# Unpeeling the Onion: Deconstructing the effectiveness of two LTA approaches to reflective learning

Margaret Conlon. Lecturer, Teaching Fellow, Edinburgh Napier University. Brian Gould. Lecturer, Edinburgh Napier University

## Abstract

Selecting the most effective methods of integrating reflective practice into undergraduate nursing programmes remains a challenge for educators. This paper explores two pedagogical approaches of reflective learning in an undergraduate mental health nursing programme, with particular focus on developing the core attributes of self-awareness, empathy and compassion. The discussion is explored within the context of nursing in Scotland, which is undergoing transformative change including the move to all degree routes to nurse registration. Seismic changes such as these are occurring at a time when the nursing profession generally, and nurses individually, face regular criticism for poor care and lack of compassion. This discussion paper will focus on the necessity of reflective pedagogy in undergraduate nursing programmes in which the expectation is to create both critically aware and insightful individuals who are able to function in a health care culture that is predominately resource poor, time orientated and outcome led. Although focused on mental health nursing, the paper also comments on the transferability of the teaching and learning approach to other professions in which human engagement is the key focus. The competing tensions of reflective practice and economically driven health care organisations, alongside the significant professional challenges of emotional competency involved in nursing are discussed. This provides a background to the exploration of the examples of reflective pedagogy that may also be applied to other health and social care professions

Key words: Reflection, pedagogy, undergraduate students, mental health.

## Introduction

Humanistic principles underpin all of nursing practice and dominate the new standards for nurse education (NMC, 2010). Nurses are compelled to be ‘person-centred’, ‘compassionate’, to work in ‘partnership’, and to involve others in their decision making. At the same time, nursing is criticised for its failure to respond to basic requirements and for its physical and emotional distancing from patients (Care Quality Commission, 2011). It is called upon to demonstrate greater kindness, to recognise individual difference and to re-organise its services to better respond to human need (Patterson, 2012).  Further expectations are set by the requirement to base practice on the best available evidence and to ensure compliance with a multitude of local and national policies and guidelines. Lipscomp and Ishmael (2009) describe how the culture of health care in the UK has become so driven by macro – level requirements that the expectation of humanistic educational approaches have become unrealistic. Professional organisations have responded by calling for the establishment of minimum staffing levels as a protector of quality care (RCP, 1999: RCN, 2011) while increasingly including reflective practice activities as part of professional training to help support the primacy of relationships within health care.

In Scotland, mental health nursing has been experiencing a level of transformation as the ethos of service user led, recovery focused and values based practice dominates all policy and strategy initiatives. The Mental Health (Care and Treatment) Act (Scotland) 2003 was hailed as the most progressive piece of mental health legislation seen in the UK with principles such as service user involvement and client led care being at the centre of all care delivery. This was followed by the launch of three frameworks including the National Framework for Pre-registration Mental Health Nursing (2010) and a Capability Framework for Acute Mental Health nursing (2009) which called on nurses to engage in principles of recovery focused and values based care (Trueland, 2008). Recent work has begun to explore methods to support the principles in practice (NHS Education for Scotland, 2011), while concerns remain about making the most of the opportunities available in undergraduate programmes to develop these principles. Most recently the UK wide Willis Report (2012) on nurse education concluded that whilst nurse educators had little to deride themselves over in terms of the education process, it did recommend the need for a higher level of evaluation of undergraduate programmes and greater rigor in the evaluation of teaching and learning programmes. In terms of reflective learning, there is material to draw on, but how specific is it to the support the demands of mental health nursing require further exploration.

## Teaching and assessing reflection in nursing: a brief review of the literature.

Reflective practice aims to foster a range of skills and attributes that are aligned with humanistic values that nursing espouses (NMC, 2008). Norrie et al (2012) in an exploration of how professions differ in their approaches to the teaching of reflection identifies that much of the nursing literature on reflection is concerned with examining and understanding the teaching approaches used to develop students as reflective practitioners. Fowler (2008) highlights the importance of the link between the methods used to develop reflection and the meaningfulness of the reflection itself. The creation of a learning approach to reflection needs to consider how best to motivate students to achieve the best possible outcome. Russell (2005) emphasises the importance of learning the benefits of reflection through experience rather than didactic expositions on its benefits. He goes on to outline how creating a reflective dialogue with students can help achieve this. Cook and Matarasso (2005) outline a range of positive benefits when integrating reflective practice into a Problem Based Learning module where therapeutic engagement skills are developed. The challenges posed to the students levels of self-awareness are a key part of the learning gained from this approach. Kennedy (2009) calls for a judicious use of reflection and an avoidance of too casual an approach in its implementation.  Further, he advocates forms of collaborative reflection where learning can be generated through interacting with others. Pryce (2002) provides an interesting insight into the paradox of reflective practice where the focus on individuals experience and practice limits the outcomes of reflection. Pryce argues for a greater emphasis on the practitioner as ‘social actor’ operating within a particular social context, which needs to be understood before real change can be initiated. O’Donavan (2006) acknowledge the importance of context and the support that needs to exist for reflection to take place.

Reflective practice aims to be transformative and emancipatory through a critique of established thinking and behavioural patterns (Pryce, 2002). Institutional forms of reflection however, have now come to represent a confessional and surveillance type discourse, less concerned with the liberating ideal of reflection and more with ensuring conformity with established norms (Nelson 2012). Student need to confirm their career choice early in their programme (Eraut, 2004) and the requirement to learn and integrate professional behaviours (Fowler, 2007) can limit engagement in the more radical ideals of reflective practice. The design of teaching approaches needs to take cognisance of student’s position within the professional socialization process. The approaches to reflection described here derive their ethos from a programme philosophy that reflects the direction set by national policy in Scotland. Rights, Relationships and Recovery (2006) set out a new direction for mental health nursing where the ability to develop positive relationships is seen as the starting point for all interventions with service users and carers. Reflective activities are designed to help students know themselves better and by doing so to increase their skills and confidence to work more effectively with clients. A willingness to commit to the uncertain nature of this type of work is a requirement from teaching staff. The relationship basis of mental health nursing reflected within this policy supports a liberal person – centred approach towards reflective practice. This avoids the restrictive and overly conservative agenda that has recently affected the teaching of reflective practice.

Assessment of reflection remains a contentious area. Criticism centres on the impact of complying with standard marking criteria on the student’s reflection, questions about how personal thought and feelings can be subjected to appraisal and doubts about the validity of subjective experience in the assessment of knowledge and understanding (Plack et al, 2005). Furthermore, assessment can be seen as a barrier to personal growth and development that nursing programmes often espouse (Hargreaves, 2004). Coward (2011) argues that the use of reflective models as part of an assessment process simply does not work. The requirement to comply with marking criteria dilutes the student’s often complicated experiences of practice where personal shortcomings, knowledge gaps and uncertainty are typical of real world engagement and central to meaningful reflection, but are removed from reflective accounts for fear of being judged as indications of professional inadequacy. The arguments in favour of assessment centre on two areas. One is the obvious concern with establishing if a student has or has not developed the skills of reflecting. If we do not assess how can we tell? (Wong et al, 2005) Equally, how can a student be helped to develop or deepen skills in reflection without establishing their current competence. Secondly, as reflective ability has become a requirement of professional accreditation evidence of proficiency needs to be demonstrated. If reflection is important enough to be included in a programme then it should be important enough to be assessed.

The teaching of reflective skills however, remains difficult with variations in how reflection is organised and integrated, different understanding and approaches by teaching staff and difficulty engaging students in the process. Fleming (2007) states that at the core of reflective learning, is the integration of both the professional and personal self. The seminal work of Carper’s four ways of knowing, described by Johns (1995) demonstrates the importance of reflective practitioners being able to work through and across the four levels of knowing (aesthetic, ethical, professional and personal).  This requires two conditions: a high level of insight and a safe and secure environment in which to explore and process experiences. Finally, Higgins (2011) reminds us of the centrality of practice to reflection, the need to ponder what has happened, to understand its meaning and consider where this new learning takes us.

The two-exemplar teaching approaches described in this paper, aim to foster the first condition through the provision of the second. Example One explores reflection learning in student groups, whilst Example Two, explores the effectiveness of reflective learning through a two stepped approach of taking a video recording of a role play to inform a piece of reflective writing.Formal evaluation of reflective groups (Example One) occurs at programme completion while informal monitoring of the each groups effectiveness is on-going. Evaluation involves both a written element and a structured conversation with combined groups to establish those components that assist or hamper group functioning. In Example Two, the role play contributes to the module summative assessment that allows judgements to be made on both the students reflective ability and the depth of understanding enabled by the approach

## Example One: Facilitated Peer Group Reflection

Reflective groups are established within the undergraduate programme and take place six times during each of the three years of the programme. Students meet only during practice placements but away from the clinical area. Simply having time set aside to talk with, and get to know colleagues is an identified benefit of group work (Graham 2000, Oloffson 2005, Platzer, 2000). Students are required to present an account of a practice experience and its significance to them. The group is then facilitated to engage with the identified issues. The groups have a number of key characteristics. While they are embedded within mentor-assessed practice modules, they are not an assessed component. The cohort has a half-day introduction to reflection before placements start. Students are made aware of reflective models and are encouraged to adhere to a structured approach in year one. However, there is not a rigid adherence to a reflective model. Coward (2011) warns of the ‘interrogating’ nature of nursing models and how their use can lead to a mechanistic and de-motivating understanding of reflection. Dyer and Taylor (2012) have also highlighted how the teaching of models of reflection promotes the creation of ‘technicians’ and a belief in students that they must conform with universal rules of good practice achieved through adherence with fixed models of practice.

The sharing of noteworthy personal experiences of practice within a largely self-regulated group (students develop and monitor their own ground rules) is often sufficient to allow an explorative discussion of professionally significant issues. The strong emotions experienced during practice find an outlet in reflective groups and can help reduce feelings of isolation while confirming understanding of practice. (Stoddart 1996, Gould & Masters 2004, Manning et al, 2009). Furthermore, an emphasis on the here and now allows the group to respond to current challenges arising from practice. The groups gain their legitimacy by remaining responsive to context and an evolving heath care culture. Finally, groups are facilitated by a lecturer who also acts as the students personal development tutor (PDT) for the duration of their programme. The reliability and trust aimed for are consistent with Carpers second condition and are fundamental to a model of group reflection that is person centred, tolerant and welcoming of uncertainty.

The positioning of reflective groups during clinical placements helps establish the link between practice and learning from practice through consideration of student experiences. The outlining of significant events engages group members while highlighting the complexity of contextualised relationships. Dewey (1933) described reflection as a desire to investigate circumstances that have triggered a moment of doubt. The greater the uncertainty and puzzlement created by events the more potential they have to deepen student learning. Brookfield (1990) explains how the recounting of personal experiences of practice allows the group to enter another’s frame of reference, and to engage with their understanding and interpretation of events. Small group work allows students to experience a collegiate approach to creating understanding, an important aspect of mental health nursing. Bulman and Shultz (2004) emphasis the social nature of learning and how well run groups can avoid the creation of ‘false certainty’. Simplistic explanations are challenged by engagement with others and students are compelled to consider alternative perspectives. Furthermore, an on-going self-assessment of professional understanding and competence is facilitated by students comparing their progress with fellow group members, and making adjustments in attitudes and behaviour. Talking and listening helps alter and adapt thinking and behaviour leading to growth and change, with this new capacity increasing personal efficacy (Manning, 2009).

Increases in self – awareness are achieved through acknowledgment of emotional and attitudinal responses to direct clinical contacts. Taylor (2006) describes how insights raise awareness and how this awareness can bring about changes. These changes can be small but openness to the experience of change is an important component of learning. The creation of personal knowledge, particularly insights gained into one’s own beliefs, values and behaviour is what differentiates reflection from others forms of mental activity (Bulman & Shultz, 2004). Self-knowledge is essential to effective relationships, more so in mental health nursing where the therapeutic relationship is central to the role. A clear sense of self is also an important professional attribute. White, Fook and Gardner (2006) outline how self-knowledge can empower people to see themselves as active social agents rather than powerless individuals. Self-knowledge can increase confidence in one's own abilities and judgements while helping people to self-manage through complicated and imperfect services. However, an honest self-awareness is difficult to achieve as deeply held beliefs and attitudes are often challenged, and strong feelings exposed. What can be surprising is the degree of openness and candour displayed by students. This is complex, variable and dependent on group cohesiveness, but can be attained if attention is given to Carpers requirement for safety and security within reflective activity. What successful groups seem to have in common is a tolerant and non-judgemental atmosphere but within a clear set of group boundaries, that includes a negotiated set of rules, a clear focus on the practice experiences of the participants and a willingness to challenge and question each other.

**Conclusion**

Reflective groups are subject to the same dynamics as all groups and attention to resistant behaviours by members is required from the facilitator. Difficulties in exposing professional shortcomings to peers are a shared phenomenon of both approaches. Students consistently provide positive evaluations of their group experiences emphasising the important of support, peer learning, and the opportunity to check that personal understanding fits with professional requirements. The shared process of negotiating the transition into the prescribed values, knowledge and behaviours of an evolving profession is an important catalyst to the group’s success. Harnessing this dynamic can be achieved by creating clear structure and welcoming difference

## Example Two: A staged approach to reflective learning

This example is taken from a core second year undergraduate mental health module that focus on building knowledge and understanding of therapeutic skills in mental health nursing.  The deconstruction of the assessment into three stages provides the opportunity to explore the effectiveness of the learning experience. The three stages are (i) students participating in simulated role-play that focuses on developing therapeutic relationships in a clinical context. This role-play is then video recorded (ii) and provides material for (iii), a written analysis of the experience incorporating a model of reflection into the account. This analysis is then submitted for assessment.

Writing is one of the most frequent learning mediums for reflective learning with reflective diaries and portfolios being top of the list of populist learner tasks. Moon (2010), among others, discusses the complexities of assessing reflective writing. These include the constraints of being able to express ‘self’ in academic format; the concern that attaching a mark will reduce the authenticity of the submission, (the student may sense that saying what he/she thinks he/she ought to be saying), as well as the difficulties for assessors in maintaining objectivity and consistency in the marking process. In addition, the skill of reflective writing is seen to be a developing one over time and experience, and can be taught with practice opportunities built into the curriculum (Russell, 2005).  In this assignment, attempts were made to address potential writing difficulties.  Students were asked to build their analysis around a reflective framework.  They were also freed from the obligation to reference work to maximise the opportunity to bring the ‘I’ to the front of the analysis. In addition the marking criteria were built around Moon’s (2004) scale of reflective writing.

Role-plays provide vignettes based on real life events that challenge students to develop their skills in managing complex interpersonal scenarios.  Used for some time in the education of medical students, role-play provides a form of experiential learning that enable students to capture ‘an essence and a representation of an experience (Spalding & Phillips, 2007). In the first three weeks of the module, student’s exposure to role-play and filming of role-play was gradually increased. The small group size and the familiarity of the facilitator served to provide a rather cosy ambience in which student’s confidence in revealing the personal self-grew and sharpened until a collective sense of the shared group objective – to each make a film – provided a place of unity. The presence of consistency and dependency within the group relationships became visible. Shattell M, Starr S., Thomas S. (2007) highlighted the need for personal attributes such as dependency and consistency in therapeutic relationships. It is attributes such as these that enhance trust among group members and provide the soft feathers to the quality of the human experience.

The use of video as a medium for teaching and learning reflective practice is well supported across a range of disciplines and for a variety of purposes (Raingruber 2003, Koole et al, 2013). However, the presence of the camera also initially produced a sharp resistance from the students.  Self-consciousness provided a justification for delay – the fear of the personal letting down the professional mask already at play, even at such an early stage in their nursing career. To some extent this was overcome through facilitator tactics of collaboration. Students were encouraged to handle and ‘play with’ the *object of horror* – the flipcam. Opportunities were available to ‘pair up’ or work in triads and use other rooms for ‘trial runs’ of the film. ‘Change occurs when individuals feel in control’ and this was the maxim used to overcome the initial resistance to filming.

Students were initially reluctant to participate in such an activity with cries of ‘it’s just acting – not like real practice at all’ and ‘it’s a false environment or ‘I would do much better in the real situation’. The latter protest provided the initial surface reason for many students choosing to take the part of the service user rather than the nurse. There was a clear preference to risk revealing personal vulnerabilities rather than risk revealing professional inadequacies – despite the early stage of their training.  The power of simulated learning has been described as enhancing the authenticity to the learning experience in which the simulated role becomes closely aligned to ‘self’. In some of the more powerful role-plays, the wounds of the healer became self-evident. In mental health nursing, as in many other health professions, this is a common phenomenon (Heron, 2001) and one that clearly became ‘visible’  during the more effective role plays when students indicated a ‘lightening moment’ of insight and/or understanding. The second stage of the assessment, making the film, aimed to support this insight to be more than simply transitory.

###  Constraints of the staged approach

Learning through the narrative form is increasingly popular and when the narrative belongs to self, the learning is even more significant. Moon (2012) refers to this as ‘personal storytelling’ and an opportunity to develop affective perspective in personal and professional development. The major constraining factor to such development is the presence of assessment, which may result in students feeling vulnerable and uncertain about the quality and value of their writing. As described above, efforts were made to minimise this, particularly by removing the usual obligation to reference the academic writing.  The results from the assignment have been higher than in previous modules and the feedback from the students about the reflective journey within the module, has been positive.

## Discussion

Both examples described are integrated within the same nursing programme in which, (and as with the national approach), person centred nursing is a core principle. The examples have demonstrated the wealth of learning opportunities that can be obtained if learning is continuous and built into the curriculum objectives. The inclusion of both individual and group reflection enhances the student’s capacity for reflection. Moon (2001) suggests that a range of learning approaches offers students a variety of processes of ‘relating, experimenting and exploring’ from different viewpoints and within a range of contexts.

Assessment of reflection based assignments remains a moot issue, but the details in example two demonstrate that if assessment is tailored to support and encourage the self-criticism without prejudice or malice, it can be important learning.

A whole programme approach to reflection increases the likelihood of students achieving insight into and confidence in reflective practice. Horton-Deutsch, McNelis and O’Haver Day (2012) describe the introduction of a reflection centred curriculum as one that adds depth to learning in both practice and theory components. Reflection supports students to integrate personal and professional qualities. However, beliefs about professional roles and responsibilities, emotional vulnerability and issues of group dynamics can restrict participation in reflective activities. Furthermore, students can struggle to see the relevance of reflection within a bureaucratic health care system that sometimes disengages practitioners while risking undermining the humanistic values central to good health care. Reflective practice, at its best, deals with the evolving professional self; it encourages the recognition of difference, welcomes uncertainty and in doing so places human dignity and experience at the core of health care. Nevertheless, precision about the long-term benefits of reflection remain unclear. What we can say is that reflective pedagogy, with a set of clear aims and philosophy, can help prepare students for those inevitable moments in mental health nursing in which the personal and professional collide.

The approaches to reflection described here are incorporated into an undergraduate course where socialization into a profession sits alongside the development of critical thinking. A programme approach to reflection should value the adoption of more than one method, particularly where professional competence in establishing effective and meaningful relationships is central to the work of that professional group. The adoption of reflective practice by any discipline requires a deep understanding and commitment that goes beyond rigid application of a method and relies instead in a belief in people’s innate desire to understand and learn.

## Conclusion

In a review of literature exploring the evidence for employing reflective writing as a teaching tool in undergraduate nursing programmes, Epp (2008) concludes that nurse educators are correct to pursue reflective learning but that a range of tools and strategies is required to facilitate growth and development.  Williams (2013) meantime, argues for the importance of ‘reflective spaces’ within professional education to help negotiate the potential dissonance between the personal and professional. The intention of reflective teaching is to deepen and expand understanding of the role of ‘self’ in building therapeutic relationships. Reflective learning can enhance the capacity, the confidence and the resilience of the individual to be emotional sensitive and responsive to the complex needs of vulnerable people, particularly if teaching strategies are tailored and varied to respond to a range of learning styles. The tension of who is to blame for poor care – the system or the individual continues to rankle. Nonetheless, student nurses who experience meaningful reflective learning are more likely to be culture carriers of positive, person centred and values free care that is so sought after. Whilst many negative media reports focus on alarming levels of dispassionate nurses, perhaps the headlights should instead be on the systemic and organisational components of the health care system that fail to nurture its most valuable of resources – the nurses themselves.

(Word count 4224 including references 5885)

Margaret Conlon is a lecturer in the undergraduate mental health nursing programme. Recent experience in the field of children and young people’s mental health led to developing an interest in widening student nurses experience in practice. Margaret’s interest in inter-professional working grew through leading a pilot for organising practice placements in a way that extends student learning beyond acute care placements.

m.conlon@napier.ac.uk

http://mhhehub.ning.com/profiles/blog/list

Brian Gould is a lecturer in mental health nursing with an interest in pedagogical approaches that engage students in developing a clear professional identity. Interests also include reflective practice, problem based learning, curriculum evaluation, mental health nurses responsibilities under mental health legislation and the devolvement of clinical leadership.

b.gould@napier.ac.uk

<http://mhhehub.ning.com/profiles/blog/list>

https://twitter.com/MHNFS

**Reference list**

Brookfield, S. (1990) Using Critical Incidents to Explore Learners Assumptions IN Mezirow, J. (2009) Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood: A guide to Transformative and Emancipatory Learning. California: Jossey-Bass

Bulman, C. & Schutz, S. (2004) Reflective practice in nursing. 3rd edition. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing

Care Quality Commission (2012) The State of Health Care and Adult Social Care in England. London: Care Quality Commission.

Cooke, M. & Matarasso, B. (2005) Promoting reflection in mental health nursing practice: A case illustration using problem-based-learning. International Journal of Mental Health Nursing. 14, 243-248

Coward, M. (2011) does the use of reflective models restrict critical thinking and therefore learning in nurse’s education? What have we done? Nurse Education Today. 31, 883-886

Dewey, J. (1933) How we Think. New York: Prometheus Books:

Dyer, M.A. & Taylor, S.M. (2012): Supporting professional identity in undergraduate Early Years students through reflective practice, Reflective Practice: International and Multidisciplinary Perspectives, 13(4), 551-563

Epp, S. (2008) The value of reflective journaling in undergraduate nursing education: a literature review. International Journal of Nursing Studies. 45,1379-1388.

Eraut, M. (2004) The emotional dimension of learning. Editorial. Learning in Health and Social Care, 3(1), 1-4

Fleming, P. (2007). Reflection – A neglected art in health promotion. Health Educational Research, 22(5), 658-664

Fowler, J. (2008) Experiential learning and its facilitation. Nurse EducationToday. 28, 427 – 433

Franks, V., Watts M., Fabricius J. (1994) Interpersonal learning in groups: an investigation. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 20,1162-1169.

Gould, B., & Masters, H. (2004) Learning to make sense: the use of critical incident analysis in facilitated reflective groups of mental health student nurses. Learning in Health and Social Care, 3(2), 53-63.

Graham, I. (2000) Reflective practice and its role in mental health nurses practice development - a year long study. Journal of Psychiatric & Mental Health Nursing. 7 (2), 109-17.

Heidair, F., & Galvin, K. (2003) Action learning groups: can they help students develop their knowledge and skills? Nurse Education Today, 3, 49-55.

Heron, J. (2001) Helping the Client: A creative practical guide (5th ed). London: Sage.

Higgins, D. (2011) Editorial.Why reflection? Recognising the link between learning and reflection. Reflective Practice. 12(5), 583-584

Horton-Deutsch, S., McNelis, A.M.; & O'Haver Day, P. (2012) Developing a reflection centered curriculum for graduate psychiatric nursing education Archives of Psychiatric Nursing. 26 (5), 341-9.

Johns, C. (1995) Framing learning through reflection within Carper’s fundamental ways of knowing in nursing. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 22(2), 226-234.

Kennedy, D. (2009) Recasting the role of reflection in the theatre of learning. Nurse Education Today. 29, 573-574

Koole, S.,Dorna**n,**T.,Aper, L., De Wever, B.,Scherpbier, A., Valcke, M.,Cohen-schotanus, J., Derese, A. (2012**) Using video-cases to assess** student reflection: development and validation of an instrument. BMC medical education. 12, pp.22

Lipscomp, M., & Ishmael, A. (2009) Humanistic educational theory and the socialization of pre-registration mental health nursing students. International Journal of Mental Health Nursing. 18,173-178.

Manning, A., Cronin P., Monaghan A., & Rawlings-Anderson, K. (2009) Supporting students in practice: an exploration of reflective groups as a means of support. Nurse Education in Practice*.* 9,176-183

 McGrath, D., & Higgins, A. (2006) Implementing and evaluating reflective practice group sessions. Nurse Education in Practice. 6(3),175-81.

Mental Welfare Commission Scotland (2005) The Mental Health (Care and Treatment) (Scotland) Act 2003

 Moon, J. (2010) Using Story in Higher Education and Professional Development. London and New York: Routledge Falmer.

Moon, J. (2004) A Handbook of Reflective and Experiential Learning. Theory and practice. London and New York: Routledge Falmer.

Moon, J. (2012). Critical Thinking: An Exploration of Theory and Practice. London: Routledge.

Moon, J. (2001). LTNS Generic Centre LTSN Generic Centre PDP Working Paper 4 Reflection in Higher Education Learning. Higher Education Academy. London.

NHS Education for Scotland. (2011). Keep Going: Progress toward implementation of the refreshed action plan for Rights, Relationships and Recovery, the review of mental health nursing in Scotland. Edinburgh: NHS Education for Scotland.

NHS Scotland (2009) A Capability Framework for Working in Acute Mental Health Care. The values, skills, and knowledge needed to deliver high quality care in a full range of acute settings. Edinburgh: NHS Education for Scotland.

Nelson, S. (2012) The lost path to emancipator practice: towards a history of reflective practice in nursing. Nursing Philosophy .13,202 – 213

NHS Scotland (2012) The National Framework for Pre-registration Mental Health Nursing Field Programmes in Scotland. Edinburgh: NHS Scotland

Norrie, C., Hammond, J.; D’Avray, L.; Collington, V., &; Fook, J. (2012) Doing it differently? A review of literature on teaching reflection practice across health and social care professions. Reflective Practice, 13 (4): 565-78.

Nursing and Midwifery Council (2008) The code: Standards of conduct, performance and ethics for nurses and midwives. London: NMC

Nursing and Midwifery Council (2010) Standards for Pre-registration Nurse Education. London: NMC.

O’Donovan, M. (2006) Reflecting during clinical placement – Discovering factors that influence pre-registration psychiatric nursing students. Nurse Education in Practice 6,134-140

Olofsson, B. (2005) Opening up: psychiatric nurses’ experiences of participating in reflection groups focusing on coercion. Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing. 12, 259-267.

 Patterson, C. (2012) A crisis in nursing: six operations, six stays in hospital and six first-hand experiences of the care that doesn’t care. Independent, 10: 04.

Plack, M.M, Driscoll, M., Blissett, S., McKenna, R, Plack TP.; (2005) A method for assessing reflective journal writing. Journal of Allied Health. 34 (4): 199-208.

Platzer, H., Blake, D., & Ashford, D. (2000) An evaluation of process and outcomes from learning through reflective practice groups on a post registration nursing course. Journal of Advanced Nursing. 31 (3): 689-95.

Pryce, A. (2002) Refracting experience: Reflection, postmodernity and transformations. NTResearch. 7(4),298-311

Raingruber B. (2003) Video-Cued Narrative Reflection: A Research Approach for Articulating Tacit, Relational, and Embodied Understanding. Qualitative Health Research. 13 (8) 1155-1169

Rights, Relationships and Recovery (2006) The Report of the National Review of Mental Health Nursing in Scotland. Edinburgh: NHS Scotland

Royal College of Psychiatrists (1999) Guidance on staffing of child and adolescent in-patient psychiatry units. London: RCP

Royal College of Nursing (2011) Guidance on safe staffing levels in the UK. London: RCN

Russell, T. (2005) Can reflective practice be taught? Reflective Practice, 6(2),199-204.

Scottish Executive (2003) Mental Health (Care and Treatment) (Scotland) Act 2003. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Shattell, M.M., Starr, S.S., Thomas, S.P. (2007) ‘Take my hand, help me out’: mental health service recipients’ experience of the therapeutic relationship. International Journal of Mental Health Nursing. 16(4),274-284.

Spalding, N.J., Phillips, T. (2007) Exploring the use of vignettes: from validity to trustworthiness. Qualitative Health Research. 17(7),954-62.

Stoddart, B., Cope, P., Inglis, B., McIntosh, C., & Hislop, S. (1996) Student reflective groups at a Scottish college of nursing. Nurse Education Today, 16,437-442.

Taylor, B.J. (2006) Reflective Practice for Healthcare Professionals. 3rd ed. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Trueland, J. (2008) Scotland leads in developing frameworks for mental health nursing practice. Mental health Practice. 11 (7).

White, S., Fook J, & Gardner, F. (2006) Critical Reflection in Health and Social Care Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Williams, A. (2013): Critical reflective practice: exploring a reflective group forum through the use of Bion’s theory of group processes, Reflective Practice: International and Multidisciplinary Perspectives. 14(1), 75-87

Wills Commission (2012). Quality with Compassion: the future of nursing education

# Response to Reviewers: Table of Changes

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Reviewer Comments #2 | Author response | Change or rebuttal |
|  | Inclusion of Research Methodology | The paper is intended a as a discussion paper that alludes to a small local evaluation of a pedagogical approach. The inclusion of detail relating to evaluation has been strengthened to reflect this.  | **Change**: The detail relating to evaluation process has been included  |
|  | Inclusion of material relating to transferability of learning approach to disciplines other than nursing  | This is an important feature of any teaching and learning approach but given the complexity of pedagogy ‘*across disciplines*’, depth and detail is beyond the scope of the paper. However, the authors recognise that that there are important connections and has been included in the discussion section.  | **Change**: content altered in abstract, main body and discussion section to reflect this area |
|  | Inclusion of the classification model for assessment based on Hatton and Smith’s (1995), also adapted by Moon (2004) | This is discussed by the authors and Moon (2004) is referred to but described as a ‘scale of reflective writing’ | **Rebuttal:** Classification model referred to by the second reviewer is included using a slightly different terminology. Use of Moon (2004) rather than Hatton and Smith is a more contemporary source |
|  | Include more detail around the evaluation process | Some content has been included but this has been strengthened in the introduction section | **Change**: This has been provided on page 4 and supports the existing material on page 6  |
|  | Consistency in referencing | Accepted | **Change:** All references have been reviewed and revised as required. |
|  | Further examples of different media such as audio film and comics | Use of video as a teaching and learning medium is referred to in Example 2. This has been strengthened by adding key sources to support the discussion | **Change:** Inclusion of literature relating to the use of film media in reflective learning. |