Shetland websites.

Participation Approximately one thousand local 'Viking' guizers are involved in the Lerwick procession, while the festivities invoke the participation of much of the town, whilst, at the same time, attracting tourists from across the world. However, precise figures are not yet available.²⁰

Economic impact Highlands and Islands Enterprise and Shetland Council have advised that no specific work has yet been carried out on the economic impact of the various Up-Helly-Aa festivals. However, the Lerwick event is clearly a high-profile visitor attraction for Shetland, having featured in, among other things, Lonely Planet's *Bluelist*. Even if its mid-winter schedule is likely to limit the number of non-local spectators, its impact cannot be measured purely in terms of the number of visitors to Up-Helly-Aa itself. What is certain is that the high-profile nature of the event adds to a general positive image of Shetland as a visitor destination. In addition to the annual up-Helly-Aa festivals, there is a permanent Up-Helly-Aa exhibition, which in 2005 received 1200 visitors.²¹ It is even more difficult to ascertain the impact of the smaller events, but this is likely to be localised and limited.

Fragility This is variable in that, although the Lerwick event is famous, with easy-to-obtain information, other events throughout

17 <http://www.uphellyaa.org/3.html>

18 <http://www.uphellyaa.org/3.html>

19 <http://www.uphellyaa.org/3.html>

20 http://www.shetlandtourism.com/pages/up_helly_aa.htm

21 <http://www.shetland.gov.uk/datashare/upload/documents/VisitorAttractions.xls>

Shetland, although well-supported locally, are not high profile. Knowledge relating to these smaller events is not easily accessible, and obtaining detailed information would require on-site access to practitioners via a local agency such as Shetland Council acting as intermediary. Even www.visitshetland.com makes little reference to the other festivals, stating only that 'there are another eight fire festivals in various districts of Shetland during the late winter'.

Beltane festivals

The final case study represents a generic Celtic Fringe manifestation of ICH. On the one hand it could be argued that these are becoming dissociated from their geographical roots and cosmopolitanised; on the other hand they demonstrate examples of ICH which tend to evolve slightly differently in different locations.

Beltane is an ancient Gaelic holiday celebrated around 1 May, historically celebrated in Scotland, Ireland and the Isle of Man. It is a fire festival that celebrates the coming of summer and the renewed fertility of the coming year. The festival survives in folkloric practices in these nations (and the diaspora), and has experienced a degree of revival in recent decades, not only in the British Isles, but also in countries further afield such as the USA. The word *Beltane* is thought to have derived from a Gaelic-Celtic word meaning 'bright/sacred fire'. Across Scotland (and elsewhere in the UK), fires are lit and private celebrations are held amongst covens and groves (groups of Pagans) to mark the start of the summer.

The Edinburgh Beltane Festival The largest Beltane celebrations in the UK are held in Edinburgh on Calton Hill. Fires are lit at nightfall, and festivities carry on until dawn.

Format and participation Every year since 1988, on 30 April, thousands of people (up to 15,000) come together for a huge celebration on Calton Hill in the city centre to mark the coming of summer. The festival is organised by the Beltane Fire Society, which was created in the late 1980s as a community arts project, celebrating the seasonal quarter-day festivals through street performance theatre. The evening begins with a procession to the top of the hill led by the May Queen and the Green Man (ancient God and Goddess figures representing fertility and growth).²² The May Queen crowns the Green Man, in a ritual similar to that carried out by Wiccan Pagans (who follow a structured set of rituals). The winter ends when the Green Man's winter costume is taken from him and he is revealed in his

²² <http://www.beltane.org/en/society/index.en.shtml>

spring costume. A wild dance takes place and the Green Man and the May Queen are married.²³

Costs and benefits The Edinburgh Beltane Festival costs £40,000 to put on. This excludes an estimated £15,000 that performers spend on rehearsals, props and costumes. In addition, an estimated 10,000 voluntary man hours are put into rehearsing, and making props and costumes. Some of the costs of production are recouped through a small entrance fee (£3–5) for members of the public.²⁴ However, no research has as yet been done on the precise economic impact of the event.

Fragility The Edinburgh Beltane event is a relatively recent revival, but appears to be a robustly supported event that transmits knowledge of ICH practices. It is true that it is unclear precisely what connection these events have to the ancient festivities of which Beltane is supposed to be a revival. However, as a reflection of the intangible ‘here and now’, it is a strongly supported practice.

Small-scale, private Beltane celebrations also exist, the nature and longevity of which are, inevitably, more difficult to ascertain. However, it is not clear whether these small-scale events can be seen in any way as more ‘authentic’ than the more public events. It is perhaps best to regard these as supplementing the knowledge contained within the public practices.

The case studies in this report highlight the need to be alert to the relative visibility of different forms of ICH, as well as to the fact that similar forms of ICH may be manifested at different scales. The urban festivals featured above are, inevitably, highly visible and clearly mainstream. Other ICH practices – for example, local knitting patterns or knowledges about nature and the universe – are much less visible, arguably because they have no essentially outward-facing element to them. With the notable exception of Up-Helly-Aa, the examples given here relate to metropolitan centres. Market towns in rural areas also have their festivals and customs: for example, the Borders Ba’ Games (see Appendix E).

²³ http://www.bbc.co.uk/religion/religions/paganism/holydays/beltane_2.shtml

²⁴ <http://www.beltane.org/en/festivals/nextfest.en.shtml>

3 Data collection

3.1 Introduction

ICH resides everywhere and yet, within any given region, is often both invisible and located nowhere in particular, at least in no physical location. This is quite different from examples of the tangible cultural heritage, collections of which are formalised within the museums and galleries sector, whether at national, regional or local level, and whether in publicly accessible public or private settings or occasionally behind closed private doors. In the main, structured knowledge of the breadth and depth of coverage of tangible material culture exists in consequence of comprehensive and meticulous cataloguing of such collections, without considering further descriptive and/or critical commentary existing within the public domain.

ICH, on the other hand, exists in both formal and informal contexts which are often highly localised geographically. Specialised knowledges may be retained as an oral tradition only by small sub-groups of specific regional or ethnic minorities within Scotland and, as a general rule, the more invisible that ICH, the more fragile it is and therefore the more urgently it requires safeguarding. In relation to this point, however, it is pertinent to note the following two associated caveats: firstly, the business of safeguarding ICH is distinct from the related activity, arguably duty, of preserving historic traditions; and, secondly, the hijacking of aspects of the ICH to be commodified for purposes of tourism does not absolve a society of the duty to incorporate reference to the unadulterated indigenous form in any inventory.

The huge diversity, multiple scales and geographical range of examples of ICH in Scotland today render the scoping and mapping for inventory purposes a significant challenge. What is required is to devise a method or methods which can efficiently and cost-effectively capture examples whether near or far from the mainstream, and from the margins of each and every community culture. This needs to cover the length and breadth of Scotland, thematically and geographically. Section 3 is therefore devoted to assessing the advantages and disadvantages from a methodological, practical and resource perspective of a number of approaches to capturing ICH for inventory purposes, which may be used either alone or in combination.

It became apparent in the course of this study that sources of data in themselves may be less important than finding secure access routes to practitioners and knowledges, that is, the focus of primary attention for accessing living ICH. Approaches were therefore categorised on the basis of 'sources' on the one hand, and 'routes' towards knowledge, or data held for a variety of policy support purposes on the other. 'Sources' considered include using questionnaire surveys, standard search and reference tools such as Google, and some existing data collections. 'Routes' considered are ethnic support organisations and Local Authorities.

3.2 Sources

A number of sources of data/approaches to data collection were rejected as they failed to fulfil the UNESCO convention guidelines on the grounds that:

- (a) they would result in relatively 'invisible' ICH examples being missed as they required prior knowledge, or did not take advantage of local knowledge and practitioners
- (b) they were too generic and insufficiently embedded in local practices, for example national or umbrella bodies
- (c) they tended either to focus on excessively narrow fields or to be overly historical and folkloric, for example exploiting archival work undertaken by universities/related institutions.

While deemed inefficient as primary approaches, some of these are considered valuable on a supplementary basis (see Section 3.4.1).

3.2.1 Gathering data by questionnaire survey

The use of a questionnaire survey was rejected as this tends to be expensive, time-consuming and – as corroborated by the Welsh study²⁵ – produces response rates which are unsuitably and inefficiently low and liable to render the results statistically insignificant.

3.2.2 Existing data: extent, format and location

Subject-based searches This method can deploy either a subject-based search using standard search engines such as Google or standard reference books. Whichever way, these demand a high level of prior knowledge.

Local newspapers Searching Scottish local newspapers offers possibilities for identifying ICH, but this method was found to be time-consuming, lacking in consistency and limited in scope (often historically focused). Using the online version of *The Shetland Times* as a case study confirmed this and suggested that data collection using this type of search was dependent upon already knowing what was being searched for. This route might therefore be useful as a confirmatory, back-up source of information, but not as a primary method for collecting information (see Section 3.4.1 Supplementary data sources).

National or umbrella bodies Contact is necessarily limited for logistical and operational reasons to national or umbrella bodies, and inevitably omits too much of what is happening at local level.

²⁵ Gwyn Edwards (Welsh Committee of UK National Commission for UNESCO Culture Committee) looked into the efficacy of using this method towards the compilation of an Inventory of ICH in Wales.

Existing archives The use of extant collections likely to contain information on ICH practices and knowledge was considered as certain existing archives represent an extremely important and valuable resource, for example: the sound archives of the School of Celtic and Scottish Studies, Edinburgh University;²⁶ and data collected by local, national and thematic Museums or by Local Authorities' Cultural Services departments in the course of community outreach work or research for exhibitions of *tangible* cultural heritage (see case study in Section 3.4.1 Supplementary data sources).

While activities such as these contribute to 'safeguarding' (see Section 3.3.2 and Section 5 Safeguarding), the (limited) extent to which the material within such collections has been catalogued and transcribed places it in the category of 'supplementary' (and, to a degree, 'historic') rather than 'primary' sources for information on continuing ICH practices and knowledge (see Section 3.4.1). A further problem with this type of source relates to the matter of consistency and comprehensiveness, in that a narrow and highly specific focus is not necessarily replicated for other ICH themes and/or in other geographical areas.

The use of Local Authorities as 'routes' of access to local practitioners and knowledge, discussed in Section 3.3.2 below, also links into accessing policy and support data held for administrative purposes, covered in Section 3.4.1.

3.3 'Routes of access'²⁷

3.3.1 Ethnic minority community organisations

A search of Local Authority websites indicated that with the exception of cities, for example Glasgow and Edinburgh, many would be of limited help in providing direct access to ethnic minority organisations and to individuals with ICH knowledge. Telephone conversations with a range of Local Authorities confirmed this to be the case; therefore a different route was tested.

Several organisations maintain their own databases of ethnic minority groups, including Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland (BEMIS); Council of Ethnic Minority Voluntary Sector Organisations; and Communities Scotland. While these databases are not directly accessible to the public, both BEMIS and the Council of Ethnic Minorities Voluntary Sector Organisations responded favourably, indicating that the organisations they represent could have an important role to play in facilitating access to practitioner groups.

²⁶ The assistance of Dr Katherine Campbell, School of Celtic and Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh, is gratefully acknowledged.

²⁷ The Local Authorities and ethnic minority support organisations contacted were unfailingly helpful and their assistance is gratefully acknowledged.

A direct online search produced mixed results, some groups having a more limited internet profile than others. In general, the lack of an independent web presence for many ethnic minority groups suggests that the ethnic minority databases referred to above offer the most efficient way of approaching local community groups/organisations. This could be complemented with a direct approach to longer-established communities with an already strong independent presence that is more easily accessible, such as in the case of the Italian and Polish communities.

3.3.2 Local Authorities

Practitioners and individuals in communities have been identified as the primary source of information on continuing ICH practices and knowledges (see Section 3.1). This being the case, an effective and efficient 'route of access' to such informants is required.

Searching by Local Authority area was tried and some case studies (for example, Dumfries and Galloway) yielded very positive results. Websites of Local Authorities provided lists of organisations and potential contacts; Libraries and Archives staff responded positively to the possibility of making contact with practitioner groups. Further, the Arts Association's local workers were open to the possibility of facilitating contact with local practitioners so that they might act as 'local partners' in an ICH project. This test, using a 'snowballing' technique to reach contacts was, however, more effective in some regions than in others; therefore a sample of Local Authorities, including one urban and two arguably less affluent/less well-resourced non-urban regions, was contacted with the following objectives:

- to test the consistency of using these as a route to local contacts and organisations;
- to establish how to negotiate this route; and
- to identify what level of cooperation might be available.

While patterns could be discerned between Local Authorities with similar populations and economic situations, this investigation still found a lack of uniformity/consistency across these administrations and across their websites. For example, smaller Local Authorities had fewer sub-departments and some grouped activities under different departments, suggesting that some level of involvement from Local Authorities in negotiating the route through each administration would further reduce time and costs in the final project. Such involvement offered the further possibility of Local Authorities contributing to the inventory by providing the ultimate ICH project managers with data each already held on ICH practices (see 3.4.1 Supplementary data

sources). This hypothesis was tested by widening the research to all 32 Local Authorities in Scotland²⁸ and inviting responses to the following questions:

- Are they able to suggest a 'best contact' in the Local Authority for the eventual project?
- What type of information is routinely requested from ICH practitioners or organizations receiving their support?
- In what forms/formats do they request and hold such data?
- Is it held separately, or is it accessible universally?

Responses confirmed that the level of cooperation from Authority to Authority varies, and although ICH does not generally appear to fall under the remit of any one department, a number of 'best contacts' have already been provided. Those Local Authorities which have prioritised 'culture' for various reasons, for example Glasgow – which has used it consistently in the city's regeneration 'makeover' branding from the late 1980s – responded enthusiastically, agreeing that the ICH project might be used positively by them and incorporated into their strategic plans. Other Local Authorities responded in less detail but, for example, forwarded computer files detailing awards made to various organisations and events, details of various ICH-related events, and also supplied the names of their 'best contacts' for the final Inventory Project. (See Section 3.4.1 Supplementary data sources and Appendix D Sample of Local Authority responses.)

(i) Types of information held by Local Authorities All 32 Local Authorities were asked what type of information they requested from ICH practitioners or ICH organisations receiving their support. At a pragmatic level, some confirmed that, alongside descriptions of the practice or event, they hold details such as the numbers of people involved or attending; economic impact; other sources of 'support' (other income, informal support, local school involvement, etc.).

The response of others focused on the wealth and variety of research material collected on a 'year on year' basis in the course of research for exhibitions of tangible cultural heritage, festivals, outreach work in various communities – young people, older peoples' reminiscence groups, exhibition work with ethnic or religious groups, etc. (see Glasgow case study in Section 3.4.1). Once again, the indication is that the ICH information already held, and which might be available to the project through Local Authority involvement, will vary in detail and quality. Elements of these data are, however, extremely valuable.

²⁸ Grateful thanks are extended to Jason McDonald, COSLA Policy Manager, for his assistance with contacting Local Authorities.

(ii) Location of data The ideal role for Local Authorities is not simply that of contributing data or providing access to data on ICH practices, but also that of facilitating 'access' to practitioners and to individuals or groups with ICH knowledge, through local museums, libraries, arts and community groups. One possible method of collecting information from practitioner(s) or communities could be if their involvement is identified and organised through the auspices of the Local Authority and local museums etc This could be done using focus or discussion groups.

The training implications of collecting 'deep' data using this method are necessarily dependent on the level of Local Authority involvement and commitment. If this level of data is required, it is recommended that an eventual project should employ and train field-workers for the purposes of collecting data from this community-level source. The apportionment of the work between e.g. Local Authority officers, Inventory Project staff and practitioner volunteers would depend on a number of factors: the size and structure of the Local Authority in question; the fragility or strength of the ICH practitioner group; the variable resources of different Local Authorities.

(iii) Form and format Aware of the need to minimise any workload incurred by Local Authorities through participation in the eventual Inventory Project which may arise further down the line, we asked the 32 Local Authorities in what form and formats they request and hold ICH related data. It was found that the more basic or 'business' data such as descriptions of the practice or event, details of numbers of people involved or attending, assessment of economic impact, and other sources of income and 'support', are normally held as 'paper based forms' or 'summary reports on particular streams of funding',²⁹ or in various IT formats. However, the more in-depth information or ICH knowledge, or 'stories' containing information on ICH examples which lack any formal support mechanism – for example, street games – may be held in recorded form in a variety of formats depending on technology at time of recording (see Glasgow case study in Section 3.4.1).

Accessing such data may present the same problems as those identified with exploiting research or archival work undertaken by universities or related institutions. Furthermore, the variable extent to which such material has been catalogued and transcribed places it in the category of 'supplementary' (and to a degree 'historic') rather than 'primary' sources of information on continuing ICH practices and knowledge. There is also in some cases a potential problem with ownership of, and access rights to, confidential information, particularly if it was collected for one purpose and the intention is to use it for another.

²⁹ Kerry Corbett, Culture and Libraries Manager, for Donald MacVicar, Argyll and Bute.

3.4 Data gaps and compatibility

3.4.1 Supplementary data sources

As detailed earlier (see Section 3.2), several sources of already existing data were rejected as 'primary' sources, but were considered valuable in a supplementary capacity depending on the 'depth' of information which the final inventory team planned to achieve. These were:

- approaching national or umbrella bodies to review inventory after initial data collection and entry
- as above, approaching research centres
- searching and recording data from archival work undertaken by universities/related institutions.

Local newspapers A search of Scottish local newspapers offered a way of identifying ICH. However, newspapers varied in their ability to identify ICH in a consistent fashion and, in the best cases, still offered only limited scope to do so, and in a manner that would also be very labour-intensive. Although certain papers did have 'local interest' or 'heritage' sections that, on the face of it, seemed likely to offer some coverage of ICH subjects, this was usually historically focused and therefore offered limited scope, by itself, to identify intangible living culture. A broadening of the research base beyond newspapers could ascertain if such historical events have continuing relevance; however, this would clearly be a time-consuming and possibly unfruitful exercise given the limited number of newspapers offering even this level of coverage. Similarly, although newspapers often provide a local 'what's on' or similarly titled section, the scope of these rarely extends beyond film times at the local cinema.

Local Authorities as primary 'routes' and as supplementary 'sources'

There is variety across Local Authorities and this is reflected in their different staffing structures. Those such as Glasgow could be expected to have a stronger focus on 'culture' because of their effectiveness as routes of access to local practitioners and knowledge and to their own existing data.

Case study: Glasgow The effectiveness of using Glasgow Museums as an access route to practitioners and local knowledge was confirmed by Research Manager William Kilbride who noted that an 'open museum' policy operated, or at least a policy of active communication with communities, much of which results in recording information through the following means:

- placing and maintaining exhibition cases in places like Glasgow Mosque, which might request artefacts for display

- taking objects into old folks homes and holding reminiscence groups
- involving young people in the development of the 'story' of Glasgow trams for the new transport museum by presenting them with old tram posters (for example, one advertising 'Dancing at the Locarno') which leads them to discuss and discover parallels in their own activities and lives.

In Glasgow's case, several departments – for example, Planning – might (hypothetically) be involved in assisting the ICH Inventory Project, but museums and libraries would be the main contributors. In terms of the format of their existing data, they hold a large oral history archive, only some of which has been catalogued, and/or transcribed. Such material is collected continually year-on-year. It was pointed out that as 'cultural interactions nowadays are largely digital' the service is considering a 'digital' project for, while the digital diaries/archives of people such as politicians are now collected, 'no-one is collecting/cataloguing ... those of ordinary people'. Could text messaging fall into the category of digital cultural inheritance, for example?

Glasgow Museums, for example, has a great deal of information related to ICH which has been gathered in the course of research for exhibitions, community projects and festivals: 'there is a lot of intangible stuff underneath the tangible stuff',³⁰ for example:

- Existing exhibitions programming: from conversations related to Glasgow Museums' African Ethnographic Collection, staff recorded the 'stories' and opinions of African people living in Scotland
- A community project with people living in the area of the proposed M74 motorway extension provided information on activities practised in the area
- Festivals: Merchant City Festival, West End 'Carnival' and 'Aye Write' (an author was commissioned to work with an oral historian for one year related to Aye Write).

³⁰ William Kilbride.

4 Content management

4.1 Nature of the database

The key attributes of a 'fit-for-purpose' database, which is to be used by a range of people with different educational levels and skill backgrounds, are

- ease of data entry and access
- flexibility across categories and over time.

A web-based solution solves most of the problems associated with making the inventory accessible to as wide a public as possible. It can also provide a more streamlined approach to collection of the data for inclusion in the inventory. The only requirement for those inputting entries is that they have a web browser and an internet connection. Account names and passwords can be generated by the inventory manager and distributed via email. The use of structured templates can increase the efficiency of data entry, eliminating as much variation and therefore error as possible.

4.1.1 The database options

The options for a web-based inventory fall into two broad types.

Content management systems:

- a restricted Wiki is the option recommended in this report for building as effectively as possible an inventory of intangible cultural heritage in Scotland
- an off-the-shelf commercial system such as CMS from Microsoft

Custom-built databases:

- a bespoke application based on a scripting language such as Perl and a database such as MySQL

4.1.2 Rejected options

The off-the-shelf database solution is best applied to areas where the entities are clearly defined and where the properties of those entities can be enumerated. In the case of intangible cultural heritage, neither of these factors would seem to be true: there must be some flexibility in defining each item of ICH and its properties.

A custom-built database is the ideal solution when a precise specification is available ahead of time. This is best in cases where the client is sure of requirements and is certain that those requirements will not change in the

foreseeable future. Even minor changes to the specification must be costed and implemented by a software developer. The software can be built to do exactly what is required and no more.

Creating and maintaining an inventory of intangible cultural heritage requires a balance between a highly structured relational database and unstructured, free form text. A traditional database (a relational database) is an inflexible structure that is ideal for storing precise data with a consistent format. However, the data to be recorded in this inventory of ICH is not precise, nor does each instance of intangible cultural heritage fit exactly the same pattern.

4.2 Creation of the inventory Wiki

The standard Wiki (such as Wikipedia) offers a completely open, unstructured database. In contrast to the relational database this has insufficient structure for the inventory. A set of related articles about cultural heritage does not in itself constitute an inventory. A *customised Wiki* offers the opportunity to fine-tune the degree of structure. Administrators can enforce a minimum content requirement, that is, they can insist that every entry includes certain elements (for example every entry must have a category). Contributors can 'tag' articles; this makes it easy to generate lists and to search the database. Contributors can add highly structured data items to some articles but not others using templates.

4.2.1 Delaying decision making

The specification of a database includes the list of *attributes* that each element must have together with the *constraints* that are to be imposed on the data. In a traditional database development a full specification is available before development work has started; certainly the specification must be fixed before data can be entered. With a customised Wiki we can allow the specification to grow organically. The rules and restrictions can develop over time as the expertise of the contributors and the administrators grows. The full specification need not be available before data entry starts. This will enable the most effective inventory possible with a minimum of initial investment using contributions from a wide range of agencies including local authorities and community groups.

4.2.2 Access rights

Wikipedia is notorious for its relaxed policy regarding editing rights – anyone can change any page – and this has given Wikis generally a poor reputation. However, other editorial policies are possible. The policy for the inventory of ICH would be more restrictive than Wikipedia.

- Only registered users would be able to edit articles, and such users would be designated by the inventory manager.
- The entries themselves would be protected so that they are 'read-only' for all other users.
- Particular areas of the site would not be accessible at all to the public; certain administration and policy discussion pages would be seen only by registered users.

4.2.3 Entry format

A Wiki entry can include formatted text and images. Through the use of templates and/or extensions, it is possible to restrict the format of each entry, to impose a common structure and introduce fixed-format data where possible. Each element of ICH in Scotland would have a separate Wiki entry. A typical entry would consist of:

- Name – redirect pages allow entries to have more than one name.
- Descriptive content – this may include images and links to internal entries or external articles.
- Tag/categories – a tag may be used to identify particular types of entry. There should be a tag for each category (such as **music** or **dance**).
- Each category may have sub-categories (such as **regional dances** or **round dances**).
- There should be a tag for each region. Regions may have a sub-region.
- A typical entry will have many tags. An entry about Shetland Fiddlers might be tagged with 'Shetland Islands' and 'Music'.
- Templates – where structured data is available this can be entered in a template. A template might be used to hold data such as the size of the group involved or its age/sex profile.

The use of 'tags' or 'categories' makes it easy to see lists of items. For any given category, the sub-categories can be viewed. For any given category, all the pages that have been tagged as such can be viewed. It would be possible to create new tags or change existing tags at any stage although it is preferable to establish the list of tags before a large amount of data has been added.

An example of a Wiki entry can be seen at Appendix F.

4.3 Establishment and management of the database

4.3.1 Installation

MediaWiki can run on a relatively cheap, shared web-hosting package available for around £30 per year. The host would have to provide the following:

- PHP scripting
- MySQL

Many companies such as www.web-mania.com offer such a package. Once a suitable host is identified, the major tasks would be to:

- install software and set up administrative accounts
- define an initial set of categories
- decide on elements of structured data and create appropriate templates
- identify a set of protected pages – these pages can be changed only by the inventory manager
- create sample entries to guide inputters, perhaps as part of an online training exercise.

4.3.2 Management

The inventory manager would take responsibility for overseeing the installation of the Wiki, participate in the ongoing training of designated contributors inputting from local authorities and community groups, and monitor and edit the entries from this restricted user group. This will necessarily involve a larger commitment at the beginning than when the inventory reaches a steady state. A two-year contract or secondment for a dedicated inventory manager could be followed by a period when the role is subsumed within another central heritage post.

A management group to oversee the project should contain a member able to comment on and make recommendations for the IT operations including the setting up and day-to-day running of the inventory.

5 Safeguarding

5.1 The nature of safeguarding

The UNESCO convention states that intangible cultural heritage to be safeguarded 'is transmitted from generation to generation'. Therefore, ICH in Scotland should not be considered without a parallel concern for the mechanisms available for the transmission of ICH knowledge and for whether the mechanisms are sufficiently robust and fit for purpose (see the UNESCO definition in Section 1.3.1).

Scoping/ mapping of ICH, while it may ensure that there a public or collective memory of practices recognisable up to this point as ICH, will not of itself safeguard the continuation of these practices into the future. Scoping and mapping for the purposes of creating an inventory and the maintenance of that inventory are therefore distinct from the activity of safeguarding. However an ICH inventory provides an important springboard in respect of identifying examples of ICH which are fragile and in need of being safeguarded. Risks of active safeguarding require to be taken into consideration in recommending best practice.

5.1.1 Risks of safeguarding

As mentioned in Section 2 where 'Edinburgh's Hogmanay' is discussed in the context of commodification (Section 2.1), the possible repercussions on ICH practices of 'safeguarding' should be considered.

5.1.2 Safeguarding as supporting

Safeguarding should therefore, wherever possible, take the form of 'supporting' through education channels/community groups, so that it is not either taken over and distorted beyond recognition or alternatively preserved in aspic, as it were, artificially. It follows that while local authorities and other public bodies can facilitate the safeguarding of ICH by providing the framework for that support, they cannot actually effect the safeguarding, which is achieved through continuing community-based practice of the ICH in question. A number of vignettes of deliberate but '*ad hoc*' live examples of facilitated community-based safeguarding are provided below.

5.1.3 Safeguarding as self-conscious practice

Community-based safeguarding may be distinguished from the indigenous practice of ICH in as much as a self-conscious and deliberate decision is taken to conserve, emphasise or enhance the practice of ICH. Such is the case of the Lismore Ceilidh Weekend (see below), which consolidates existing island ICH

without either artificialising or commodifying it, given that the safeguarding activity is promoted from within the island community – i.e. not by a public body or a tourist organisation for their own purposes, even if that purpose may be an arguably misguided attempt to preserve ICH – for the benefit of that community. It should be noted that an exception to this rule exists in the reliable and effective universal mechanism for community-based safeguarding of ICH in Scotland, as elsewhere, which is provided through the education system. This form of mainly publicly facilitated conscious practice of ICH is also discussed in this section.

Case study: Comann Eachdraidh Lios Mor (Lismore Historical Society) and Ionad Naomh Moluag (St Moluag's Centre)

Lismore is an island situated in Loch Linnhe on the west coast of Scotland. The current population is 176.³¹ Gaelic language has been a significant aspect of Lismore's culture for centuries. In the national context, speakers of the Argyll idiom of Gaelic are scarce, but on the island of Lismore Gaelic is very much alive, with residential language weekends being run for learners and speakers of all levels. Farming and crofting remain the island's chief industries, but tourism is becoming an increasingly important part of the economy, with approximately 12,000 visitors per year.³²

Rationale Comann Eachdraidh Lios Mòr (CELM) was set up in 1991 by a group of Liosachs (people from Lismore). The society identified a need to extend and develop the social, economic and cultural facilities available to the people of Lismore, and decided to achieve this by means of a new, multi-function Gaelic heritage museum and community facility. This would incorporate amenities such as a library and educational IT centre, and would have the primary aims of safeguarding/interpreting Lismore's unique cultural inheritance and helping to secure the future economic viability of the island, primarily through increased tourism. In terms of the collection, this stated rationale emphasised the need for the development, not simply of a building to display the existing artefacts (although this was clearly also required), but also for a different way of conceiving it: one that would help promote local identity through the integration of the intangible cultural knowledge of the local population with the tangible knowledge of local history, something that a display of material culture alone would be unlikely to achieve so effectively.

The case for the heritage centre was developed in an Island Scoping Study, which was undertaken in conjunction with the University of Strathclyde by CADISPA (Conservation and Development in Sparsely

³¹ <http://www.isleoflismore.com/>

³² <http://www.celm.org.uk/project.htm>

Populated Areas) in 2002. Gaelic language and cultural heritage was one of the four main themes of the scoping study.³³ It identified the concern of local people over what they saw as the danger of the undermining of their cultural heritage by a diminishing population or by the arrival of incomers unaware of the traditions and culture of the island.

The Centre and ICH Thus, the heritage centre was developed not only to preserve a collection of objects of significance to Lismore, but also as a means of promoting and preserving the island's cultural identity. The artefacts would not 'stand alone', but would be displayed within a framework of interaction with local people. The planned centre would act as a site for the transmission of knowledge of the intangible cultural practices that complement the material collection. Furthermore, through this synthesis, the community would be able to curate its own material cultural and oral heritage, and thereby hold a stake in the preservation and reinforcement of Lismore's cultural identity.

Method of gathering ICH knowledge The process of collecting and sharing the oral heritage that accompanies the artefacts and archives took the form of a two-day ceilidh in the island's hall, led by CELM, whereby the society's members began a process of 'listening' to the objects in the collection. This entailed islanders being invited to 'visit with' the collection, whilst 'recorders' moved among their fellow islanders in order to note down their comments concerning both the objects themselves, and their own memories of them. Also captured were the oral history and memories of relative newcomers to the island, which has become part of the island's culture as it is now.

Ionad Naomh Moluag On 17 March 2007 the new heritage centre 'Ionad Naomh Moluag' (literal translation: St Moluag's Centre) was opened. The process of integrating the tangible with the intangible has ensured that local knowledge and expertise is fully honoured and integrated into the collection in a way that enriches the community's cultural landscape.

5.2 Education as a mechanism for ICH knowledge transfer

Clearly, different mechanisms for ICH knowledge transfer may be applicable to different practices, but, within Scotland, the education system can be identified as a potential and actual mechanism for transmitting knowledge

³³ The case for support was founded upon four themes: Social Inclusion, Lifelong Learning, the Sustainable Island Economy and Cultural Heritage. See <http://www.celm.org.uk/project.htm>

about many aspects of intangible Scottish culture, ranging from music and food, to ICH of the sacred.

It is therefore appropriate to consider the availability and efficacy of education as a mechanism for transferring knowledge of ICH, particularly the extent to which the Scottish 3–18 Curriculum can be viewed as such. Two questions are worth posing:

- To what extent, if any, does the curriculum allow schools to follow/learn local traditions?
- Is the curriculum evolving? If so, is it doing so in a way that allows greater scope for transmission of ICH-based knowledge?

The answers are encouraging. The Scottish Curriculum guidelines show that there is already considerable scope for the curriculum to be a tool for the dissemination of ICH-relevant knowledge. Moreover, the curriculum is currently evolving (as demonstrated by the ongoing *Curriculum for Excellence* review for ages 3–18) in a way that seems consciously to be placing more overt emphasis on transmitting Scotland's cultures through education. It is anticipated that information on ICH-related activities in schools would also be furnished via Local Authorities as participants in the eventual inventory project.

An example of young people connecting with their ICH is provided by Highland Council's Travellers' Tales project. Museums Galleries Scotland awarded a grant to Highland Council for this project during 2007/08. The main aim of the project was to give pupils and teachers in schools with Traveller intakes (Aviemore Primary School, Portree Primary School and Broadfoot Primary School) or close to Travelling People's sites (Newtonmore Primary School) a positive introduction to the rich culture and heritage of Travellers as well as to the strong Traveller collection at the Highland Folk Museum. The project was delivered through the formal education system, but the impact of the project reached beyond the school context. The museum's perspective is that the intangible cultural heritage assumes as great an importance as the material objects, as it shows that cultural heritage is constantly evolving. ICH adds context and knowledge to the museum's collections.

5.3 Safeguarding: Initial best practice

Section 2 suggested that the extent of participation in an example of ICH (widespread, or of 'no' influence outwith the local practice community), should not affect its right to 'safeguarding'. It also drew attention to the fact that, in terms of current 'fragility', ICH practices which have remained 'fairly insular' are likely to be those most in need of safeguarding.

6 Recommendations: the way forward

The key recommendations of this project in respect of ICH are:

1. that knowledge of ICH practices is best collected through a Local Authority-led process of snowballing', supplemented as necessary by secondary sources, all coordinated centrally
2. that, once gathered, this information is best stored, for ease of deposit of and retrieval, in customised 'Wiki' format, with restricted inputting rights for data entry and universal data access for end users

These recommendations identify the most cost-effective and efficient way for building a repository of knowledge of ICH practices in Scotland.

6.1 ICH in Scotland: scope, diversity and inclusivity

The parameters of an inventory of ICH in Scotland should accord with UNESCO Convention domains (see Section 2.3) and the Scottish Government's commitment to serving 'all the people of Scotland, regardless of a person's race, religion, culture, ethnicity, or other background'.³⁴ (See Section 2.)

- An inventory of ICH in Scotland should have as broad as possible a basis in the cultural life of Scotland emphasising 'inclusivity' by incorporating the diverse range of practices and knowledge that exist within Scotland, or are 'present' in Scotland's 'territory' (see Section 1.3.4), rather than solely ICH which is specifically Scottish.
- It should be a reflection of 'living' practices and knowledge rather than a record of purely historical ICH if it is to be widely accessible, though informed by an awareness of the historical groundedness of such knowledge and practices.
- Similarly, 'oral traditions and expressions' recorded and safeguarded through the Scottish Inventory should not be confined solely to the indigenous languages of Scotland.
- It should include self-confident practices of non-indigenous peoples which remain unchanged in the destination context and continue to be practised in parallel at the point of origin.
- Practices of non-indigenous migrant groups which have evolved through a process of 'intercultural dialogue' in Scotland should be

³⁴ <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/People/Equality/18934>

included,³⁵ as should the results of intercultural dialogue with non-indigenous cultures on Scottish practices.

- There should be no discrimination on the grounds of levels of participation in or influence of different ICH examples on the wider community, just as there should be no discrimination in terms of 'safeguarding' (see the UNESCO definition in Section 1.3.1 and Section 5). Consideration should be given to tensions between the fragility of ICH most in need of safeguarding and the negative transformational potential of safeguarding itself.
- The possible repercussions of 'safeguarding' should be considered (see Section 2.3.1 Case studies). Bearing in mind that the more fragile practices are likely to be those most in need of safeguarding.

6.2 Data collection

6.2.1 Rejected methods and supplementary sources

A number of superficially attractive methods and sources were rejected as they failed to fulfil the UNESCO Convention guidelines on various grounds. These include the use of a questionnaire survey, and using subject-based searches, for example standard search engines such as Google or standard reference books. While deemed inefficient as 'primary' sources some of these were considered valuable as 'supplementary' ones (Scottish local newspapers; national or umbrella bodies; existing archives).

6.2.2 Routes of access

Continuing ICH knowledge resides in the community, therefore the most efficient method of collecting 'living' data was found to be through routes of access to such practitioners. The preferred route was identified as being via Local Authorities. However, this was less effective for reaching ethnic minority communities, which are better approached via ethnic minority organisations. It is acknowledged that longer established migrant communities with a strong independent presence (for example, Italian and Polish) are more easily accessible, often via independent websites.

³⁵ Swiss response to d'Art question. See Appendix B.

Local Authorities

The following recommendations are made in respect of negotiating the Local Authority route:

- Local Authority ‘best contacts’ identified by the report authors should be re-approached. The efficient design and management of this primary element of a national project demand that roles, responsibilities and technical details (down to the form and format in which data should be requested and supplied) should be negotiated to achieve a transparent and mutually rewarding relationship between Local Authorities and the project.
- Information already held in Local Authority databases should be requested, following the results of negotiations described.
- ‘Deep’ data should be collected through ‘focus’ or discussion groups, ideally facilitated by Local Authorities, chaired and recorded by trained Local Authority or project staff, or volunteers.
- **Local Authorities as a source of supplementary data** ICH information not already catalogued and/or transcribed (film footage, tape or digital recordings) should be collected. However, as with exploiting sources such as national or university archives, the extent to which such material has been catalogued and transcribed places these sources in the category of ‘supplementary’ (and possibly, ‘historic’) rather than ‘primary’.

Ethnic minority organisations

- Ethnic minority support organisations – such as BEMIS and the Council of Ethnic Minorities Voluntary Sector Organisations – offer the most efficient ‘route of access’ to less accessible practitioners and groups and to other ethnic minority organisations whose databases are not directly accessible to the public.

6.3 Content management

6.3.1 Database, data entry and sustaining

The inventory is not in itself a dynamic mechanism for safeguarding knowledge of ICH practices which are, inter alia, defined by their changeability. A regularly maintained and updated inventory plays an important role in sustaining ICH in that it allows for monitoring and review of fragility. This will act as a prompt for early safeguarding intervention.

- A flexible, customised Wiki-style database such as MediaWiki is recommended, rather than a custom-built one, as the former will allow the specification of the database to grow organically with the project, mirroring the dynamic nature of ICH knowledge as well as the possibility that priorities may alter over time. This option can also run on a relatively cheap shared web hosting package (Section 4).
- The familiar and straightforward 'Wiki' style means that once the database is set up the process of data entry should not pose any significant technical obstacles.
- Those responsible for inputting data require to be fully cognisant with the nature of the project in terms of UNESCO domains, and the scope, diversity and inclusivity, as a high level of awareness of the types of information sought is vital to facilitating full and accurate data entry (see under 'Training needs analysis' below).
- 'Joined-up' practices of data collection and input are recommended. A close relationship between those entering the data and those collecting it is required. Processes for communicating data from researcher to inputter should be robust, ensuring that the data collected by researchers matches that which goes into the inventory.
- As a reflection of living and dynamic practices the inventory should be managed in a proactive fashion and be updated on a continuing basis. (See Appendix E below.)

6.4 Training needs analysis

6.4.1 Data collection

- If the collection of in-depth ICH data through holding focus groups of individuals with ICH knowledge falls to the project, rather than Local Authorities, the project team should employ and train field-workers to chair and collect data from these. This will result in ad hoc payments, equipment (recording), transport and subsistence costs.
- Whether Local Authorities or local volunteers assume responsibility for collecting in-depth data from focus groups (as above), both will require the same training.
- The widely recognised 'Wiki' style means that fairly basic training is likely to suffice for those inputting data. It is vital (as referred to earlier) that individuals inputting data should be fully cognisant with the nature of the project and of its definition of ICH in Scotland.

6.5 Cost

6.5.1 Technical and related costs

- These will be minimised by the Wiki nature of the inventory. Apart from initial costs in establishing the database, overall costs should not be excessive. Costs involved in maintenance will be limited to the need to ensure the continued functioning of the database, which, because of its uncomplicated nature, should not be excessive. Any desired changes of database function can be made in a cost-effective manner.
- Recording (and transcribing equipment, as required) for data collection from focus groups.

6.5.2 Employment, training (and related) costs

- Employment of project field-workers to chair and collect data from focus groups across the Local Authority areas.

or/and

- Training of Local Authority staff or local volunteers collecting in-depth data from focus groups (as above). Both will require the same training, the latter being much less of a burden in terms of costs
- The uncomplicated nature of the Wiki ensures that training requirements for data imputers should not be of a high cost
- Transport and subsistence costs

7 Conclusion

A nation that prioritises ICH demonstrates a high level of respect for, and commitment to, the communities and individuals whose sense of identity is, in part, shaped through these practices. It is, therefore, of benefit to Scotland to pursue an agenda that will allow it to showcase and preserve those elements of its diverse cultural inheritance which have hitherto been accorded a lower priority than has the preservation of material heritage.

Recognising and safeguarding ICH practices is gaining increasing priority internationally. Scotland now has the opportunity to become a leader in the field in a way that can only be advantageous to its people. 'Embracing the intangible' can be achieved in a manner that is cost-effective and that enables the people of Scotland to be stakeholders in that important process.

Although we have identified a generic process, the next steps are to be taken by the key stakeholders. The Scottish Government, in particular, has the opportunity, as in the case of Canada, to move the ICH process forward through active championing of implementation coupled with delegation of responsibility and funding. The process of recognising and safeguarding ICH will need the participation of Local Authorities, singly and in concert with COSLA, and key cultural agencies such as Museums Galleries Scotland and the Scottish Arts Council.

Intangible cultural heritage in Scotland belongs to the people and its future vitality relies on their continued involvement and support.

Museums Galleries Scotland

1 Papermill Wynd, McDonald Road, Edinburgh EH7 4QL

Tel (Switchboard) 0131 550 4100

Fax 0131 550 4139

Email inform@museumsgalleriesscotland.org.uk

Website www.museumsgalleriesscotland.org.uk

Museums Galleries Scotland is a company limited by guarantee registered in Scotland (No. 74264) and a charity registered in Scotland (No. SC015593)

Appendix A The 'D'Art' question

Question posed through IFACCA (International Federation of Arts Councils and Culture Agencies) via Christopher Madden to its members on the interpretation of the ICH Definition and the way in which it is currently being applied and operationalised across the globe:

Dear colleagues

IFACCA's members from Scotland are seeking your help in identifying resources for the development of an inventory on intangible cultural heritage. This email is being sent (in Bcc) to CEOs and selected researchers of IFACCA member organisations. We would be very grateful if you could answer the questions below, or forward this email to someone who would be able to help.

Context

The Scottish Arts Council and the Museums Galleries Scotland have commissioned Napier Universitybu to undertake a preliminary study of the issues, both theoretical and practical, in making an inventory of intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in Scotland in conformity with the UNESCO Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage. The Convention, which is available in 26 languages, is online at <http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?pg=00006>.

The researcher's remit is to:

- scope ICH activities in Scotland using a reporting framework that relates to the domain definitions set out in Article 2.2 of the 2003 UNESCO Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage;
- map the support mechanisms that are in place to safeguard ICH (Article 2.3) including both formal and informal mechanisms; and
- review, evaluate and make recommendations on best practice in enhancing the participation of communities, groups and, where appropriate, individuals in the management of ICH and on the roles of key stakeholders, including public, private and third sector bodies.

The full research brief can be found online at
http://www.scottishmuseums.org.uk/pdfs/ICH_brief.pdf

The Convention, which entered into force on 20 April 2006, has been ratified by a wide range of countries. Members of the IFACCA network may therefore already have undertaken work on definitions and inventories relating to the Convention. We seek your help in uncovering existing work by answering the questions below.

Questions

1. Have you undertaken or commissioned any research or reports that address UNESCO's Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage? (a Yes or No will suffice)
2. If yes, please provide copies, links, or full references for the reports.
3. We are interested in your opinion on the following specific issue: should an inventory of a given region take into account those ICH practices, such as story-telling, that are solely in languages indigenous to that region, or should the inventory also be concerned with ICH practices in languages spoken by migrant communities within that region, languages that originate elsewhere, and traditions that may already be safeguarded by mechanisms elsewhere?
4. Could you provide any other information that you know of that might be helpful to our project team in developing a practical definition of ICH?

Appendix B Summary of IFACCA members' responses to the 'D'Art' question

Canada

'... Canada has not ratified this Convention, not because it does not support the safeguarding and preservation of intangible cultural heritage, but because as a federal state some of the issues that the Convention addresses fall within the purview of the provinces. To ratify the Convention, therefore, would require the approval of, and possible negotiation with, the 10 provinces and three territories in Canada. There are nonetheless active organizations such as Folklore Canada International (<http://www.folklore-canada.org/>) and individuals...who are keeping the prospect of signing this Convention very much alive in Canada.'

'I am not aware of any research reports have been undertaken by the Government of Canada or its agencies that address the Convention.'

'The Director-General of UNESCO has encouraged Member States to view the *Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage* (1972), the *Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage* (2003) and the *Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* (2005) as integral parts of a holistic approach to cultural preservation. As both the Intangible Heritage Convention and the *Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* both recognize language as part of intangible heritage and essential to cultural diversity, "non-indigenous" languages should not be excluded from the inventory. It should also be recognized that intangible cultural heritage can, and often does, result from a blending of cultures over time and it can therefore difficult to define a "pure" indigenous culture.'

'... the Convention views Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) as "living heritage" ...

Intangible Cultural Heritage is defined as "the practices, representations, expressions, as well as the knowledge and skills, that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage", and...

- is transmitted from generation to generation;
- is constantly recreated by communities and groups, in response to their environment, their interaction with nature, and their history;
- provides communities and groups with a sense of identity and continuity;
- promotes respect for cultural diversity and human creativity;
- is compatible with international human rights instruments;
- complies with the requirements of mutual respect among communities, and of sustainable development.

These elements, and this definition, are the result of extensive consultation with Member States and ICH experts around the world...'

Croatia

http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?cp=HR&topic=nat_measure

‘As far as legislation is concerned, at the time of drawing up the new Law on the Protection and Preservation on Cultural property, as early as 1999 Croatia explicitly included, along with mobile and immobile cultural property, forms and phenomena of human spiritual creativity in the past.’

‘One of the Articles of the Law defines in detail what is considered intangible heritage:

Intangible cultural property may be a variety of forms and phenomena of spiritual creativity that are transferred from one generation to another or through other methods, and which in particular relates to:

- *languages, dialects, idioms and toponyms, as well as all types of oral literature*
- *folklore creativity in the areas of music, dance, traditions, games, ceremonies, customs as well as other traditional folk values*
- *traditional skills and crafts.*’

‘According to the Law on the Protection and Preservation on Cultural Property, cultural properties are registered in the Register of the Cultural property of the Republic of Croatia. The Register is the public book under the authority of the Ministry of Culture.

As far as intangible cultural property is concerned, Croatia has registered 9 phenomena or forms of the intangible cultural heritage on the List of cultural property under the preventive protection, and 54 phenomena or forms of the intangible cultural heritage on the List of registered cultural property.

There are more than 200 phenomena of the intangible heritage in the procedure of inscribing on the List of registered cultural property that includes languages etc.

7 of 54 registered phenomena of the intangible cultural heritage, are the languages, dialects and toponyms.

Languages of Croatian minorities outside of the territory of Croatia are not listed on the National Register of the Cultural property.’

Cyprus

‘...we are confronting the same issues as you...We are still at the preparatory stages’

‘In my opinion ICH practices to cover also languages spoken by migrant communities, since with the passage of the time they become part of the ICH of the host place and develop differently from ICH practices still existing in their country of origin. I believe also that once a population is accepted and leave legally in one place, then its culture might constitute part the hosts heritage.’

‘In my opinion, any creation or expression of art which can not be kept in a museum as an object is intangible culture heritage. I consider that dances, music, oral languages, ceremonies, habitudes, myths, traditions, savoir-faire and techniques of handcrafts are to be examined as part of the ICH.’

England

Arts Council England:

'...this is slightly outside Arts Council England's remit and expertise'

English Heritage:

'The UK looked at the convention and concluded that a) it would be very difficult to monitor and enforce and b) it duplicated efforts that the UK was already undertaking...'

Estonia

'Since Estonia approved the 2003 UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (hereinafter referred to as the Convention) in 2006 several meetings between researchers, representatives of communities and other counterparties have taken place in order to exchange experience and find the best ways for safeguarding the ICH. The initiator of these discussions has been the Ministry of Culture. In 2007 a pilot project was launched: cultural activists on the Hiiumaa island tried to find effective ways of implementing the Convention and making inventories. The preliminary outcome of this process provides a part of the basis for the Estonian inventory of ICH, which at the moment is in the process of establishing.

An international seminar on the Principles and Experiences of Drawing Up ICH Inventories in Europe was held in Tallinn 14.-15.05.2007, with experts from different regions of Europe participating

(http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/index.php?meeting_id=00076#meet_00076).

You will find the Estonian comments on the participation of communities or their representatives, practitioners, experts, centres of expertise and research institutes in the implementation of the Convention online:

http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/en/2EXTCOM/Estonia_comments-Decision_2COM_8.pdf

'We understand that the question, "Should an inventory of a given region take into account the ICH practices of migrant communities?", is a very delicate issue. Article 2, paragraph 1, of the Convention defines the ICH as follows: "the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artefacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage". Article 11 of the Convention says that each State Party shall "take the necessary measures to ensure the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage present in its territory". It means that ICH inventories can and should also include the ICH of migrant communities living in a given region at least for two generations: a) migrant communities have the right to draw up their ICH; b) State Parties to the Convention should take necessary measures to ensure the safeguarding of the ICH, including the ICH of migrant communities, present in their territory.'

Switzerland

'...Thank you for your message concerning the development of an inventory on intangible heritage. As Switzerland is about to ratify the UNESCO Convention on Intangible Cultural Heritage, we will soon have to deal with similar questions. I thank you in advance for making available to us a summary of the responses you will get from your survey.

(Re. question on the inclusion of ICH practices that are in languages spoken by migrant communities but which originate elsewhere, and of traditions that may already be safeguarded by mechanisms elsewhere)

'The Convention does not give any clear-cut answer to this question. On the one hand, a State Party is to "take the necessary measures to ensure the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage present in its territory" - which includes of course ICH practices of migrant communities; on the other hand the fact that migrant communities are closely linked to and interacting with their culture of origin raises practical difficulties for establishing measures of safeguarding.

> Only to take into account indigenous practices would in our view contradict the spirit of the Convention and overlook the global dimension of cultural creativity. In addition it would mean to miss an important opportunity for intercultural dialogue. Therefore, the option of promoting migrant cultures in cooperation with the country of origin should be examined. This could be done in the context of bilateral development cooperation.

> See also Kasfir, Sidney Littlefield / Yai, Olabiyi Babalola Joseph: „Current debate: authenticity and diaspora", in: Museum international 56.1-2 (2000), pp. 190-197 (<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0013/001358/135852s.pdf#135875>)'

(Other information that might be helpful in developing a practical definition of ICH)

'- material prepared for the parliamentary debate in Switzerland:

<http://www.admin.ch/ch/d/ff/2007/7251.pdf> (German),

<http://www.admin.ch/ch/f/ff/2007/6837.pdf> (French)

- material prepared by the German National Commission for UNESCO:

<http://www.unesco.de/fileadmin/medien/Dokumente/unesco-heute/unesco-heute-1-07.pdf>, <http://www.unesco.de/ike-memorandum.html?&L=0>

- upcoming conference of the Swiss Academy of Humanities and Social Sciences on "ICH: a new concept and its signification for the scientific discourse" (Zurich, 30 May 2008); details to be published under: <http://www.sagw.ch/sprachenundkulturen/index.asp>'

UNESCO Institute for Statistics

'I know that the Intangible Heritage section at UNESCO deliberately left the scope of intangible heritage 'vague' arguing that it is for each country or 'culture' to define its scope. The original discussions asked that they should include the specific themes of oral traditions and expressions, performing arts, social practices/rituals/festivals, knowledge, craftsmanship but said this was a 'non-exclusive list'. Several countries have indeed suggested to me that they are unclear how to define the scope of their inventories on intangible heritage, in particular Mexico (see CONACULTA web site http://www.conaculta.gob.mx/index_content.html with inventories of Mexican infrastructure). Latin American countries have a particular interest in intangible heritage and its measurement.'

'We have just completed a revision of the 1986 UNESCO Framework for Cultural Statistics (the initial study was undertaken by BOP, Andy Pratt, and Calvin Taylor), and have placed intangible heritage/traditional knowledge as a transverse theme running across all the usual dimensions of culture (Arts, Books, Audiovisual...) The framework will shortly be available on our website www.uis.unesco.org It is currently under formal consultation with Ministries of Culture, National Statistics Offices, and international professional groups like IFACCA. I can also send a copy if useful. The emphasis is to suggest that every creative or cultural industry is supported by informal cultural traditions which need to be measured as they are the foundation on which the sector/activity is based.'

'UIS definitely thinks that story telling is important and we have argued that this should be recognised as a particular occupation in ILO's International Standard Classification of Occupations. I know something of the issues surrounding migrant communities in Scotland...My personal view here would be that the inventory should contain anything of cultural significance WITHIN/TO Scotland from whatever source. Obviously much of this would be very policy sensitive and its difficult again to draw a boundary. I have had a similar discussion with Victoria Dickenson, the head of the McCord Museum here in Montreal, who sees her museum as having a role in any migrant community in the city *as long as the result has had an impact on Montreal/Quebec/Canada* ie not Lebanese textiles made in Montreal, but if for example Lebanese textiles in Montreal portrayed life in Canada, or developed a distinct Lebano/Quebecois style then she would be interested. This suggests to me that Norse and Irish influences in Scotland are certainly important, as well as more recent migrant communities which may have influenced contemporary Scottish culture - for example in music or drama??'

'...The definition of intangible heritage and its measurement at least at the international level is very important to UIS.'

Appendix C Local Authority enquiry on existing data

Enquiry sent via Jason McDonald of COSLA

Inventory of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Scotland (after 2003 UNESCO Convention)

We are carrying out a scoping and mapping exercise on behalf of Museums Galleries Scotland with a view to the compilation of an Inventory of Intangible Cultural Heritage. While the UK has not signed up to this, the Scottish Government is supportive and already we seem to be leading the world in terms of actually putting this into practice.

As knowledge about intangible cultural practices (customs, language, skills, music, local Galas/festivals etc) can only come from 'practitioners', several information 'routes' have been tested and the most effective means of access to practitioners at local level is through the Councils.

In order to minimize the effort required from potential partners and contributors we'd like to get a picture of the breadth and depth of information Councils already hold on ICH activities and their support mechanisms, assuming that for events or organizations to receive Council support (financial, promotional or advisory) some information must have been submitted?

This will vary Council to Council, but it would help to get a picture of the degree of diversity and complexity as this will have time and cost implications for the Inventory's compilation and maintenance. Similarly, supplying information to the project will be much easier for the Councils if we are able to make recommendations that it be requested in formats compatible with those they already employ. I would be very grateful, therefore, if someone could provide me with an idea of the situation in your area on the following lines:-

What type of information do you request from local ICH practitioners or organizations receiving your support e.g. details of the practice/event, numbers of people involved or attending, economic impact, other sources of 'support' (informal support, local school involvement, other income etc)?

In what form and formats do you request and hold such data currently?

Is the information held by different departments depending on the type of ICH e.g. music under 'Culture'; Gala days/Common Ridings etc under 'Community', events related to ethnic groups under 'Social' etc?

Is there an individual you would like to suggest as the Council's 'best contact' for the eventual project team? NB. If you would like the Council to have input at this 'recommendations' stage, please ask your contact to get in touch with me as soon as possible.

Appendix D Sample of Local Authority responses

Aberdeen

We presently collect the following data on databases that include

- Art development outreach participants
- voluntary group activity, nos and type of programmes Festivals ,type, attendance, programme, outreach nos Arts and heritage organisations, programmes, nos, evaluation of work , business plans and outcomes.
- We have access to informal practitioners networks in music, dance and visual arts.
- We support artist collectives that have a " flexible membership"
- We have databases of practitioners who work with a range of hard to reach groups.
- Focus groups/user groups/ friends of museums, issues of interest.
- We would collect videos, exhibitions and art work made by citizens as part of a consultation work.
- We would also use the community planning network as a means of recording cultural issue based ideas.

Glasgow

It's hard to under-estimate the degree to which contemporary music has influenced Glasgow's self identity in the last 2 decades, adding to longer-established phenomena like sport.

1. ... the relatively large collections of oral history recordings which we hold, and how these have come to us. This is a very diverse collection, representing perhaps 1000 interviews with people of all ages. It includes some very specific content relating to intangible heritage.
2. ... the various festivals and events in the city which we support and are involved in, such as Aye Right, in which there is a strong implicit heritage theme ... the festival has implicitly explored the the links between memory, story-telling and literature.
3. ... the Open Museum and the reminiscence kits which we take out to residential care homes and the reminiscence sessions that they run. ... panels that we constituted for KG and Riverside to test our assumptions and gather feedback.
4. ... the relative fragmentation with respect to managing and recording aspects of intangible cultural heritage ... agreed that an assessment would be money well spent.
5. ... digital cultural creativity and the relative absence of mechanisms to secure this generation's virtual interactions (computer games and text messaging for example).
6. music has shaped Glasgow's self identity in the last two decades, adding to longer-established phenomena such as sport.

Argyll and Bute

What type of information do you request from local ICH practitioners or organizations receiving your support e.g. details of the practice/event, numbers of people involved or attending, economic impact, other sources of 'support' (informal support, local school involvement, other income etc)?

Yes to outlined examples

In what form and formats do you request and hold such data currently?

Mainly paper based forms although information may be available in Microsoft word format and there may be summary reports on particular streams of funding.

Is the information held by different departments depending on the type of ICH e.g. music under 'Culture'; Gala days/Common Ridings etc under 'Community', events related to ethnic groups under 'Social' etc

Certainly information could be held by different sections but would mainly pertain to Community Services department.

Is there an individual you would like to suggest as the Council's 'best contact' for the eventual project team?

Yes, the Culture and Libraries Manager.

Appendix E Case study: Ba' games

The following case study represents a typical text for incorporation into a wiki. It is followed by a mock-up of a possible wiki page on-screen. (Note: the references to the Local Authorities would be live hyperlinks.)

Ba' games

Ball games have a long history in both Scotland and elsewhere in the UK, being traditionally played around Christmas and the New Year. There are records from Greek and Roman times of ball games being played, and mass football seems to have been played in Roman-occupied Britain. Now, however, it only survives in Scotland in a few towns.

Ba is basically mob football. Where it has survived, the game has evolved to have fixed goals and more hand than foot play.³⁶ The two sides are called the uppies or the downies depending on which part of town they were born in, or otherwise owe allegiance too. The aim of the game, in essence, is for the two parts of a town to try to get a ball to their respective side. The ball must be manhandled and is very often a moving scrum. The game moves through the town, and can go up alleyways, into yards and up streets. Shops and houses board up their windows to prevent damage. There are only about 15 ba' games left in the UK.³⁷

Jedburgh Ba' Game Today the game is played at Candlemas and Easter E'en by two opposing teams. The ancient ball game known as 'Jethart hand-ba', popular throughout medieval Scotland, supposedly derives from the Jedburgh men playing with the heads of English soldiers. The traditional ball game, which has been played in the Border town for 250 years, pits the Uppies (residents of the higher part of Jedburgh) against the Doonies (residents from the bottom half of the town).

Format and participation The game uses a leather ball stuffed with straw and decorated with ribbons. The ball is thrown, rugby-style, into a group of men who then proceed to move with it through the streets. It can move up alleyways, into yards and up street and can be concealed or thrown for someone to catch and run with. The aim of the game, which has had its current form since the 1700s, is to 'hail' the ball to the respective side of the town. The boys play for a couple of hours before the men take over and it is usual for 'hundreds' to participate.³⁸

³⁶ <http://www.bagame.com/bahistory.html>

³⁷ http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/scotland/south_of_scotland/7246475.stm

³⁸ <http://www.jedburgh-online.org.uk/traditions.asp>

Kirkwall Ba' Game Every Christmas and New Year's Day the 'Ba' is contested in the streets of Kirkwall. The precise origins are unclear, although the game is documented back for 300 years.³⁹ The men and boys of Kirkwall, as in Jedburgh, are designated either 'Uppies' or 'Doonies', or 'Up the Gates' and 'Doon the Gates'.

Format and participation Two games are played on each of those days: one for the boys starts at 10.30 and one for the men starts at 13.00. Based on recent years, an average men's Ba' game could have up to 200 participants and last about five hours, although it could last up to eight hours, or more.⁴⁰

Fragility In broad terms, ba' games appear to be well-documented, with particular towns having community websites that makes considerable reference to their local game. In addition, a book on the history of the ba' game in the British Isles was commissioned by English Heritage.⁴¹ It can be said both that general knowledge of the game and its history is robust and that existing games are well supported locally.

However, overall, the existence of mechanisms to enable continuing transmission of knowledge of this practice (knowledge which may be shifting in the sense that games can evolve), is more variable. While Kirkwall and Jedburgh, for instance, have (relatively) well-known games, whose popularity is in itself likely to offer a degree of protection and continuity, others towns' games, even if still popular locally, have a lower profile and are less well-documented. With this latter group, knowledge will potentially be lost if the games are discontinued, as historically most others have been. Effort needs to be made to strengthen knowledge of this practice.

³⁹ <http://www.orkneyjar.com/tradition/bagame/>

⁴⁰ Ibid

⁴¹ http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/scotland/south_of_scotland/7246475.stm

Appendix F Sample Wiki Screen

Ba' Games	<p>Ball games have a long history in both Scotland and elsewhere in the UK, being traditionally played around Christmas and the New Year. Now, however, Ba' Games only survive in Scotland in a few towns.</p>		Ba' Games
<p>'Ba' is basically mob football. Where it has survived the game has evolved to have fixed goals and more hand than foot play. The two sides are called the 'Uppies' or the 'Doonies' depending on in which part of town they were born, or otherwise owe allegiance too. The aim of the game, in essence, is for the two parts of a town have to get a ball to their respective side. The ball must be manhandled, and is very often a moving scrum. The game moves through the town, and can go up alleyways, into yards and up streets. Shops and houses board up their windows to prevent damage. There are only about 15 ba' games left in the UK.</p>	Nature: games		Seasonal: Christmas / New Year
<p>Jedburgh Ba' Game Today the game is played at Candlemas and Easter E'en by two opposing teams. The ancient ball game known as 'Jethart Hand-ba', popular throughout medieval Scotland, supposedly derives from the Jedburgh men playing with the heads of English soldiers. The traditional ball game, which has been played in the Border town for 250 years, pits the Uppies (residents of the higher part of Jedburgh) against the Doonies (residents from the bottom half of the town). The game uses a leather ball stuffed with straw and decorated with ribbons. The ball is thrown, rugby-style, into a group of men who then proceed to move with it through the streets. It can move up alleyways, into yards and up street and can be concealed or thrown for someone to catch and run with. The aim of the game, which has had its current form since the 1700s, is to "hail" the ball to the respective side of the town. The boys play for a couple of hours before the men take over and it is usual for 'hundreds' to participate.</p>	Place: Orkney / Borders		Participants: young men / men
	Support: na		Fragility: strong in those communities where it has survived
	Further details: Borders Council, Orkney Islands Council		